

Famous monsters

The Urth list — 3 messages, 3 voices, 20 Jul 2006

<https://urth.darkrealm.vip/thread/urth/4667>

Exported from an unofficial mirror of a public mailing list. Copyright in each message remains with the person who wrote it. Email addresses are obscured as `user at host`, the form the original archive published. This file was rebuilt from parsed fields rather than retained headers, so it is faithful in content but not byte-exact.

Tony Ellis — 20 Jul 2006, 18:13

I wrote:
in The Sword of the
Lictor, chapter XXXV, Dr Talos alludes to Mary Shelley's Frankenstein.

And b_sharp:

But I think Talos' statement refers to the legend Llibio has recently told
Severian, about a small man from the south and the building of the castle
and an evil giant, a legend which Severian has just told Talos.

No, it's definitely Frankenstein :-). Dr Talos says "our own shadows race into the past to trouble mankind's dreams." What's the one thing everyone knows about the writing of Frankenstein? That the idea came to Mary Shelley in a troubled dream.

Where did Mary Shelley have this dream? In a villa on the shore of a beautiful lake. Where are Dr Talos, Severian and Baldanders? On the shore of a beautiful lake.

If Talos
was really referring directly to the Frankenstein book then he is saying
the
Baldanders story travelled back in time to Mary Shelly; then we are
again
saying Earth is in the past of Urth.

Certainly that *an* Earth is in the past of Urth, yes. A world quite excruciating similar to ours in all sorts of ways. For my money it *is* our Earth, but that's an argument for a different post.

David Duffy — 21 Jul 2006, 00:08 · in reply to Tony Ellis

On Thu, 20 Jul 2006, Tony Ellis wrote:
I wrote:
in The Sword of the
Lictor, chapter XXXV, Dr Talos alludes to Mary Shelley's Frankenstein.

And b_sharp:

But I think Talos' statement refers to the legend Llibio has recently
No, it's definitely Frankenstein :-). Dr Talos says "our own shadows race into the past to trouble mankind's dreams." What's the one thing

I see this also as a nod to _Childhood's End_

David Duffy.

b sharp — 21 Jul 2006, 13:13 · follows David Duffy

Regarding Dr. Talos' allusion, Tony Ellis writes:

No, it's definitely Frankenstein :-). Dr Talos says "our own shadows race into the past to trouble >mankind's dreams." What's the one thing everyone knows about the writing of Frankenstein? >That the idea came to Mary Shelley in a troubled dream. Where did Mary Shelley have this dream? >In a villa on the shore of a beautiful lake. Where are Dr Talos, Severian and Baldanders? On the shore of a beautiful lake.

Actually I didn't know about the dream and the villa and the lake. I think that is very interesting and pertinent and appreciate the filling of my knowledge gap.

However, I let something slide regarding your initial post that I must address now. In the Urth before Earth thread I suggested there were only two direct quotes from Earth books in BotNS. An allusion is quite a different thing. An allusion is a literary device that can allow an author to make references directly to the reader without the speaking character actually being aware of the reference source.

But if a character quotes directly from a literary source it means the character has actually read (or been exposed to) that source within the storyline. I think there is little doubt that Wolfe is alluding to Frankenstein here but I'm not so certain that Dr. Talos has read Mary Shelley. Shadows of legends and dreams may have passed between them but has actual text been shared?

In contrast, direct quotes suggest that Marie of the Jungle Hut has read The Bible and Jonas has read Lewis Carroll.

Perhaps I am missing your main point, which is to suggest the Talos-Frankenstein passage is evidence that Earth is in Urth's past? If so, I agree. However I am currently swayed more by the counter-evidence, e.g. that Marie (and her Bible), found in the upper level of a time structure, is in the future.

-bsharp

-bsharp