

More Mieville

The Urth list — 6 messages, 4 voices, 02 Dec 2004

<https://urth.darkrealm.vip/thread/urth/4263>

Exported from an unofficial mirror of a public mailing list. Copyright in each message remains with the person who wrote it. Email addresses are obscured as `user at host`, the form the original archive published. This file was rebuilt from parsed fields rather than retained headers, so it is faithful in content but not byte-exact.

Alice K. Turner — 02 Dec 2004, 19:30

Yes, The Scar is a lot better than PSS (though it completely falls apart at the end), and IC is hopeless (I think, though I've only ventured into it for three chapters). I plead guilty to using the term "hack," but I'll retract that. He's not exactly a hack, since that implies churning the stuff out mindlessly. Mieville, I think really believes in what he is doing, but unfortunately (from my point of view) what he loves is pulp horror, mainly taken from movies. You can tell that from the excerpted quotes that intrigued some of you. He has also been poorly edited, especially in PSS, which is nothing if not repetitive, with terribly clunky prose.

-alga

Mieville is worth reading. He is no hack, in my opinion, although he has clearly been influenced by hacks -- as has Gene Wolfe. I recommend The Scar as the "purest" Mieville -- that's the book I feel has come closest to showcasing his strengths. Perdido Street Station will also give a fair appreciation of his talents. I would avoid Iron Council, his latest. He's not the tidiest of writers under the best of circumstances, but IC is just plain sloppy.

Paul

Brian Lindenmuth — 03 Dec 2004, 07:48 · follows Alice K. Turner

I am behind on my Mieville. I have read PSS, started The Scar but not finished it yet (Edward Whittemore has been distracting me) and I bought IC but its not even on my radar screen yet in terms of reading it. I don't think he is a hack, but he is certainly a messy and unpolished writer. Maybe he would benefit from better editing. PSS was good though, if messy, a bit slow at times and too long. It was what I like to call a kitchen sink novel. He was bursting with images and ideas and wanted to get them all out without a certain amount of control or cohesiveness. Again, not the best writer in the world, but definitely a good imagination and worth watching.

-----Original Message-----

From: Alice K. Turner [SMTP:aturner6 at nyc.rr.com]

Sent: Thursday, December 02, 2004 10:30 PM

To: urth-urth.net at lists.urth.net

Subject: (urth) More Mieville

Yes, The Scar is a lot better than PSS (though it completely falls apart at the end), and IC is hopeless (I think, though I've only ventured into it for three chapters). I plead guilty to using the term "hack," but I'll retract that. He's not exactly a hack, since that implies churning the stuff out mindlessly. Mieville, I think really believes in what he is doing, but unfortunately (from my point of view) what he loves is pulp horror, mainly taken from movies. You can tell that from the excerpted quotes that intrigued some of you. He has also been poorly edited, especially in PSS,

which is nothing if not repetitive, with terribly clunky prose.

-alga

Mieville is worth reading. He is no hack, in my opinion, although he has clearly been influenced by hacks -- as has Gene Wolfe. I recommend *The Scar* as the "purest" Mieville -- that's the book I feel has come closest to showcasing his strengths. *Perdido Street Station* will also give a fair appreciation of his talents. I would avoid *Iron Council*, his latest. He's not the tidiest of writers under the best of circumstances, but *IC* is just plain sloppy.

Paul

Dan'l Danehy-Oakes — 03 Dec 2004, 08:42 · in reply to Alice K. Turner

A -

I think you're probably right; if I had read *The Scar* first I might well have liked it better than *PSS*. Alas, the sheer grotesquerie which is CM's primary stock in trade is really only good for about one book, so I found *The Scar* something of a slog, as it didn't have the "Wow!" factor of the first encounter with CM.

Of course, for anyone who's read all this discussion, there will probably be almost no "Wow!" factor no matter *which* book they begin with, because an expectation will have been built which won't be lived up to...

On Thu, 2 Dec 2004 22:30:27 -0500, Alice K. Turner <aturner6 at nyc.rr.com> wrote:

Yes, *The Scar* is a lot better than *PSS* (though it completely falls apart at the end), and *IC* is hopeless (I think, though I've only ventured into it for three chapters). I plead guilty to using the term "hack," but I'll retract that. He's not exactly a hack, since that implies churning the stuff out mindlessly. Mieville, I think really believes in what he is doing, but unfortunately (from my point of view) what he loves is pulp horror, mainly taken from movies. You can tell that from the excerpted quotes that intrigued some of you. He has also been poorly edited, especially in *PSS*, which is nothing if not repetitive, with terribly clunky prose.

-alga

Mieville is worth reading. He is no hack, in my opinion, although he has clearly been influenced by hacks -- as has Gene Wolfe. I recommend *The Scar* as the "purest" Mieville -- that's the book I feel has come closest to showcasing his strengths. *Perdido Street Station* will also give a fair appreciation of his talents. I would avoid *Iron Council*, his latest. He's not the tidiest of writers under the best of circumstances, but *IC* is just plain sloppy.

Paul

Chris — 03 Dec 2004, 10:08 · in reply to Brian Lindenmuth

I don't deny that Mieville is creative, but I don't think the wealth of ideas and images you're talking about is a sign of it... Mieville, by his own admission, borrows a lot of ideas from all over the place. The particular synthesis is unique to him and I would agree is rather creative.

I am behind on my Mieville. I have read PSS, started The Scar but not finished it yet (Edward Whitemore has been distracting me) and I bought IC but its not even on my radar screen yet in terms of reading it. I done think he is a hack, but her is certainly a messy and unpolished writer. Maybe he would benefit from better editing. PSS was good though, if messy, a bit slow at times and too long. It was what I like to call a kitchen sink novel. He was bursting with images and ideas and wanted to get them all out without a certain amount of control or cohesiveness. Again, not the best writer in the world, but definitely a good imagination and worth watching.

-----Original Message-----

From: Alice K. Turner [SMTP:aturner6 at nyc.rr.com]

Sent: Thursday, December 02, 2004 10:30 PM

To: urth-urth.net at lists.urth.net

Subject: (urth) More Mieville

Yes, The Scar is a lot better than PSS (though it completely falls apart at the end), and IC is hopeless (I think, though I've only ventured into it for three chapters). I plead guilty to using the term "hack," but I'll retract that. He's not exactly a hack, since that implies churning the stuff out mindlessly. Mieville, I think really believes in what he is doing, but unfortunately (from my point of view) what he loves is pulp horror, mainly taken from movies. You can tell that from the excerpted quotes that intrigued some of you. He has also been poorly edited, especially in PSS, which is nothing if not repetitive, with terribly clunky prose.

-alga

Mieville is worth reading. He is no hack, in my opinion, although he has clearly been influenced by hacks -- as has Gene Wolfe. I recommend The Scar as the "purest" Mieville -- that's the book I feel has come closest to showcasing his strengths. Perdido Street Station will also give a fair appreciation of his talents. I would avoid Iron Council, his latest. He's not the tidiest of writers under the best of circumstances, but IC is just plain sloppy.

Paul

Alice K. Turner — 03 Dec 2004, 12:34 · follows Chris

Ah, but I read The Scar first, then went back to PSS. Which makes me completely agree with Dan'I about grotesquerie and the "wow" factor being only good for one book. We simply started with different books. Though I still applaud the Armada as a visual concept.

-alga

Brian Lindenmuth — 03 Dec 2004, 12:41 · follows Alice K. Turner

No need to elaborate, but I agree with the "wow" factor lasting for 1 book.

-----Original Message-----

From: Alice K. Turner [SMTP:aturner6 at nyc.rr.com]

Sent: Friday, December 03, 2004 3:34 PM

To: urth-urth.net at lists.urth.net

Subject: (urth) More Mieville

Ah, but I read The Scar first, then went back to PSS. Which makes me completely agree with Dan'l about grotesquerie and the "wow" factor being only good for one book. We simply started with different books. Though I still applaud the Armada as a visual concept.

-alga