

Rust, straw man, & Jonas

The Urth list — 1 messages, 1 voices, 01 Jun 1999

<https://urth.darkrealm.vip/thread/urth/1654>

Exported from an unofficial mirror of a public mailing list. Copyright in each message remains with the person who wrote it. Email addresses are obscured as `user at host`, the form the original archive published. This file was rebuilt from parsed fields rather than retained headers, so it is faithful in content but not byte-exact.

Roy C. Lackey — 01 Jun 1999, 05:43

On Sat, 8 May 1999 18:35:44 +0200, Potto opined:

Congratulations to Nigel Price: very interesting and even graceful input on the religious issue. A welcome change from this increasingly rusty topic of the iron men; shouldn't we move on to other threads, like whether Severian's guild cloak is made from tussah, chenille, or silk?<<

After weeks of exhaustive research, consisting of spirited discourse with the denizens living in and around the dumpster behind Barnes&Noble, it is my considered opinion that Sev's cloak was made from the same material as Superman's cape -- which is apropos for comic-book heroes (read: "graphic novel"). Of course, as a Man of Steel, Mr. Kent doubtless is subject to the same processes of oxidation as more humble iron men. <g>

On Sat, 8 May 1999 23:45:07, William Ansley wrote:

Am I missing the point of this list? No, I realize that putting Wolfe's words through the wringer is a large part of the point (and the fun) of this discussion group. But I do get weary, from time to time, of someone making some outrageous claim about one of Wolfe's works and justifying it by saying "Wolfe would never have mentioned (or repeated) so trivial a point if it didn't mean that I am right and everyone else is wrong." Or, "The fact that Wolfe never mentions this means that I am right and everyone else is wrong." (I should have said above: "every paragraph, phrase, word, letter and bit of punctuation Wolfe puts *or doesn't put* on paper is of cosmic significance.")

Am I aware that I am setting up a straw man here? Perhaps I am, but I think some posts on this list have come perilously close to my examples.<<

I have reread every post I have ever made to this list and have NEVER claimed " ... that I am right and everyone else is wrong" , whether based on what Wolfe did or didn't include in the text, or any other criteria. Nor, for that mater, can I recall anyone else who has.

On Wed, 26 May 1999 13:29:21, Robert Borski wrote:

For isn't Jonas, a former servitor of the Hierodules, from Yesod? ... This would allow for Jonas/Sidero to have crashed in the future ...<<

Just like that. <g> Without preamble or explication you have put Jonas on Tzad's ship (how else would he get to Yesod?) and equated him with Sidero. And no one says a word about it! I didn't go that far in my "iron men" posts, yet was pilloried! Is it my keyboard, or what? <g>

Roy