

Urth Digest, Vol 51, Issue 76

The Urth list — 2 messages, 2 voices, 28 Nov 2008

<https://urth.darkrealm.vip/thread/urth/5246>

Exported from an unofficial mirror of a public mailing list. Copyright in each message remains with the person who wrote it. Email addresses are obscured as `user at host`, the form the original archive published. This file was rebuilt from parsed fields rather than retained headers, so it is faithful in content but not byte-exact.

David Stockhoff — 28 Nov 2008, 22:42

I'm just now watching the "other" Dune movies---the miniseries---and they are much closer to the text. Really very well done.

The Lynch movie did often seem to miss the point, but I thought it did capture the mysticism of the Kwisatz Haderach/Abomination's visions in a visually poetic manner. I think that's what interested Lynch, who otherwise was drawn to grotesquery and decay, not superhuman evolution.

Weren't the sound weapons in the text?

Message: 2

Date: Fri, 28 Nov 2008 18:06:40 +0000

From: "Son of Witz" <sonofwitz at butcherbaker.org>

Subject: Re: (urth) giants and magic gems and dudes wearing all black

To: "The Urth Mailing List" <urth at lists.urth.net>

Message-ID: <W953554477262961227895600 at webmail22>

Content-Type: text/plain; charset="us-ascii"

what a glorious mess that would have been.

The Lynch work was a mess, though not that glorious. I liked the achieved atmosphere of baroque decadence, but felt that the core of the original work was lost completely, not just that they simplified into childish literalism the messiahnic role of the lead, but that they missed that the core of the thematic threads was the mental and physical improvement of man, by changing the Atreides advantage to a scifi-ish kind of weaponry instead of a superior system of mental and physical conditioning.

that's exactly how I feel about it.
especially changing the mental/physical conditioning to a sound weapon.
lamo.

y'all read The Incal? killer stuff.

Sadly, not in complete form.

while it's not up to snuff with Wolfe, it's a damn good read. some of the alchemical imagery is made manifest in frightfully obvious (and cool) ways.

~witz

Kerry Benton — 29 Nov 2008, 04:37 · in reply to David Stockhoff

They're a whole lot better, I concur...

Lynch did do a good job with the mysticism and the visuals I think. I love the Guild navigators, love the handling of the Harkonnens for the most part, and the worms.

There were no sound weapons in the text, unless you mean Voice, which is also mishandled (IMHO) in both Lynch and the scifi series.

I worry most in adaptations of BOTNS about the handling of anything that appears magical or supernatural... That any film producer/ director/writer would try to explain too much.

My two cents...

-k

Sent from my iPhone

On Nov 28, 2008, at 4:42 PM, David Stockhoff <dstockhoff at verizon.net> wrote:

I'm just now watching the "other" Dune movies---the miniseries---and they are much closer to the text. Really very well done.

The Lynch movie did often seem to miss the point, but I thought it did capture the mysticism of the Kwisatz Haderach/Abomination's visions in a visually poetic manner. I think that's what interested Lynch, who otherwise was drawn to grotesquery and decay, not superhuman evolution.

Weren't the sound weapons in the text?

Message: 2

Date: Fri, 28 Nov 2008 18:06:40 +0000

From: "Son of Witz" <sonofwitz at butcherbaker.org>

Subject: Re: (urth) giants and magic gems and dudes wearing all black

To: "The Urth Mailing List" <urth at lists.urth.net>

Message-ID: <W953554477262961227895600 at webmail22>

Content-Type: text/plain; charset="us-ascii"

what a glorious mess that would have been.

The Lynch work was a mess, though not that glorious. I liked the achieved atmosphere of baroque decadence, but felt that the core of the original work was lost completely, not just that they simplified into childish literalism the messiahnic role of the lead, but that the

missed that the core of the thematic threads was the mental and physical improvement of man, by changing the Atreides advantage to a scifi-ish kind of weaponry instead of a superior system of mental and

physicial conditioning.

that's exactly how I feel about it.

especially changing the mental/physical conditioning to a sound weapon.

lamo.

y'all read The Incal? killer stuff.

Sadly, not in complete form.

while it's not up to snuff with Wolfe, it's a damn good read. some of the alchemical imagery is made manifest in frightfully obvious (and cool) ways.

~witz

avast! Antivirus: Outbound message clean.

Virus Database (VPS): 081128-0, 11/28/2008

Tested on: 11/28/2008 5:42:01 PM

avast! - copyright (c) 1988-2008 ALWIL Software.
