

redux on objections

The Urth list — 4 messages, 4 voices, 26 Mar 2002

<https://urth.darkrealm.vip/thread/urth/3095>

Exported from an unofficial mirror of a public mailing list. Copyright in each message remains with the person who wrote it. Email addresses are obscured as `user at host`, the form the original archive published. This file was rebuilt from parsed fields rather than retained headers, so it is faithful in content but not byte-exact.

maa32 — 26 Mar 2002, 17:53

Here is one more thing that bugs me: has the Short Sun narrator been gone TWO YEARS or THREE YEARS? you can't get the same number in the text. Conjunction has happened. More time dilation? How long has Horn been gone?

Someone (Blattid, right?) posted a huge list of objections. I mostly agree with Andy's defenses. I NEVER posited a space warp that the whorl flew into - i thought it flew in a circle. As far as I know, you can control direction in a space ship or you are doomed to an eternity of going forward.

Polyploidy is instant speciation - that's the whole point. It can spring up in one generation, and disappear in one generation. No time needs to pass to create new species.

I NEVER said that Blue was Urth of the past - it is Ushas of a somewhat distant future - enough time for the trees to kill the colonists on Lune, come to Urth, kill everyone there and die out or "move on" in one (or a few) generation(s) before the whorl comes back to recolonize the planet. So many things are the same (flooded planet, wall underwater, analog species) And I'm sorry, hybridization is SOOO textually prevalent, as is man to flower imagery. I HAVE posited a prototype green man - who isn't green yet. He can't feed in the winter, he doesn't eat, and he has normal limbs. Who is he? Your humble narrator Silk. and he has wounds from branches - he runs into a tree as soon as Hyacinth dies.

As I've said before, the moon (green) is in an oscillating, self correcting orbit around blue - it can always be seen in the sky. It was pulled from its decayed orbit by the new sun. Green orbits Blue in oscillation, sometimes close, sometimes far, but that has nothing to do with its orbital period.

also, there is every indication that the children of polyploid species are not the same. Look at the corn - the second generation is weaker and even a different color. Indeed, a return to the haploid state is necessary for children to be viable - and this is what we have in the life cycle of the inhumu, clearly delineated in the text. If the Neighbors go a generation or two, perhaps they will lose those excess limbs. (If they can regain fertility at all, because hybrids are notoriously infertile). Also, the inhumu do not gain excess limbs because they do not instantly create a new species: they are simple sexual producers who feast on blood, save it, and then incorporate that DNA into their children. That is different than the trees instant consumption and recombination. They are different species working on the same terraformed principles.

And Gene wolfe sets up the mystery of the vanished people as something that can be solved: Silk/Horn claims that his son already knows where the vanished people went and where they came from, but that it would be better if "he figured it out for himself", which implies that a reader of the text should be able to figure it out, too.

Marc

Roy C. Lackey — 26 Mar 2002, 20:25 · follows maa32

Marc wrote:

Here is one more thing that bugs me: has the Short Sun narrator been gone

TWO YEARS or THREE YEARS? you can't get the same number in the text. Conjunction has happened. More time dilation? How long has Horn been gone?<<

As I said before, three years, at the time of Blanko's war. (IGJ, 294)

As I've said before, the moon (green) is in an oscillating, self correcting orbit around blue - it can always be seen in the sky. It was pulled from its decayed orbit by the new sun. Green orbits Blue in oscillation, sometimes close, sometimes far, but that has nothing to do with its orbital period.<<

No, Green is not always visible in Blue's sky.

"Night had come already to the eastern sky, scattering the short suns of other whorls across its black velvet. Soon Green would rise, almost a second sun, yet baleful as a curse . . ." (Exodus, 383)

-Roy

Dan'I Danehy-Oakes — 26 Mar 2002, 20:43 · follows Roy C. Lackey

Someone (Blattid, right?) posted a huge list of objections. I mostly agree with Andy's defenses.

Yes, that was me. And some of the defenses were good, but miss the point -- which, however, Andy himself does get: that (in his own words) "there is no **compelling** reason to believe" the Blue=Urth theory.

You have a very pretty theory, which however requires a great deal of defending -- that is, your hypothesis requires a significant number of related hypotheses to make it feasible. For such a jerryrigged theory to be acceptable, it requires some kind of "smoking gun" textual evidence -- some place where the author is unambiguously (or, well, as unambiguous as anything ever gets in Wolfe) pointing us at it. And while the whole hybridization thing is clearly tremendously important, it isn't a smoking gun for this.

Consider, though, that most of your theory works perfectly well without adding the "Blue = Urth" hypothesis. I still am less than convinced that the Narrator is a tree that becomes a Neighbor, takes over Horn's life, and gets transmigrated into Silk's body, but by itself it's worthy of consideration; it's only piling "Blue = Urth" on top of it that it becomes top-heavy and collapses.

I NEVER posited a space warp that the whorl flew into

My apologies. I thought someone did -- I was pretty sure this was your explanation of how the Old Sun could be visible as a star from the Grue system.

Polyploidy is instant speciation - that's the whole point.

Only if it is transmissible. Highly questionable. And even more questionable that it would arise uniformly among humans, crocodilians, and elephants, in a way that completely pushes the "old" species out of existence.

I NEVER said that Blue was Urth of the past

No, someone else (I don't recall who) suggested that.

hybridization is SOOO textually prevalent, as is man to flower imagery.

Absolutely; this stuff is important.

I HAVE posited a prototype green man - who isn't green yet. He can't feed in the winter, he doesn't eat, and he has normal limbs. Who is he? Your humble narrator Silk.

H'mmmm... I think that, like Blue=Urth, this is unnecessary for your more general hypothesis (and indeed, if Blue $\neq$ Urth, the whole question of the "green man future" is irrelevant. No doubt, an eight-legged irrelevant.)

and he has wounds from branches - he runs into a tree as soon as Hyacinth dies.

Completely conjectural, of course, and unneeded ...

As I've said before, the moon (green) is in an oscillating, self correcting orbit around blue

What on _Earth_ (or in space) is a "self correcting orbit?"

Also, the inhumu do not gain excess limbs because they do not instantly create a new species: they are simple sexual producers who feast on blood, save it, and then incorporate that DNA into their children. That is different than the trees instant consumption and recombination.

Just a fussy point. One male inhumu; one female inhuma; many inhumu, male or female or both.

And weren't you saying earlier that the inhumu _were_ the trees? Or, no, that was the Neighbors. I'm so confused!

They are different species working on the same terraformed principles.

I guess the biggest question here would be "why in Hell would anyone 'terraform' (I assume you mean "genetically engineered principles") species to do this? "H'mmm. Alzabos, notules, salamanders ... naaah, there aren't enough monsters in the universe to really threaten our species' survival. Hey, I know! I'll create a bunch of monsters that incorporate the DNA of their victims and absorb memory! And the trees can go all polyploid to have extra limbs!" H'mmmm. No, I really have a lot of trouble imagining anyone's motives for this...

And Gene wolfe sets up the mystery of the vanished people as something that can be solved: Silk/Horn claims that his son already knows where the vanished people went and where they came from, but that it would be better if "he figured it out for himself", which implies that a reader of the text should be able to figure it out, too.

Quite likely. That doesn't mean that this is the answer.

--Dan'I

matthew.malthouse — 27 Mar 2002, 11:21 · follows Dan'I Danehy-Oakes

On 26/03/2002 20:43:49 Dan'I Danehy-Oakes wrote:

As I've said before, the moon (green) is in an oscillating, self correcting orbit around blue

What on _Earth_ (or in space) is a "self correcting orbit?"

Big engines, feedback sensors, hidden computers. Think Microsoft Automatic Update; and probably just as reliable. ;-)

Matthew