

Sinew's parentage

The Urth list — 14 messages, 7 voices, 21 Feb 2005

<https://urth.darkrealm.vip/thread/urth/4370>

Exported from an unofficial mirror of a public mailing list. Copyright in each message remains with the person who wrote it. Email addresses are obscured as `user at host`, the form the original archive published. This file was rebuilt from parsed fields rather than retained headers, so it is faithful in content but not byte-exact.

James Wynn — 21 Feb 2005, 15:29

In case Kieran's post doesn't "take" I'll offer this one.

Is Sinew be Marrow's son?

Consider:

1) Sinew doesn't "quite" fit with Horn's name. Not the way Hoof and Hide do. But it does work with Marrow.

2) Marrow bailed out Horn and Nettle when their farming venture failed, so they could get a fresh start. He didn't sell them into slavery as he did with others. What did Marrow get in return?

3) When Horn leaves New Viron in his boat, Marrow tosses his cane into the boat _just as Sinew tossed his knife_ as Horn left Lizard Island. I believe the text makes this precise comparison.

4) Horn harbors a distinct resentment for Sinew that is not explainable by any of Sinew's actions.

Well?

~ Crush

Chris — 21 Feb 2005, 15:47 · in reply to James Wynn

This isn't as good as a reasoned argument for the subject, but for what it's worth I got the same impression fairly directly - that is, the scenario with Horn/Marrow/Nettle had taken place, and that Horn strongly suspected he was not Sinew's father. I almost want to say "knew", but there's a sort of deep ambivalence in Horn about his own relationship with Sinew that gave me the impression that he had some doubts that he might have been Sinew's father after all.

I don't know that there's anything there that establishes beyond a doubt who Sinew's father is. It shouldn't matter, ultimately, and I don't think this is something Horn needs to discover because he knows it from the beginning; this isn't the only thread of the book which brings out a tension between knowing the right way to behave/live and actually living that way.

In case Kieran's post doesn't "take" I'll offer this one.

Is Sinew be Marrow's son?

Consider:

1) Sinew doesn't "quite" fit with Horn's name. Not the way Hoof and Hide do.

But it does work with Marrow.

2) Marrow bailed out Horn and Nettle when their farming venture failed, so they could get a fresh start. He didn't sell them into slavery as he did with others. What did Marrow get in return?

3) When Horn leaves New Viron in his boat, Marrow tosses his cane into the boat _just as Sinew tossed his knife_ as Horn left Lizard Island. I believe the text makes this precise comparison.

4) Horn harbors a distinct resentment for Sinew that is not explainable by any of Sinew's actions.

Well?

~ Crush

mournings glory — 21 Feb 2005, 18:09 · in reply to James Wynn

Is Sinew Marrow's son?

Consider:

1) Sinew doesn't "quite" fit with Horn's name. Not the way Hoof and Hide do.

But it does work with Marrow.

Not sure I agree. Most cultures that process their own meat (as opposed to shopping at a supermarket) consider horns, hooves, hides (skin) and sinews (tendons) to be inedible; all, however, can be rendered down into gelatin. So "sinew" at least for me seems part of a logical subset of possible filial names.

"Marrow," on the other hand, may be meant to suggest another crimelord in another Viron; i.e., Blood.

4) Horn harbors a distinct resentment for Sinew that is not explainable by any of Sinew's actions.

The -ew ending of Sinew may be a Roman-a-clef-type-clue that he represents Wolfe's estranged son Matthew--something at least family members and close friends would recognize.

msg

Roy C. Lackey — 21 Feb 2005, 22:46 · follows mournings glory

Crush wrote:

Is Sinew be Marrow's son?

No, no. Sinew was conceived in the Calde's Palace on the _Whorl_. (EXODUS, 384) Marrow had nothing to do with it.

-Roy

James Wynn — 22 Feb 2005, 13:13 · in reply to Roy C. Lackey

Is Sinew be Marrow's son?

No, no. Sinew was conceived in the Calde's Palace on the _Whorl_. (EXODUS, 384) Marrow had nothing to do with it.

Are you talking about paperback or hardcover? I'm looking at the HC version on Amazon Search Inside, and I don't see any reference to Nettle being pregnant on that page.

http://www.amazon.com/gp/reader/0812539052/ref=sib_vae_pg_384/002-9285863-1383208?%5Fencoding=UTF8&keywords=384&p=S0B2&twc=1&checksum=KirphXU9BP8A6XV2%2B8XJNacZmoGJyf6GB6Ximl2kq88%3D#reader-page

~ Crush

StoneOx17 at aol.com — 22 Feb 2005, 15:20 · follows James Wynn

Crush asks:

Is Sinew be Marrow's son?

Roy Lackey says:

No, no. Sinew was conceived in the Calde's Palace on the _Whorl_. (EXODUS, 384) Marrow had nothing to do with it.

Crush asks:

Are you talking about paperback or hardcover?
I'm looking at the HC version on Amazon Search Inside, and I don't see any reference to Nettle being pregnant on that page.

I say: be careful when you argue with Roy Lackey about points of fact in Wolfe novels. He has, as I've come to realize, the annoying habit of nearly always being correct.

From the amazon site searchable edition, Page

430. "... Within that point of light Sinew had been conceived, in all probability, in the Calde's Palace. It did not seem possible."

-- Stone Ox

James Wynn — 22 Feb 2005, 16:18 · in reply to StoneOx17 at aol.com

I say: be careful when you argue with Roy Lackey about points of fact in Wolfe novels. He has, as I've come to realize, the annoying habit of nearly always being correct.

I'm not arguing with him (yet). But I did not find the information at the location he provided, so it is possible that he may have already tipped his hand to his mortality.

I have three things to say for the record:

1) I opened this question, not because I have a hard opinion, but because I considered the question dubious.

2) I remember having problem with the timeline for this theory from something Horn said in "The Short Sun", but I can't remember where or what it was exactly. Yet the other issues still persist. Something is going on there and Sinew as Marrow's son would definitely clear a lot up. (Incidentally there are problems with the timeline in SS no matter what you believe, such as

"how long has Horn been away?")

3) I've found Roy to be remarkable in his ability to recall a pertinent and important quote, but as human as the rest of us in his analysis. I would certainly not scare anyone away from disagreeing with him before they've even started, and I can't imagine that he would want that either.

~ Crush

Roy C. Lackey — 22 Feb 2005, 22:09 · follows James Wynn

Crush quoted Stone Ox and wrote:

I say: be careful when you argue with Roy Lackey about points of fact in Wolfe novels. He has, as I've come to realize, the annoying habit of nearly always being correct.

I'm not arguing with him (yet). But I did not find the information at the location he provided, so it is possible that he may have already tipped his hand to his mortality.

What can I say? I stand by my original statement. Stone Ox gave you the pertinent quote. It comes from page 384 of EXODUS FROM THE LONG SUN, Tor, Hardback, First Edition: November 1996. It's the last page of the book. If Amazon says something different, then they're wrong, or both my wife and I are hallucinating. Am I the only one here who bought the book?

Sheesh!

-Roy

Chris — 22 Feb 2005, 23:37 · in reply to Roy C. Lackey

What can I say? I stand by my original statement. Stone Ox gave you the pertinent quote. It comes from page 384 of EXODUS FROM THE LONG SUN, Tor, Hardback, First Edition: November 1996. It's the last page of the book. If Amazon says something different, then they're wrong, or both my wife and I are hallucinating. Am I the only one here who bought the book?

Sheesh!

-Roy

The rest of us have sort of gotten by on reading a couple pages at a time from Amazon's inside the book search, and we share screenshots to paste the thing together. It takes a lot of work, but we have a lot of willpower and free time, and not enough cash to buy a copy of the book and scan it.

Seriously though, maybe Wolfe needs to be treated like the classics where the original page number appears in the margin so that you can track the same references in different editions. I didn't even try to look up your reference because I have the latest trade paperback versions and I assume the page numbers are different.

Somehow I don't think anyone anticipated anyone citing a sci-fi book to the extent that we do.

StoneOx17 at aol.com — 23 Feb 2005, 15:03 · follows Chris

Hi Crush,

I say: be careful when you argue with Roy Lackey about points of fact in Wolfe novels. He has, as I've come to realize, the annoying habit of nearly always being correct.

I'm not arguing with him (yet). But I did not find the information at the location he provided, so it is possible that he may have already tipped his hand to his mortality.

You haven't yet. The Amazon search copy (even the one linked from the hardback edition) has the page numbers from the mass market paperback.

I have three things to say for the record:

... snipped.

3) I've found Roy to be remarkable in his ability to recall a pertinent and important quote, but as human as the rest of us in his analysis. I would certainly not scare anyone away from disagreeing with him before they've even started, and I can't imagine that he would want that either.

I wasn't trying to scare anyone away from disagreeing with him. I did say points of fact, by which I meant to exclude interpretations. There are at least two or three aspects of the interpretation of Peace that I think Roy is wrong about (and several others that we've argued about that I've since come around to his side on). Also, you're taking my post more personally than I intended it. My intention was to compliment Roy on his remarkable ability you note above, and not to make a dig at you. My apologies if you interpreted it otherwise.

-- Stone Ox (Peter)

James Wynn — 23 Feb 2005, 17:05 · in reply to StoneOx17 at aol.com

I had just sat down to post something about this and looky here...

Stone Ox wrote:

I'm not arguing with him (yet).

You haven't yet. The Amazon search copy (even the one linked from the hardback edition) has the page numbers from the mass market paperback.

Yeah. I was able to find with the quote you provided. I missed it the first time through. It had a ">" at the start of it and I took for part of my post. Sorry about that. And thanks for the quote.

And my last post came off more peevish than I intended. I'm working a lot of hours lately. Sorry 'bout that too. It might have contributed to the peevishness of Roy's post, but I'm not sure about that.

Now as for that quote:

"... Within that point of light [the Whorl] Sinew had been conceived, in all probability, in the Calde's Palace. It did not seem possible." pg 430

That's a very good point and I don't have a ready answer for it.

However, when I was shaving this morning I remembered something about that "timeline problem" in the SS that I mentioned in my post. When I was reading the SS, I could not get the idea that Sinew's name seemed all wrong for Horn's son, but worked quite well for SILK's son. A sinew is a kind of thread and so is silk. And both names start with the same letter. But Horn gave a description of the timeline of Sinew's birth that made me convinced (aside from the normal disinclination's to the theory) that it was impossible for Silk to be Sinew's father. Now Roy has reminded me of a reference I had forgotten about that puts Silk back on the spot.

Now Roy (if I'm at all familiar with Roy and I am) will hit the roof at this. But (mournings glory's assurances aside) Sinew's name has always smelled suspicious to me. I suppose when I get back to Texas, I'll have re-read the LS and SS just to find the timeline problem that puts Sinew's conception outside of the Whorl.

Oh, before anyone mentions it, I'm well aware that Horn says Sinew looks exactly like him -- "devilishly" so (devilishly? Why should it be surprising at all?). But that doesn't surprise me in the least even if Sinew is not Horn's natural son, for reasons I'll be better able to explain if I can decide -- to the degree of certainty that Roy has -- who Sinew's bio-dad is.

~ Crush

Dan'l Danehy-Oakes — 23 Feb 2005, 17:22 · in reply to James Wynn

Well, Horn, Hoof, Hide and Sinew are all not-usually-eatable parts of an animal (not considered "meat"). They're also all parts that would be considered important by a maker of pen, ink, and paper.

--Dan'l

On Wed, 23 Feb 2005 20:05:04 -0500, James Wynn <thewynns at earthlink.net> wrote:
I had just sat down to post something about this and looky here...

Stone Ox wrote:

I'm not arguing with him (yet).

You haven't yet. The Amazon search copy (even the one linked from the hardback edition) has the page numbers from the mass market paperback.

Yeah. I was able to find with the quote you provided. I missed it the first time through. It had a ">" at the start of if and I took for part of my post. Sorry about that. And thanks for the quote.

And my last post came off more peevish than I intended. I'm working a lot of hours lately. Sorry 'bout that too. It might have contributed to the peevishness of Roy's post, but I'm not sure about that.

Now as for that quote:

"... Within that point of light [the Whorl] Sinew had been conceived, in all probability, in the Calde's Palace. It did not seem possible." pg 430

That's a very good point and I don't have a ready answer for it.

However, when I was shaving this morning I remembered something about that

"timeline problem" in the SS that I mentioned in my post. When I was reading the SS, I could not get the idea that Sinew's name seemed all wrong for Horn's son, but worked quite well for SILK's son. A sinew is a kind of thread and so is silk. And both names start with the same letter. But Horn gave a description of the timeline of Sinew's birth that made me convinced (aside from the normal disinclination's to the theory) that it was impossible for Silk to be Sinew's father. Now Roy has reminded me of a reference I had forgotten about that puts Silk back on the spot.

Now Roy (if I'm at all familiar with Roy and I am) will hit the roof at this. But (mournings glory's assurances aside) Sinew's name has always smelled suspicious to me. I suppose when I get back to Texas, I'll have re-read the LS and SS just to find the timeline problem that puts Sinew's conception outside of the Whorl.

Oh, before anyone mentions it, I'm well aware that Horn says Sinew looks exactly like him -- "devilishly" so (devilishly? Why should it be surprising at all?). But that doesn't surprise me in the least even if Sinew is not Horn's natural son, for reasons I'll be better able to explain if I can decide -- to the degree of certainty that Roy has -- who Sinew's bio-dad is.

~ Crush

Philip Loguinov — 23 Feb 2005, 18:42 · in reply to Dan'I Danehy-Oakes

Hi, this is my first post here, and it's a shame I don't have time to say more :)

"... Within that point of light [the Whorl] Sinew had been conceived, in all probability, in the Calde's Palace. It did not seem possible."

In all probability. It did not seem possible. Especially by wolfe standards, this doesn't seem like very good evidence to place Sinew's conception. With so many things the narrator is certain of being false, how can we use as fact the conjectures even he doubts? I think all this quote tells us is that Horn doesn't actually know when Sinew was conceived.

[] Philip Loguinov
[] philipov at gmail.com
[] www.livejournal.com/users/philipov

James Wynn — 24 Feb 2005, 14:32 · in reply to Philip Loguinov

"... Within that point of light [the Whorl] Sinew had been conceived, in all probability, in the Calde's Palace. It did not seem possible."

In all probability. It did not seem possible. Especially by wolfe standards, this doesn't seem like very good evidence to place Sinew's conception. With so many things the narrator is certain of being false, how can we use as fact the conjectures even he doubts? I think all this quote tells us is that Horn doesn't actually know when Sinew was conceived.

Philip Loguinov

My personal inclination (not ready to offer a proof yet) is that Sinew was conceived on the Whorl, probably in the Calde's Palace. But not as simply as any of us were conceived.

~ Crush