

silverglass

The Urth list — 5 messages, 4 voices, 14 Jan 2005

<https://urth.darkrealm.vip/thread/urth/4309>

Exported from an unofficial mirror of a public mailing list. Copyright in each message remains with the person who wrote it. Email addresses are obscured as `user at host`, the form the original archive published. This file was rebuilt from parsed fields rather than retained headers, so it is faithful in content but not byte-exact.

aramini1 at cox.net — 14 Jan 2005, 21:55

Hmmm - my argument that the editors had no real insight into the character of the ambiguous protagonist has been turned against me.

Let me rephrase it - the editors are working with two things: the Silk-Horn that they knew and his account, and the tale of events reconstructed from witnesses. However, since they are on Blue and the witnesses are on the whorl, there is very little of that. Instead, they have the words of Silk-Horn. But this is not the Horn that left to find Silk, nor the Silk that lived on the whorl with Hyacinth - this is someone in between. They can place the character as they understand him to be into the events that occurred on the whorl without understanding the precise instant when he became the character they know. (And the text they have puts them in the same boat as us as far as the narrator's identity goes). But they have to use the character they have come to know in their narrative. It is ultimately indeterminable at which point he became that character from their perspective, because Silk isn't verbally talking about it too much - and when he is, he is usually denying it.

The Short Sun books really do create an interpretive problem - everyone has a "feeling", but the very construction makes it hard to prove anything one way or the other. Just as there are clues that "He is Silk", there seem to be clues, including the denials coming from his own mouth, that "he is not Silk". I can quote a hundred times when the narrator denies being Silk - but we all know it isn't true. Bizarre, isn't it? Why does it work that way? At the end of the book, I feel 100% confident saying - "there is Silk", as do most of us.

Marc

James Wynn — 15 Jan 2005, 18:10 · in reply to aramini1 at cox.net

How about those Puss-In-Boots references?

~ Crush

Dan'I Danehy-Oakes — 17 Jan 2005, 09:41 · in reply to James Wynn

Uhhhhh.....

On Sat, 15 Jan 2005 21:10:44 -0500, James Wynn <thewynns at earthlink.net> wrote:
How about those Puss-In-Boots references?

~ Crush

Urth Mailing List

To post, write urth at urth.net

James Wynn — 17 Jan 2005, 12:53 · follows Dan'I Danehy-Oakes

How about those Puss-In-Boots references?

Uhhhhh.....

Heh heh. A talking cat becomes an ambassador to a giant. His advices leads to said giant's death -- in several senses his masters do take over his castle. The cat procures a over-sized boots for Toug whom he sporadically considers his master. (Yes, I know that's the opposite from the way it occurs in the story.)

There are probably more. I was wondering if anyone else noted them.

~ Crush

Andrew Bollen — 17 Jan 2005, 13:08 · in reply to James Wynn

How about those Puss-In-Boots references?

Uhhhhh.....

Heh heh. A talking cat becomes an ambassador to a giant. His advices leads to said giant's death -- in several senses his masters do take over his castle. The cat procures a over-sized boots for Toug whom he sporadically considers his master. (Yes, I know that's the opposite from the way it occurs in the story.)

There are probably more. I was wondering if anyone else noted them.

~ Crush

Maybe p297: Idnn says, "Could you do that then? Turn into an eagle or a bull. Or be smaller than Mani." Able says, "Who'd catch and eat me, and serve me right too."