

# second dream team

The Urth list — 22 messages, 8 voices, 18 Sep 2008

<https://urth.darkrealm.vip/thread/urth/5147>

Exported from an unofficial mirror of a public mailing list. Copyright in each message remains with the person who wrote it. Email addresses are obscured as `user at host`, the form the original archive published. This file was rebuilt from parsed fields rather than retained headers, so it is faithful in content but not byte-exact.

---

Marc Aramini — 18 Sep 2008, 00:43

In response to Pedro - Yes, I have felt since short sun came out that the ghost of pike was a future version of Silk. Oreb appears as a human spirit because he is embued with scylla, babbie appears as human because he is the beast with three horns that horn's spirit flees into.

I met so much resistance to the idea that astral ravel could be time travel but I feel that the presence in the old lady's story is compelling enough for me.

---

Marc Aramini — 18 Sep 2008, 19:58 · follows Marc Aramini

pedro, the exit of horn into babbie is more than riding. He reposes under a huge tree, the vanished gods of the neighbors, and this allows his transference as he was earlier transferred into silk's body. He says goodbye to everyone because he knows he is leaving. read the last ten pages of on blue's water and see where suddenly he turns positive like silk. then look at how babbie reacts when horn's son is in danger on one of the astral visits in rttw. he tries to say huh huh huh and point at himself because he is horn, and he throws the guy down who is violent toward his son.

Also, the greenhouse of the island pit is important - the trees will hybridize with people, creating the neighbor Horn who makes a deal with Horn, after he is eaten by a tree - the pit is the belly of the tree and the manner in which it recombines with other life - read the first chapter on corn hybrids again.

---

Pedro Pereira — 18 Sep 2008, 22:10 · in reply to Marc Aramini

Wow...I guess I missed a few things and have to get back to the books again...

Pedro

---

James Wynn — 19 Sep 2008, 01:00 · in reply to Pedro Pereira

Marc said:

Also, the greenhouse of the island pit is important - the trees will hybridize with people, creating the neighbor Horn who makes a deal with Horn, after he is eaten by a tree - the pit is the belly of the tree and the manner in which it recombines with other life - read the first chapter on corn hybrids again.

I say:

Having considered your theory for a few years now, I am convinced that the hybridizing conversation does in fact refer to the need for a merging of the Neighbors with the Earthlings in order for the colonies to survive...and Horn, as a Christ-figure, was that merging. But I am certain he was not eaten by the tree. It's not the tree, its the greenbuck.  
<http://lists.urth.net/htdig.cgi/urth-urth.net/2004-December/004360.html>

---

Matthew Groves — 19 Sep 2008, 15:20 · in reply to Marc Aramini

On Thu, Sep 18, 2008 at 2:58 PM, Marc Aramini <marcaramini at yahoo.com> wrote:  
read the first chapter on corn hybrids again.

Wasn't there an article written by a list member on corn hybridization and its significance to Short Sun? Can someone give the link to that? Is Wolfe doing a word play between "horn" and "corn" (\*corno\* being Italian for Horn -- with similar cognates in many languages)?

---

Marc Aramini — 19 Sep 2008, 15:48 · follows Matthew Groves

This is probably my article, which M. Wynn was kind enough to host all these years.

<http://www.urth.org/whorlmap/chras-writers/marc-aramini1.htm>

also, cornsilk is a common phrase which makes the italian near cognate interesting.

---

Ranjit Bhatnagar — 19 Sep 2008, 16:05 · in reply to Marc Aramini

Not really all that relevant, but it occurs to me that Corn would be a gender-ambiguous name in Viron.

-ranjit

On Fri, Sep 19, 2008 at 11:48 AM, Marc Aramini <marcaramini at yahoo.com> wrote:  
This is probably my article, which M. Wynn was kind enough to host all these years.

<http://www.urth.org/whorlmap/chras-writers/marc-aramini1.htm>

also, cornsilk is a common phrase which makes the italian near cognate interesting.

---

Dave Tallman — 22 Sep 2008, 12:07 · in reply to Marc Aramini

Marc,

Your article is fascinating and I agree with nearly all of it except for the "Urth is Green" which seems to me a stretch too far. (I know that Gene Wolfe once said this, but I believe it was an engineering joke about ground wires).

Those who don't accept this part of the theory need an alternate explanation for the extreme compatibility of Neighbors/inhumi/Blue life with humans. They are blood-eating and soul-copying compatible (inhumi), "change-blood" compatible (shearbears), and "hybrid" compatible (Horn as a Neighbor-man, whatever that process entails).

Blue or Green being Urth is only one possible explanation. Here are some others:

- 1) Settlement long ago by human colonists using FTL travel. Typhon might or might not have known of this, perhaps intending an invasion rather than a fresh colony.
- 2) Time-travel, such that the Neighbors derive from the present Whorl colonists.
- 3) Parallel evolution. The doubled-limbed character of the life forms does suggest they are

different. Hybridization that doubles genes wouldn't automatically double limbs.

This is probably my article, which M. Wynn was kind enough to host all these years.

<http://www.urth.org/whorlmap/chras-writers/marc-aramini1.htm>

also, cornsilk is a common phrase which makes the italian near cognate interesting.

---

Pedro Pereira — 22 Sep 2008, 13:49 · in reply to Dave Tallman

Regarding point 3) we have to take into account that Wolfe's stories are not strictly hard sci-fi plausible in many points. You are correct that doubling-genes doesn't mean doubling limbs, not to mention that we are talking about completely different biochemistries and biologies and I pretty much doubt it would be so easy to cross two or more alien species so "simply". The same can be said of the blood-drinking inhumani, which assumes that alien blood can be drunk with no problems, when veins and blood as we know it is only common to the animal kingdom on Earth (which makes up such a minor percentage of the total number of species). So some liberties have to be taken into account. I would consider Wolfe's books more like Science-Fantasy — la Flash Gordon than anything else, albeit quite more deep than those and at a completely different level.

Pedro

---

Dan'l Danehy-Oakes — 22 Sep 2008, 15:58 · in reply to Dave Tallman

On Mon, Sep 22, 2008 at 5:07 AM, Dave Tallman <davetallman at msn.com> wrote:

Blue or Green being Urth is only one possible explanation. Here are some others:

- 1) Settlement long ago by human colonists using FTL travel. Typhon might or might not have known of this, perhaps intending an invasion rather than a fresh colony.
- 2) Time-travel, such that the Neighbors derive from the present Whorl colonists.
- 3) Parallel evolution. The doubled-limbed character of the life forms does suggest they are different. Hybridization that doubles genes wouldn't automatically double limbs.

4) In a universe with a Creator, where evolution is guided by the Creator's will, all life on all worlds may be compatible in this sense.

Dan'l Danehy-Oakes, writer, trainer, bon vivant

-----

<http://www.livejournal.com/users/sturgeonslawyer>

<http://www.danehyoakes.com>

I once absend-mindedly ordered Three Mile Island dressing in a restaurant and, with great presence of mind, they brought Thousand Island Dressing and a bottle of chili sauce. -- T. Pratchett

---

Pedro Pereira — 22 Sep 2008, 16:01 · in reply to Dan'l Danehy-Oakes

If they're not even compatible on Earth (Urth) why would they be among alien worlds?

Pedro

4) In a universe with a Creator, where evolution is guided by the Creator's will, all life on all

worlds may be compatible in this sense.-- Dan'l Danehy-Oakes, writer, trainer, bon vivant-----<http://www.livejournal.com/users/sturgeonslawyer><http://www.danehyoakes.com> I once absend-mindedly ordered Three Mile Island dressing in a restaurant and, with great presence of mind, they brought Thousand Island Dressing and a bottle of chili sauce. -- T. Pratchett

---

brunians at brunians.org — 22 Sep 2008, 19:05 · in reply to Dan'l Danehy-Oakes

4) In a universe with a Creator, where evolution is guided by the Creator's will, all life on all worlds may be compatible in this sense.

All life here isn't.

It may be that there are a limited number of possibilities: I don't see how this makes it necessary for there to be a Creator.

.

---

Dan'l Danehy-Oakes — 22 Sep 2008, 19:15 · in reply to brunians at brunians.org

Ummm. I'm moving in the reverse direction: we know that the Briahverse *\*does\** have a Creator; given that, it does not seem unreasonable for Him to arrange for life to be compatible \_in the sense we were talking about\_.

On Mon, Sep 22, 2008 at 12:05 PM, <brunians at brunians.org> wrote:

4) In a universe with a Creator, where evolution is guided by the Creator's will, all life on all worlds may be compatible in this sense.

All life here isn't.

It may be that there are a limited number of possibilities: I don't see how this makes it necessary for there to be a Creator.

.

---

brunians at brunians.org — 22 Sep 2008, 20:23 · in reply to Dan'l Danehy-Oakes

So you are arguing that all life that is native to Urth is compatible \_in the sense that we are talking about\_?

For instance, mollusks and vertebrates, here in this world, both have blood. The blood of vertebrates is based upon iron: the blood of mollusks is based upon copper. Are you saying that it is different on Urth, then? That the two kingdoms use the same kind of blood?

If I understand you correctly, you are arguing that *\*this\** World here does not have a creator.

.

Ummm. I'm moving in the reverse direction: we know that the Briahverse \*does\* have a Creator; given that, it does not seem unreasonable for Him to arrange for life to be compatible \_in the sense we were talking about\_.

On Mon, Sep 22, 2008 at 12:05 PM, <brunians at brunians.org> wrote:

4) In a universe with a Creator, where evolution is guided by the Creator's will, all life on all worlds may be compatible in this sense.

All life here isn't.

It may be that there are a limited number of possibilities: I don't see how this makes it necessary for there to be a Creator.

.

---

Dan'l Danehy-Oakes — 22 Sep 2008, 20:46 · in reply to brunians at brunians.org

On Mon, Sep 22, 2008 at 1:23 PM, <brunians at brunians.org> wrote:  
So you are arguing that all life that is native to Urth is compatible \_in the sense that we are talking about\_?

For instance, mollusks and vertebrates, here in this world, both have blood. The blood of vertebrates is based upon iron: the blood of mollusks is based upon copper. Are you saying that it is different on Urth, then? That the two kingdoms use the same kind of blood?

If I understand you correctly, you are arguing that \*this\* World here does not have a creator.

That would be a very odd thing for me, as an adult convert to Catholicism, to argue!

I will point out, to begin with, that at least some of those copper-blooded mollusks are edible by iron-blooded humans. I don't particularly care for them myself, but there it is. We couldn't accept a blood transfusion from a lobster, but then I suspect it would be touch-and-go (at best) with blood from a chimp.

I am not suggesting that the Briahverse's Creator made all life of interchangeable parts. Rather, I am suggesting that He made it sufficiently "compatible" that life from one world can eat at least some of the life from another.

Thus, for example, the Alzabo...

Dan'l Danehy-Oakes, writer, trainer, bon vivant

-----

<http://www.livejournal.com/users/sturgeonslawyer>

<http://www.danehyoakes.com>

I once absend-mindedly ordered Three Mile Island dressing in a restaurant

and, with great presence of mind, they brought Thousand Island Dressing and a bottle of chili sauce. -- T. Pratchett

---

Pedro Pereira — 22 Sep 2008, 20:53 · in reply to Dan'l Danehy-Oakes

I don't think it's the eating part that is the problem (it could or could not be a problem, depending on what form of life are we talking about). It's the mix n' go genetics. Ain't happening and there is no credibility whatsoever of creating hybrids like in the books.

But again, Wolfe's books are not stric science anyway. It's the ideas (and lovely they are) that count here.

By the way, I love moluscs.

Pedro

Date: Mon, 22 Sep 2008 13:46:42 -0700From: danldo at gmail.comTo: urth at lists.urth.netSubject: Re: (urth) second dream team  
On Mon, Sep 22, 2008 at 1:23 PM, <brunians at brunians.org> wrote:

So you are arguing that all life that is native to Urth is compatible \_inthe sense that we are talking about\_?For instance, mollusks and vertebrates, here in this world, both haveblood. The blood of vertebrates is based upon iron: the blood of mollusksis based upon copper. Are you saying that it is different on Urth, then?That the two kingdoms use the same kind of blood?If I understand you correctly, you are arguing that \*this\* World here doesnot have a creator.That would be a very odd thing for me, as an adult convert to Catholicism, to argue!I will point out, to begin with, that at least some of those copper-blooded mollusks are edible by iron-blooded humans. I don't particularly care forthem myself, but there it is. We couldn't accept a blood transfusion froma lobster, but then I suspect it would be touch-and-go (at best) with bloodfrom a chimp.I am not suggesting that the Briahverse's Creator made all life ofinterchangeable parts. Rather, I am suggesting that He made itsufficiently "compatible" that life from one world can eat at leastsome of the life from another.Thus, for example, the Alzabo...-- Dan'l Danehy-Oakes, writer, trainer, bon vivant----<http://www.livejournal.com/users/sturgeonslawyer><http://www.danehyoakes.com>I once absend-mindedly ordered Three Mile Island dressing in a restaurant and, with great presence of mind, they brought Thousand Island Dressing and a bottle of chili sauce. -- T. Pratchett

---

brunians at brunians.org — 22 Sep 2008, 22:10 · in reply to Pedro Pereira

I don't think it's the eating part that is the problem (it could or could not be a problem, depending on what form of life are we talking about). It's the mix n' go genetics. Ain't happening and there is no credibility whatsoever of creating hybrids like in the books.

This is what I think also.

But again, Wolfe's books are not stric science anyway. It's the ideas (and lovely they are) that count here.

Yes.

By the way, I love moluscs.

Me too. But I wouldn't want a blood transfusion from one.

.

---

Marc Aramini — 22 Sep 2008, 23:04 · follows brunians at brunians.org

It seems to me that the special genetic nature of the possibly artificially created vanished gods is that they can eat and reassemble the genetic material of their victims as a sort of template like the alzabo. rather makes their children waste products, but that is perhaps not pertinent. I read the story as one in which a sentience arose somehow in this vegetative substrate and was contaminated and overthrown by the liana parasites, leeching the sentience from their host, as well as the ability to transmute themselves into a likeness of their food. Remember that at one point silk reflects that "we" are the vanished people.

---

Pedro Pereira — 22 Sep 2008, 23:14 · in reply to Marc Aramini

That can surely be Wolfe's intention. All I say is that it is not real science and the problem only exists when people want to justify it using real world biochemistry. Wolfe is basically using some biological rules but not really limiting it to the realm of plausibility. Not that it takes any value from Wolfe's books at all, mind you. As I said, his books are more like Flash Gordon on intellectual steroids.

"Remember that at one point silk reflects that "we" are the vanished people."

Don't remember that. Can you quote?

---

James Wynn — 23 Sep 2008, 01:52 · in reply to Pedro Pereira

Pedro said:

"That can surely be Wolfe's intention. All I say is that it is not real science and the problem only exists when people want to justify it using real world biochemistry. Wolfe is basically using some biological rules but not really limiting it to the realm of plausibility. Not that it takes any value from Wolfe's books at all, mind you. As I said, his books are more like Flash Gordon on intellectual steroids."

I say:

Once when people argued that the giant god that the Raja spoke to in RttW was not biologically possible, Wolfe responded that that only meant that the god was not constructed the same way as we are. He said he was impatient with arguments about what is and is not possible in biology.

J

---

Pedro Pereira — 23 Sep 2008, 10:11 · in reply to James Wynn

The Godlings are beyings sent by Mainframe. They are probably genetically engineered artificial creatures used specifically for the needs of mainframe. It's not the same thing as natural alien races that mix half the genetic information from other alien beyings as if it was a Lego game. Heck, it wouldn't be possible even among different species on the same planet that have extremely similar genetics. Genetics simply don't work that way. But again, I don't see a reason to try to justify it at all. It's a neat idea that works very well in the books and since I don't read them as sci-fi in a strict sense it's fine with me.

Pedro

From: crushtv at gmail.com To: urth at lists.urth.net Date: Mon, 22 Sep 2008 20:52:48 -0500 Subject: Re: (urth) second dream team

Pedro said:

"That can surely be Wolfe's intention. All I say is that it is not real science and the problem only exists when people want to justify it using real world biochemistry. Wolfe is basically using some biological rules but not really limiting it to the realm of plausibility. Not that it takes any value from Wolfe's books at all, mind you. As I said, his books are more like Flash Gordon on intellectual steroids."

I say:

Once when people argued that the giant god that the Raja spoke to in RttW was not biologically possible, Wolfe responded that that only meant that the god was not constructed the same way as we are. He said he was impatient with arguments about what is and is not possible in biology.

J

---

James Wynn — 24 Sep 2008, 01:45 · in reply to Dave Tallman

Dave Tallman says:

Blue or Green being Urth is only one possible explanation.

Unfortunately for people like me who find the Urth/Lune = Blue/Green concept appealing, there are three more very glaring alternatives.

1) Wolfe just likes the Blue/Green combination for reasons no one has been able to identify (to my knowledge). We see it in The Fifth Head of Cerberus and in Pandora By Holly Hollander.

2) This is not the only parallel I've noted between tBotSS and tFHoC, so it is worth considering that Blue is St. Croix.

3) Thematically, the reason Blue has multi-limbed monsters is because it is another tip of the hat to Edgar Rice Burroughs. The Short Sun is an homage to Rice's Martian stories just as the Long Sun is an omage to the Pellucidar stories. So as Don Doggett once pointed out, if the Whorl has returned to Sol, then Blue is just as (or more) likely to be Verthandi. Remember that Mars might once have been covered by water, and I suppose one could imagine that it could be again.

J