

# Clute's Interpretation of Severian Becoming the Autarch

The Urth list — 3 messages, 3 voices, 11 Jul 2007

<https://urth.darkrealm.vip/thread/urth/4879>

Exported from an unofficial mirror of a public mailing list. Copyright in each message remains with the person who wrote it. Email addresses are obscured as `user at host`, the form the original archive published. This file was rebuilt from parsed fields rather than retained headers, so it is faithful in content but not byte-exact.

---

E — 11 Jul 2007, 21:34

Hello,

I was reading one of Clute's reviews (<http://www.scifi.com/sfw/issue133/excess.html>) and in it he mentions that Severian is a liar, implying he assumes the role of Autarch in an underhanded manner through murder. Does anyone know what Clute's exact argument is, and what evidence he uses to support it? Because if this is true then it really changes what I thought about the story... I know Severian routinely lies or purposefully omits details, so that does make him a "liar", but if he is completely lying about over-taking the Autarchy, that makes him a much greater liar than I imagined.

I have spent a good amount of time reading through these forums and Google-searching for Clute's interpretation on this matter, but can't find anything. I have looked quite a while. Also, unfortunately, my library doesn't have copies of Clute's "Encyclopedia of Science Fiction" or "Scores" works (although I'm not even sure if they would be able to answer my question.)

Does anyone have any insight into this?

Best,

- Adam

---

Dan'l Danehy-Oakes — 12 Jul 2007, 02:35 · in reply to E

Adam,

I don't see there anything about murder. Clute does say that Sev is concealing (something important about) how he came to be the Autarch, but, really, what he does do -- cut the old Autarch's skull open and eat his brains -- seems quite bad enough.

--Dan'l

On 7/11/07, E <euth82 at gmail.com> wrote:

Hello,

I was reading one of Clute's reviews (<http://www.scifi.com/sfw/issue133/excess.html>) and in it he mentions that Severian is a liar, implying he assumes the role of Autarch in an underhanded manner through murder. Does anyone know what Clute's exact argument is, and what evidence he uses to support it? Because if this is true then it really changes what I thought about the story... I know Severian routinely lies or purposefully omits details, so that does make him a "liar", but if he is completely lying about over-taking the Autarchy, that makes him a much greater liar than I

imagined.

I have spent a good amount of time reading through these forums and Google-searching for Clute's interpretation on this matter, but can't find anything. I have looked quite a while. Also, unfortunately, my library doesn't have copies of Clute's "Encyclopedia of Science Fiction" or "Scores" works (although I'm not even sure if they would be able to answer my question.)

Does anyone have any insight into this?

Best,

- Adam

---

---

Tim Walters — 12 Jul 2007, 06:09 · in reply to Dan'l Danehy-Oakes

Dan'l Danehy-Oakes wrote:

Clute does say that Sev

is concealing (something important about) how he came to be the Autarch,

Specifically, that the Autarch was Catherine, his mother. See the last essay in \_Strokes\_.

Tim Walters | The Doubtful Palace | <http://doubtfulpalace.com>