

The Claw

The Urth list — 3 messages, 2 voices, 18 Nov 2002

<https://urth.darkrealm.vip/thread/urth/3580>

Exported from an unofficial mirror of a public mailing list. Copyright in each message remains with the person who wrote it. Email addresses are obscured as `user at host`, the form the original archive published. This file was rebuilt from parsed fields rather than retained headers, so it is faithful in content but not byte-exact.

Roy C. Lackey — 18 Nov 2002, 06:47

Marc Aramini wrote:

Perhaps the power of the claw - which is really the negation of time - indicates where the vanished people have gone - someWHEN else.<<

A quibble about the Claw: it has been suggested often before that the Claw (or Sev) worked by reaching back in time to a point before whatever malady it was being used to remedy had come about. Restoring Dorcas to life by returning her body to a time when she was still alive; healing Declan's swollen abdomen by returning his body to a time before he had appendicitis. But this doesn't work for Herena. She had "a withered arm no larger than an infant's". In other words, it was a birth defect. There had never been a time when her arm had been well and whole.

It also didn't work for Jonas. Sev couldn't even restore him to the condition he had been in before he got zapped, much less reach back in time to restore him to the way he was before his ship crashed. Didn't work for Jolenta, either, though Sev had known her both before she was bitten and before she was Jolenta.

-Roy

Dan'I Danehy-Oakes — 18 Nov 2002, 18:07 · follows Roy C. Lackey

There are more posts in Roy C. Lackey's posts than are dremt of in your philosophy:

It also didn't work for Jonas. Sev couldn't even restore him to the condition he had been in before he got zapped, much less reach back in time to restore him to the way he was before his ship crashed. Didn't work for Jolenta, either, though Sev had known her both before she was bitten and before she was Jolenta.

I seem to recall some discussion of this in the past ... but ... it seems to me that the common factor between Jonas and Jolenta

-- aside from their names beginning with the syllable "Jo" -- would consist in their both having an artificial nature (though Jolenta begins as a natural person, Doctor T. artifiically enhances her ... sort of the Pamela Anderson of posthistory).

Perhaps the Claw (or Severian) cannot heal artificial persons, but only natural persons ...

Roy C. Lackey — 18 Nov 2002, 20:21 · follows Dan'I Danehy-Oakes

Dan'I quoted:

It also didn't work for Jonas. Sev couldn't even restore him to the condition he had been in before he got zapped, much less reach back in time to restore him to the way he was before his ship crashed. Didn't work for Jolenta, either, though Sev had known her both before she was bitten and

before she was Jolenta.

and wrote:

I seem to recall some discussion of this in the past ... but ...

it seems to me that the common factor between Jonas and Jolenta

-- aside from their names beginning with the syllable "Jo" -- would consist in their both having an artificial nature (though Jolenta _begins_ as a natural person, Doctor T. artificially enhances her ... sort of the Pamela Anderson of posthistory).

Perhaps the Claw (or Severian) cannot heal artificial persons,
but only natural persons ..., <<

I, too, recall such discussion, and the artificiality factor may be valid for the failures. What I was addressing, however, was the contention that the Claw worked by reaching back in time to a point before the pending problem. If the Claw's power was a function of time, why should the presence of prosthetics present a problem? Would it not work for a man with a wooden leg who was wounded woefully by a weapon?

-Roy