

Blue still ain't Ushas

The Urth list — 2 messages, 2 voices, 21 Dec 2002

<https://urth.darkrealm.vip/thread/urth/3702>

Exported from an unofficial mirror of a public mailing list. Copyright in each message remains with the person who wrote it. Email addresses are obscured as `user at host`, the form the original archive published. This file was rebuilt from parsed fields rather than retained headers, so it is faithful in content but not byte-exact.

Roy C. Lackey — 21 Dec 2002, 22:42

I argued, last spring, that Blue is not Ushas. If those arguments weren't heeded then, there's no point in repeating them now. Those arguments were from the text and/or Physics, so I don't know how it can be claimed "all your reasons for Urth not being Blue AREN'T valid ones", as was recently stated here. Be that as it may, the mass of textual evidence against Blue being Urth/Ushas overwhelms the theory that it is. I have also argued that Silkhorn's astral travel is spatial, not temporal. The only text-based argument for astral time-travel that I am aware of is the appearance of Silk and Oreb in Salica's story. That is evidence that the **story** was changed, just as Fava's story was influenced by Silkhorn, not that the past had been changed.

Proponents of the Blue=Urth/Ushas theory have also claimed that the Neighbors were far-future descendants of the people who repopulated Urth after it became Ushas. Where the Green Man fits into that evolution, I don't know. At any rate, the text contradicts the theory that the Neighbors were some future evolutionary stage of humanity on Blushas. When Silkhorn went to ruined Nessus with Rigoglio and others, he spoke to Mora:

"I was trapped in a pit in a ruined city of the Vanished People once," I remarked to Mora. "Have I ever told you about that?"

She shook her head.

"I've been thinking about it, and about the City of the Inhumani on Green. Those were ruins left by the Neighbors' ancient race; these were left by ours, I believe--we are as ancient as they, or nearly." (IGJ, 315)

This means that humans and Neighbors are roughly of equal antiquity, and implies that the Neighbors' race may even be **older** than humankind. Elsewhere it is stated that humans and Neighbors were molded by the Outsider from different soils. If the text means anything to this argument, then the above quote is a dagger in the Blushas theory.

-Roy

Don Doggett — 22 Dec 2002, 04:25 · follows Roy C. Lackey

When Silkhorn went to
ruined Nessus with Rigoglio and others, he spoke to Mora:

"I was trapped in a pit in a ruined city of the Vanished People once,"

I

remarked to Mora. "Have I ever told you about that?"

She shook her head.

"I've been thinking about it, and about the City of the Inhumani on

Green.

Those were ruins left by the Neighbors' ancient race; these were left by ours, I believe--we are as ancient as they, or nearly." (IGJ, 315)

This means that humans and Neighbors are roughly of equal antiquity, and implies that the Neighbors' race may even be *older* than humankind. Elsewhere it is stated that humans and Neighbors were molded by the Outsider from different soils. If the text means anything to this argument, then the above quote is a dagger in the Blushas theory.

-Roy

Don replies:

Sorry Roy, but that dagger just don't cut for me. Silk's opinions on the origin or age of the Neighbor's are just as likely to be wrong as right. He's an unreliable narrator. And as for the Quetzal as a late arrival on the Whorl, what exactly does that mean? The Chems were the original beings on the Whorl, so he could be a late arrival after them, or he could be the last being on the Whorl after everyone else but before it left the Urth system. It is not the killer it seems to be.

On another note, I have decided on a Vironese name for myself. It should have been obvious to me. In honor of my favorite literary character, you may or may not address me as

Monkey