

Pullman review (SPOILERS)

The Urth list — 1 messages, 1 voices, 24 May 2001

<https://urth.darkrealm.vip/thread/urth/2663>

Exported from an unofficial mirror of a public mailing list. Copyright in each message remains with the person who wrote it. Email addresses are obscured as `user at host`, the form the original archive published. This file was rebuilt from parsed fields rather than retained headers, so it is faithful in content but not byte-exact.

Spectacled Bear — 24 May 2001, 18:33

At 18:51 2001-05-24, alga wrote:

"An Almost Christian Fantasy," the review by Daniel Maloney in the Catholic journal First Things of Pullman's His Dark Materials trilogy is up. Intelligent analysis, I think, not just religious but literary.
<http://print.firstthings.com/ftissues/ft0105/reviews/moloney.html>

Thanks for that, alga! I finished the series just last night, and I'm glad to see I wasn't the only one who didn't consider it entirely satisfactory. The plot of the third book is somewhat loose, but with so much wonderful writing and emotional power I could overlook that, provided there was a proper resolution. I couldn't understand why the Dust stopped flowing away just because of Will and Lyra's love; it feels right emotionally, but at least a hint of a rationale would have been nice. Her prophesied destiny as some sort of Eve comes to absolutely nothing that I could see. As for them being parted, well! That was just horrible. It really upset me. Why did he have to do that?

Spectacled Bear.