

5HC plot-cloaking device

The Urth list — 1 messages, 1 voices, 24 Jan 2001

<https://urth.darkrealm.vip/thread/urth/2555>

Exported from an unofficial mirror of a public mailing list. Copyright in each message remains with the person who wrote it. Email addresses are obscured as `user at host`, the form the original archive published. This file was rebuilt from parsed fields rather than retained headers, so it is faithful in content but not byte-exact.

Tony Ellis — 24 Jan 2001, 22:35

Rostrum wrote:

Reading "A Story," I got the impression that the field was hiding St. Anne from an already-settled-by-humans St. Croix, not shielding the whole system from Earth.

Read "V.R.T.". In one of the interrogation dialogues "Q" specifically says that "both our worlds remained unknown when planets more distant from Earth had been colonized for decades." The telepathic shield clearly applied to the whole system.

The fact that the starcrossers arrive so rapidly is kind of convenient for the plot, I agree. To say the least. But notice that the Shadow child doesn't just say he's going to remove the shield, he says of the starcrossers that he is going to "sing them in" - which suggests he's actually telepathically summoning them. This also explains why they happen to land just where they can rescue Sandwalker and co., rather on any other stretch of coastland on the planet. :-)

David Duffy wrote:

I think we're in the wrong worldview here. The song is magical, so its effects break down immediately from the point of view of a pre-Contact narrator, no matter how acausal that appears to science fiction critics ;)

Well, the song -is- telepathic. It may appear magical to Sandwalker and his friends, but that's because they're ignorant savages. :-)

But surely its effects would appear to "break down immediately" regardless of the point of view of the onlookers?

I would have thought that any shielding effects on foreigners would be psychic in nature...their own perception would be that they just hadn't got around to colonizing St Anne yet.

No, the effect of the song really was to hide the planets. See my answer to Rostrum, just above.