

Merry Christmas ... let's remove the silence

The Urth list — 2 messages, 2 voices, 23 Dec 2002

<https://urth.darkrealm.vip/thread/urth/3709>

Exported from an unofficial mirror of a public mailing list. Copyright in each message remains with the person who wrote it. Email addresses are obscured as `user at host`, the form the original archive published. This file was rebuilt from parsed fields rather than retained headers, so it is faithful in content but not byte-exact.

maa32 — 23 Dec 2002, 20:31

I relinquish my hold upon you, precious information.

You will have to forgive me, guys. Please remember that I am like a kid in a candy shop when it comes to Wolfe - enthusiastic and excited about everything - especially when it seems as if one of my original ideas (that everybody else doubts) is right. Now I have created a "sublist" of the list - a few individuals that I have forbid from posting the "secret", to speak only with me. That is clearly, clearly wrong. So I am going to bite the bullet and publically apologize to Mr. Wolfe; I behaved very badly, but I was excited. Let's post about it - let's not hinder the discussion because I couldn't keep it to myself. My motives WERE good. I wanted to share the "truth". However, Mr. Wolfe obviously wants to cast doubt on this revelation by calling it a good natured joke. Let's approach it that way, and see if we find any evidence to back up either its validity or its worthlessness.

This is my Christmas present to the list - too bad it wasn't mine to give. Remember that Wolfe has claimed that it is a joke. But a very good one, eh?

I do this so that you may appreciate that he truly is the finest subconscious craftsmen of the modern era, and to argue with the claim that he doesn't know whether Blue and Green are Urth and Lune. Of course he knows. I just think he didn't want US to know. But I want us to appreciate how TRULY great he is.

So, without further beating around the bush, here is the "secret" and here is the evidence I found. How on Urth could I have ever convinced you of this, though? It is too hermetically sealed to even try. You would never believe it without his words. Maybe most of you will never believe it.

When asked "Does the narrator travel through the white fountain in the short sun to the past, allowing Blue to be Urth?", Gene replied

"No, no, NO! Green is Urth."

Which creates even more problems than my theories, eh?

But here is some evidence:

This occurs before the first trip to the red sun Whorl. Notice that the narrator thinks of green and his son, but the song is being played, and a witch appears in the fire, seen by Rigolio or Terzo. (End of Chapter 20, start of 21 in IGJ) While listening to the song (remember that the song of the mother is "a song of time": "I tried to recall Green's jungles and Sinew. Sleep rushed upon me, sending me spinning through an endless night." The next page: "I want very much to describe the red sun whorl in such a way that you can see it. ... Have I made you see Green's jungles? The swamps and their dire inhabitants? The immense trees and the lianas clinging to them like brides? Or the City of the Inhum, a grove of disintegrating towers like a noble face rotting in the grave?" and further on: "There is a city somewhat like this on Green, but we

are not on Green; these houses would be the towers of the Neighbor lords there." ... "I've been thinking about it, and about the City of the Inhumis on Green. Those were ruins left by the Neighbors' ancient race; these were left by ours, I believe -- we are as ancient as they, or nearly."

[of course the vanished people are as ancient as us - they ARE us]

It just keeps comparing the city of the inhumis to the necropolis of Nessus ... and that man with the stiff bird-like gait in a colorless cloak on top of a tower on green smacks of Severian on top of the Matachin tower, doesn't it? And there is the round little window and the fact that green is warmer than blue. Also, the text states that the inhumis can't breed on blue because something is missing from the water.

The end of Chapter 21 talks about the narrators motivation in taking them there, too - to see how their civilization could be corrupted if they aren't careful.

How could anyone sit on this quietly? Only Mr. Wolfe, and I AM for all intents a child when it comes to this discussion - basking in glee. Is it a joke? I suspect Wolfe wants the solution cloaked in mystery - but I believe him. I've already proposed several mechanisms, and Nigel Price has come up with an interesting further interpretation of the star system that is fascinating and may explain the theme of the doubled limbs. I release you all to post about it. I'm sorry I kept it to myself at all - I thought I was respecting Gene's wishes - but he never told me not to tell anybody. Please forgive me. No hard feelings! Merry Christmas.

Marc Aramini

Jeff Veyera — 24 Dec 2002, 00:02 · follows maa32

Marc-

Thanks for removing the veil so we can discuss this. I look forward to the posts to follow.

:When asked "Does the narrator travel through the white fountain in the short sun to the past, allowing Blue to be Urth?", Gene replied

"No, no, NO! Green is Urth."

Which creates even more problems than my theories, eh?:

Well, THAT should send people scurrying back to the text. Wonder what Roy thinks of author's intent on that one? :)

It does present some problems, though:

1. The city many of us took to be Nessus underneath the waves noted by Seawrack can't be if Blue is Lune.
2. Where'd all the water come from? In BotNS, the moon is described as green (it's been terraformed) but no oceans are in evidence upon it. I certainly find it easier to think of Lune as becoming a huge jungle than it becoming a water planet.
3. Where'd all the water go on Ushas?

:But here is some evidence:

This occurs before the first trip to the red sun Whorl. Notice that the narrator thinks of green and his son, but the song is being played, and a witch appears in the fire, seen by Rigolio or Terzo. (End of Chapter 20, start of 21 in IGJ) While listening to the song (remember that the song of the mother is "a song of time": "I tried to recall Green's jungles and Sinew. Sleep rushed upon me, sending me spinning through an endless night." The next page: "I want very much to describe the red sun whorl in such a way that you can see it. ... Have I made you see Green's jungles? The swamps and their dire inhabitants? The immense trees and the lianas clinging to them like brides? Or the City of the Inhumu, a grove of disintegrating towers like a noble face rotting in the grave?" and further on: "There is a city somewhat like this on Green, but we are not on Green; these houses would be the towers of the Neighbor lords there." ... "I've been thinking about it, and about the City of the Inhumu on Green. Those were ruins left by the Neighbors' ancient race; these were left by ours, I believe -- we are as ancient as they, or nearly."

[of course the vanished people are as ancient as us - they ARE us]

It just keeps comparing the city of the inhumu to the necropolis of nessus ... and that man with the stiff bird-like gait in a colorless cloak on top of a tower on green smacks of Severian on top of the Matachin tower, doesn't it? And there is the round little window and the fact that green is warmer than blue. Also, the text states that the inhumu can't breed on blue because something is missing from the water.

The end of Chapter 21 talks about the narrators motivation in taking them there, too - to see how their civilization could be corrupted if they aren't careful.:

This is certainly food for thought, anyway.

:How could anyone sit on this quietly? Only Mr. Wolfe, and I AM for all intents a child when it comes to this discussion - basking in glee. Is it a joke? I suspect Wolfe wants the solution cloaked in mystery - but I believe him. I've already proposed several mechanisms, and Nigel Price has come up with an interesting further interpretation of the star system that is fascinating and may explain the theme of the doubled limbs. I release you all to post about it. I'm sorry I kept it to myself at all - I thought I was respecting Gene's wishes - but he never told me not to tell anybody. Please forgive me. No hard feelings! Merry Christmas.:

Personally, I think some folks on this list can be pretty harsh in criticizing others---it's probably why longtime lurkers like myself rarely contribute. As a New Year's resolution, I think we can all be a bit more patient and respectful of others' interpretations and theories. Even if we don't agree with them, it adds flavor to the hearty stew that is the Urth list.