

Mantis questions Amazon review of LU2

The Urth list — 1 messages, 1 voices, 04 Oct 2008

<https://urth.darkrealm.vip/thread/urth/5164>

Exported from an unofficial mirror of a public mailing list. Copyright in each message remains with the person who wrote it. Email addresses are obscured as `user at host`, the form the original archive published. This file was rebuilt from parsed fields rather than retained headers, so it is faithful in content but not byte-exact.

Roy C. Lackey — 04 Oct 2008, 05:00

I'm just the messenger here.

I don't know if Christopher Culver is still a member of this List or not, but Michael Andre-Driussi asked me to pass along these comments, which I have excerpted.

-Roy

Christopher Culver has added a lightly updated version of his LU review to the LU2 page at Amazon. [...]

Fact check: "swiftly went out of print." Published in 1994, out of print in 2002. Eight years. Hardly swift.

Fact check: regarding name Kim Lee Soong "is said to be Chinese, but clearly it is Korean." True for first edition, false for second edition. See page 202.

In the larger scheme, there is no comparison made between the first edition and the second edition. This, along with the sloppy mistake regarding page 202, strongly suggests that the reviewer has not even seen the second edition, giving the sense that this review is a tired retread of a review for the first edition.

[...]

I'd like someone to tell him about his error regarding page 202, and ask him if he has really looked over the second edition.

=Michael=