

Long Sun Laughs

The Urth list — 61 messages, 16 voices, 07 Jan 2009

<https://urth.darkrealm.vip/thread/urth/5299>

Exported from an unofficial mirror of a public mailing list. Copyright in each message remains with the person who wrote it. Email addresses are obscured as `user at host`, the form the original archive published. This file was rebuilt from parsed fields rather than retained headers, so it is faithful in content but not byte-exact.

Son of Witz — 07 Jan 2009, 17:22

I'm midway through Lake of the Long Sun, and loving this series so far. At this point, it seems much more straightforward than BotNS, but, of course, there is all sorts of suspicious stuff under the surface.

no spoilers please, I've skipped over all the Long Sun / Silk discussions.

I think I picked up a few already. Somewhere I heard the whorl was a generation starship, and that seems to be, though I don't think you're supposed to know for sure as you're reading it.

Anyway, the reason I wanted to post about it at this point because this book seems also a lot funnier than BotNS.

There is something really hilarious about Dr. Crane's wrapping. The fact that they have to kick it, and flog it, beat it and lash it. too funny. it strikes me as some sort of sublimated twist on self flagellation. I laugh every time he does it, this strange violent pause in the middle of business.

but I laughed my ass off this morning, walking down Cyril Magnin, reading this passage in Lake. "Men and women, made of mud (originally by the Outsider, according to one somewhat doubtful passage in the Writings) turned to dust at last."

"Somewhat doubtful" LOL!!!!!!

I'll spare anyone my speculations at this point, but I am wondering about if there is a difference between the Chrasmatological Writings and the Charismatic Writings, or if "Charismatic" was a typo. At least one point he mentions the Chrasmatists, so I thought maybe wolfe just had a brain-fart that the editors didnt' notice. There's at least one of those in NewSun, typo or brain-fart, regarding the Amphisbaena, where "hand" is written instead of "head"

all right, this post probably isn't useful to anyone, but I had to talk about this book a bit. It's going to be interesting to read the archives here about Long Sun.

Son of Witz — 09 Jan 2009, 19:22 · follows Son of Witz

wow.

the ending of Lake was crazy awesome!

I'm so glad that the false pantheon and the nature of the Whorl CAN'T be the whole mystery, because that was too easy to suss out.

without knowing the rest, I'd say for me, the most profound moment was when Silk looked out the (Loganstone ?) and saw the stars and knew Pas was minor compared to what was out there, and he saw the REAL SUN peeking over the plain of the starcrosser. Great stuff. a gnostic metaphor of a world with a false creator and help from outside that creation. The Real Sun (God) outshining a False Sun (demiurge). beautifully illustrated. I love how he flees, terrified from having seen the real sun.

can't wait to see where this thing goes....

John Watkins — 09 Jan 2009, 19:30 · in reply to Son of Witz

I loved the ending of Lake, too--it's when I moved from liking the books to LOVING them. Just, right in the middle of this sort of religious mystery story, a full on BOND VILLAIN appears and is simultaneously scary and kind of funny and awesome. And then I realized what others have pointed out, which is that the first book is a crime story and the second book is a spy story and Gene is taking genres apart to show he can.

Great stuff. I'm reading this starting sometime next month.

On 1/9/09, Son of Witz <sonofwitz at butcherbaker.org> wrote:

wow.

the ending of Lake was crazy awesome!

I'm so glad that the false pantheon and the nature of the Whorl CAN'T be the whole mystery, because that was too easy to suss out.

without knowing the rest, I'd say for me, the most profound moment was when Silk looked out the (Loganstone ?) and saw the stars and knew Pas was minor compared to what was out there, and he saw the REAL SUN peeking over the plain of the starcrosser. Great stuff. a gnostic metaphor of a world with a false creator and help from outside that creation. The Real Sun (God) outshining a False Sun (demiurge). beautifully illustrated. I love how he flees, terrified from having seen the real sun.

can't wait to see where this thing goes....

rkenneth at nycap.rr.com — 09 Jan 2009, 19:47 · in reply to Son of Witz

Hi, all,

Brand new to the list, and I'm reading Long Sun for the first time, as well. At present, I'm about 200 pages into Calde of the Long Sun and loving it. It's interesting to read the reactions of another reading this series for the first time, as well.

I had the same reaction to the final scenes. By the end of Lake, the story's been kicked up quite a few notches.

---- Son of Witz <sonofwitz at butcherbaker.org> wrote:

wow.

the ending of Lake was crazy awesome!

I'm so glad that the false pantheon and the nature of the Whorl CAN'T be the whole mystery, because that was too easy to suss out.

without knowing the rest, I'd say for me, the most profound moment was when Silk looked out the (Loganstone ?) and saw the stars and knew Pas was minor compared to what was out there, and he saw the REAL SUN peeking over the plain of the starcrosser. Great stuff. a gnostic metaphor of a world with a false creator and help from outside that creation. The Real Sun (God) outshining a False Sun (demiurge). beautifully illustrated. I love how he flees, terrified from having seen the real sun.

can't wait to see where this thing goes....

Son of Witz — 09 Jan 2009, 20:01 · follows rkenneth at nycap.rr.com

hahaha,

yeah, it totally is a Bond Villian. great and ridiculous.

and dude getting chomped by a giant fish? priceless.

you're right about notching up from liking to loving at that point.

and, welcome rkenneth, from another sort of noob.

~witz

-----Original Message-----

From: John Watkins [mailto:john.watkins04 at gmail.com]

Sent: Friday, January 9, 2009 11:30 AM

To: 'The Urth Mailing List'

Subject: Re: (urth) Long Sun Laughs

I loved the ending of Lake, too--it's when I moved from liking the books to LOVING them. Just, right in the middle of this sort of religious mystery story, a full on BOND VILLAIN appears and is simultaneously scary and kind of funny and awesome. And then I realized what others have pointed out, which is that the first book is a crime story and the second book is a spy story and Gene is taking genres apart to show he can.

Great stuff. I'm reading this starting sometime next month.

On 1/9/09, Son of Witz <sonofwitz at butcherbaker.org> wrote:

wow.

the ending of Lake was crazy awesome!

I'm so glad that the false pantheon and the nature of the Whorl CAN'T be the whole mystery, because that was too easy to suss out.

without knowing the rest, I'd say for me, the most profound moment was when Silk looked out the (Loganstone ?) and saw the stars and knew Pas was minor compared to what was out there, and he saw the REAL SUN peeking over the plain of the starcrosser. Great stuff. a gnostic metaphor of a world with a false creator and help from outside that creation. The Real Sun (God) outshining a False Sun (demiurge). beautifully illustrated. I love how he flees, terrified from having seen the real sun.

can't wait to see where this thing goes....

Dave Tallman — 09 Jan 2009, 20:46 · in reply to John Watkins

John Watkins wrote:

I loved the ending of Lake, too--it's when I moved from liking the books to LOVING them. Just, right in the middle of this sort of religious mystery story, a full on BOND VILLAIN appears and is simultaneously scary and kind of funny and awesome. And then I realized what others have pointed out, which is that the first book is a crime story and the second book is a spy story and Gene is taking genres apart to show he can.

I liked "Nightside" too, with Silk as Father Brown and Auk as his Flambeau. Have you seen the article "Five Steps Towards Briah", which continues to track the genres of the next two books

(<http://artsweb.bham.ac.uk/jlaidlow/ultan/briah.htm/poti>)? The next two books (for me) are a political thriller and a war story. The article has a slightly different take.

Stuart Hamm — 09 Jan 2009, 21:01 · in reply to Dave Tallman

That link sounds interesting...but the link won't work for me....any other way to get there?

S

???? Mobile — (415) 786-3624

???? Skype? stuart.hamm

myspace.com/stuhamm

? ??? stuarthamm.net

--- On Fri, 1/9/09, Dave Tallman <davetallman at msn.com> wrote:

From: Dave Tallman <davetallman at msn.com>

Subject: Re: (urth) Long Sun Laughs

To: urth at lists.urth.net

Date: Friday, January 9, 2009, 12:46 PM

John Watkins wrote:

I loved the ending of Lake, too--it's when I moved from liking the books to LOVING them. Just, right in the middle of this sort of religious mystery story, a full on BOND VILLAIN appears and is simultaneously scary and kind of funny and awesome. And then I realized what others have pointed out, which is that the first book is a crime story and the second book is a spy story and Gene is taking genres apart to show he can.

I liked "Nightside" too, with Silk as Father Brown and Auk as his Flambeau. Have you seen the article "Five Steps Towards Briah", which

continues to track the genres of the next two books

(<http://artsweb.bham.ac.uk/jlaidlow/ultan/briah.htm/poti>)? The next two books (for me) are a political thriller and a war story. The article has a slightly different take.

John Watkins — 09 Jan 2009, 21:04 · in reply to Dave Tallman

Yes I have, but as Son of Witz is on this thread (and now rkenneth as well) I didn't want to get into discussion of the next two books, which are also excellent.

But yes, I did pick up on the Father Brown/Flambeau thing (I'm proud to say that I have read every Father Brown mystery), but that wasn't as glorious for me. Wolfe is a metaphysical Catholic writer, so I expect to find Chesterton in his work, just like I expect to find Borges and Kafka for other reasons.

The stuff that blows my mind is the pulpy stuff that sneaks up on you.

"Lake of the Long Sun ends when Silk and Dr. Crane are interrogated by a super-strong android with the consciousness of a dead dictator in it." "The Shadow of the Tortuter ends with Severian travelling with a cyborg, his resurrected grandmother, a variation on Frankenstein's monster with his own android physician who's sort of a Doctor Frankenstein/Igor character, and a scientifically created sex goddess." There's a glorious one in Short Sun too that I don't want to spoil.

On 1/9/09, Dave Tallman <davetallman at msn.com> wrote:
John Watkins wrote:

I loved the ending of Lake, too--it's when I moved from liking the books to LOVING them. Just, right in the middle of this sort of religious mystery story, a full on BOND VILLAIN appears and is simultaneously scary and kind of funny and awesome. And then I realized what others have pointed out, which is that the first book is a crime story and the second book is a spy story and Gene is taking genres apart to show he can.

I liked "Nightside" too, with Silk as Father Brown and Auk as his Flambeau. Have you seen the article "Five Steps Towards Briah", which continues to track the genres of the next two books

(<http://artsweb.bham.ac.uk/jlaidlow/ultan/briah.htm/poti>)?

The next two books (for me) are a political thriller and a war story. The article has a slightly different take.

Son of Witz — 09 Jan 2009, 21:05 · follows John Watkins

<http://www.ultan.org.uk/five-steps-towards-briah/>

I backed up on the url and got a redirect to the newer Ultan.org blog. ~witz

That link sounds interesting...but the link won't work for me....any other way to get there?

S

???? Mobile — (415) 786-3624

???? Skype? stuart.hamm

myspace.com/stuhamm

? ??? stuarthamm.net

--- On Fri, 1/9/09, Dave Tallman <davetallman at msn.com> wrote:

From: Dave Tallman <davetallman at msn.com>

Subject: Re: (urth) Long Sun Laughs

To: urth at lists.urth.net

Date: Friday, January 9, 2009, 12:46 PM

John Watkins wrote:

I loved the ending of Lake, too--it's when I moved from liking the books to LOVING them. Just, right in the middle of this sort of religious mystery story, a full on BOND VILLAIN appears and is simultaneously scary and kind of funny and awesome. And then I realized what others have pointed out, which is that the first book is a crime story and the second book is a spy story and Gene is taking genres apart to show he can.

I liked "Nightside" too, with Silk as Father Brown and Auk as his Flambeau. Have you seen the article "Five Steps Towards Briah", which

continues to track the genres of the next two books

(<http://artsweb.bham.ac.uk/jlaidlow/ultan/briah.htm/poti>)? The next two

books (for me) are a political thriller and a war story. The article has a slightly different take.

Son of Witz — 09 Jan 2009, 21:06 · follows Son of Witz

Yes I have, but as Son of Witz is on this thread (and now rkenneth as well) I didn't want to get into discussion of the next two books, which are also excellent.

MOST APPRECIATED.

Steve McCann — 09 Jan 2009, 21:45 · in reply to Son of Witz

The below comment reminds me of Wolfe talking about fantasy in the interview that was shared recently:

"Things could be different," says fantasy. "They could be very, very different just over that hill. Have hope." http://www.nebulaawards.com/index.php/interview/gene_wolfe

On Fri, Jan 9, 2009 at 12:22 PM, Son of Witz <sonofwitz at butcherbaker.org> wrote:
without knowing the rest, I'd say for me, the most profound moment was when Silk looked out the (Loganstone ?) and saw the stars and knew Pas was minor compared to what was out there, and he saw the REAL SUN peeking over the plain of the starcrosser.

Son of Witz — 21 Jan 2009, 15:16 · in reply to John Watkins

I finished Long Sun the other day.

An excellent book. serious page turner for me, burned through it really fast. too fast, I'm sure, to catch all the hints, but the basic gist doesn't seem that obscure.

the basic gnostic setup is easy enough to read. the Five Steps towards Briah article is very on-point, if you ask me. It hadn't dawned on me until reading that article that each book is a system to be explored (and ultimately discarded). That of the inverted matriarchy of Trivigaunte was easy enough to see. I loved all the genre bending that this creates.

The comic relief is pretty damn funny. They're having these serious discussions and Oreb and the Catachrest keep popping up to color the talks. Always worth a laugh, though I'm not sure I'd agree if it were a movie. The catachrest's speech was often impenetrable to me, as is appropriate to it's name, I guess.

My biggest question throughout the whole book was the nature of Quetzal. I find it interesting that the heads of this church are a feathered serpent and an eel. I can't help but relate this to my feelings (which I've expressed here before, and apologize in advance to the faithful) that the Catholic Church has long been usurped by vampires of sorts. I'm sure I'm not alone in that feeling, and I find it extremely provocative that a devout Catholic would set things up that way. more testament to Wolfe's gutsiness. I can't help but feel that Quetzal was shepherding his flock to Green as food. talk about a blood sacrifice. I assume it was him who got Teasel early on.

I found the narrative device of Horn a bit implausible, but I suppose it's more plausible than something like Mary Shelley's Frankenstein's books within books. Hey, Books within books is a theme of Wolfe's, same as Masks within Masks I guess. That conceit is so much more interesting than the implausibility of a sideline party being able to write an insider's account, so I'll swallow

it.

Hopefully Short Sun will shed some light on all this. Horn's detached writing for the first long chapter is sort of maddening so far. already a much different book than either New or Long.

~witz

On Jan 9, 2009, at 1:04 PM, John Watkins wrote:

Yes I have, but as Son of Witz is on this thread (and now rkenneth as well) I didn't want to get into discussion of the next two books, which are also excellent.

But yes, I did pick up on the Father Brown/Flambeau thing (I'm proud to say that I have read every Father Brown mystery), but that wasn't as glorious for me. Wolfe is a metaphysical Catholic writer, so I expect to find Chesterton in his work, just like I expect to find Borges and Kafka for other reasons.

The stuff that blows my mind is the pulpy stuff that sneaks up on you. "Lake of the Long Sun ends when Silk and Dr. Crane are interrogated by a super-strong android with the consciousness of a dead dictator in it." "The Shadow of the Tortuter ends with Severian travelling with a cyborg, his resurrected grandmother, a variation on Frankenstein's monster with his own android physician who's sort of a Doctor Frankenstein/Igor character, and a scientifically created sex goddess." There's a glorious one in Short Sun too that I don't want to spoil.

On 1/9/09, Dave Tallman <davetallman at msn.com> wrote:

John Watkins wrote:

I loved the ending of Lake, too--it's when I moved from liking the books to LOVING them. Just, right in the middle of this sort of religious mystery story, a full on BOND VILLAIN appears and is simultaneously scary and kind of funny and awesome. And then I realized what others have pointed out, which is that the first book is a crime story and the second book is a spy story and Gene is taking genres apart to show he can.

I liked "Nightside" too, with Silk as Father Brown and Auk as his Flambeau.

Have you seen the article "Five Steps Towards Briah", which continues to

track the genres of the next two books

(<http://artsweb.bham.ac.uk/jlaidlow/ultan/briah.htm/poti>)?

The next two books (for me) are a political thriller and a war story. The

article has a slightly different take.

John Watkins — 21 Jan 2009, 15:23 · in reply to Son of Witz

On Wed, Jan 21, 2009 at 10:16 AM, Son of Witz <sonofwitz at butcherbaker.org> wrote:

My biggest question throughout the whole book was the nature of Quetzal. I find it interesting that the heads of this church are a feathered serpent and an eel. I can't help but relate this to my feelings (which I've

expressed here before, and apologize in advance to the faithful) that the Catholic Church has long been usurped by vampires of sorts. I'm sure I'm not alone in that feeling, and I find it extremely provocative that a devout Catholic would set things up that way. more testament to Wolfe's gutsiness. I can't help but feel that Quetzal was shepherding his flock to Green as food. talk about a blood sacrifice. I assume it was him who got Teasel early on.

I dunno. Had Quetzal ever seen the corpse of one of his own kind? If so, he'd presumably know what would happen and pick the planet he *didn't* want them to go to, right?

Son of Witz — 21 Jan 2009, 15:27 · in reply to John Watkins

On Jan 21, 2009, at 7:23 AM, John Watkins wrote:

On Wed, Jan 21, 2009 at 10:16 AM, Son of Witz <sonofwitz at butcherbaker.org> wrote:

My biggest question throughout the whole book was the nature of Quetzal. I find it interesting that the heads of this church are a feathered serpent and an eel. I can't help but relate this to my feelings (which I've expressed here before, and apologize in advance to the faithful) that the Catholic Church has long been usurped by vampires of sorts. I'm sure I'm not alone in that feeling, and I find it extremely provocative that a devout Catholic would set things up that way. more testament to Wolfe's gutsiness. I can't help but feel that Quetzal was shepherding his flock to Green as food. talk about a blood sacrifice. I assume it was him who got Teasel early on.

I dunno. Had Quetzal ever seen the corpse of one of his own kind? If so, he'd presumably know what would happen and pick the planet he didn't want them to go to, right?

So, you're saying the Monitor decided, after seeing his corpse, to change course. i thought that was vague, but yeah... but did he know he was gonna die? I should read that again.

John Watkins — 21 Jan 2009, 15:29 · in reply to Son of Witz

I thought Horn was explicit about the monitor changing course based on the corpse.

On Wed, Jan 21, 2009 at 10:27 AM, Son of Witz <sonofwitz at butcherbaker.org> wrote:

On Jan 21, 2009, at 7:23 AM, John Watkins wrote:

On Wed, Jan 21, 2009 at 10:16 AM, Son of Witz <sonofwitz at butcherbaker.org> wrote:

My biggest question throughout the whole book was the nature of Quetzal. I find it interesting that the heads of this church are a feathered serpent and an eel. I can't help but relate this to my feelings (which I've expressed here before, and apologize in advance to the faithful) that the Catholic Church has long been usurped by vampires of sorts. I'm sure I'm not alone in that feeling, and I find it extremely provocative that a devout Catholic would set things up that way. more testament to Wolfe's gutsiness. I can't help but feel that Quetzal was shepherding his flock to Green as food. talk about a blood sacrifice. I assume it was him who got Teasel early on.

I dunno. Had Quetzal ever seen the corpse of one of his own kind? If so,

he'd presumably know what would happen and pick the planet he didn't want them to go to, right?

So, you're saying the Monitor decided, after seeing his corpse, to change course. i thought that was vague, but yeah...
but did he know he was gonna die? I should read that again.

Son of Witz — 21 Jan 2009, 15:39 · in reply to John Watkins

just reread it. it's not oblique. the monitor changed course.
but I don't think that alone is enough to deny that Quetzal might have been trying to send them to the Inumu (inhumi). I'll be reading Short Sun with that question in mind. How would he know he would die and be overruled by a servant? call it a lack of shrewdness on his deathbed.
anyway, unless some other answer supplants that, I'll stick with it, because it's loaded and appropriate to the themes. ~witz

On Jan 21, 2009, at 7:29 AM, John Watkins wrote:
I thought Horn was explicit about the monitor changing course based on the corpse.

On Wed, Jan 21, 2009 at 10:27 AM, Son of Witz <sonofwitz at butcherbaker.org> wrote:

On Jan 21, 2009, at 7:23 AM, John Watkins wrote:

On Wed, Jan 21, 2009 at 10:16 AM, Son of Witz <sonofwitz at butcherbaker.org> wrote:

My biggest question throughout the whole book was the nature of Quetzal. I find it interesting that the heads of this church are a feathered serpent and an eel. I can't help but relate this to my feelings (which I've expressed here before, and apologize in advance to the faithful) that the Catholic Church has long been usurped by vampires of sorts. I'm sure I'm not alone in that feeling, and I find it extremely provocative that a devout Catholic would set things up that way. more testament to Wolfe's gutsiness. I can't help but feel that Quetzal was shepherding his flock to Green as food. talk about a blood sacrifice. I assume it was him who got Teasel early on.

I dunno. Had Quetzal ever seen the corpse of one of his own kind?
If so, he'd presumably know what would happen and pick the planet he didn't want them to go to, right?

So, you're saying the Monitor decided, after seeing his corpse, to change course. i thought that was vague, but yeah...
but did he know he was gonna die? I should read that again.

John Watkins — 21 Jan 2009, 15:57 · in reply to Son of Witz

On Wed, Jan 21, 2009 at 10:39 AM, Son of Witz <sonofwitz at butcherbaker.org> wrote:
just reread it. it's not oblique. the monitor changed course.
but I don't think that alone is enough to deny that Quetzal might have been

trying to send them to the Inumu (inhumi).

Me either. I do think it throws it into doubt, though. Quetzal was either a sort of false prophet luring people to their deaths or a vampire who came to love the people he cared for--I'm still not sure which, or that Wolfe wants it to be clear.

How would he know he would die and be overruled by a servant? call it a lack of shrewdness on his deathbed.

His corpse was hideous. People were freaking out about it. If he knew that, he wouldn't assume the monitor would overrule his decision--he'd assume that EVERYONE would collectively realize that doing what he asked was a Very Bad Idea. The surprising part, to him, might have been Remora talking the others into trusting Quetzal anyway.

anyway, unless some other answer supplants that, I'll stick with it, because it's loaded and appropriate to the themes.
~witz

On Jan 21, 2009, at 7:29 AM, John Watkins wrote:

I thought Horn was explicit about the monitor changing course based on the corpse.

On Wed, Jan 21, 2009 at 10:27 AM, Son of Witz <sonofwitz at butcherbaker.org> wrote:

On Jan 21, 2009, at 7:23 AM, John Watkins wrote:

On Wed, Jan 21, 2009 at 10:16 AM, Son of Witz <sonofwitz at butcherbaker.org> wrote:

My biggest question throughout the whole book was the nature of Quetzal. I find it interesting that the heads of this church are a feathered serpent and an eel. I can't help but relate this to my feelings (which I've expressed here before, and apologize in advance to the faithful) that the Catholic Church has long been usurped by vampires of sorts. I'm sure I'm not alone in that feeling, and I find it extremely provocative that a devout Catholic would set things up that way. more testament to Wolfe's gutsiness. I can't help but feel that Quetzal was shepherding his flock to Green as food. talk about a blood sacrifice. I assume it was him who got Teasel early on.

I dunno. Had Quetzal ever seen the corpse of one of his own kind? If so, he'd presumably know what would happen and pick the planet he didn't want them to go to, right?

So, you're saying the Monitor decided, after seeing his corpse, to change course. i thought that was vague, but yeah...
but did he know he was gonna die? I should read that again.

Jeffrey Brent McBeth — 21 Jan 2009, 15:59 · in reply to Son of Witz

On Wed, Jan 21, 2009 at 07:39:24AM -0800, Son of Witz wrote:
How would he know he would die and be overruled by a servant? call it a lack of shrewdness on his deathbed.

Or he was shrewdly betraying his people.
Not unheard of.

"The man who does not read good books has no advantage over
the man who cannot read them."
-- Mark Twain

O'Donnell, Tim BOSI — 21 Jan 2009, 16:08 · follows Jeffrey Brent McBeth

On the matter of Long Sun laughs (and I don't have the text to hand) but I remember a wonderful passage:

Silk is in his room brooding. Oreb interrupts him with "Silk Good. Fish heads?". Oreb's God ignored him and stared out the window.

OK, that is a brutal description of the scene but it made me laugh aloud. I will dig out the text tonight.

On the whole monitor changing direction discussion, weird, I was just going through the archives today and came across people discussing this point.

I would align with this idea (thanks to Mantis):

Well the contexts (being a polite intercity telecom service unit versus being the controlling intelligence for a planetary landing vehicle) are different enough that, even if the monitors are virtually identical (i.e., more similar than a tv and a computer display), they would have room to act differently.

<http://www.urth.net/whorl/archives/v0007/0525.shtml>

Something that occurred to me recently, Mucor has a power to project her thoughts. Typhon in BOTNS is able to sense things in some kind of ESP way as well.

Idle speculation but is there a connection?

Is Typhon's power natural or something cooked up for him by Urth scientists, or by some form of alien invention?

Is Mucor related to Typhon? Or was Mucor's ability based on Typhon's ability (some kind of genetic engineering based on Typhon's DNA?)

Who knows? But I am re-reading BOTNS at the moment and will pay particular attention to the Typhon chapter to see if I can un-urth any evidence...

Find out more about us at www.bankofscotland.ie <<http://www.bankofscotland.ie>>

The information contained in this message is confidential and is intended for the addressee only. If you have received this message in error or there are any problems please notify the originator immediately. The unauthorised use, disclosure, copying or alteration of this message is strictly forbidden. This mail and any attachments have been scanned for viruses prior to leaving Bank of Scotland Ireland's network.

Bank of Scotland Ireland will not be liable for direct, special, indirect or consequential damages arising from alteration of the contents of this message by a third party or as a result of any virus being passed on. Bank of Scotland (Ireland) reserves the right to monitor and record e-mail messages sent to and from this address for the purposes of investigating or detecting any unauthorised use of its system and ensuring its effective operation.

Bank of Scotland (Ireland) Limited is part of HBOS plc and is regulated by the Financial Regulator. Registered in Ireland Number: 8545. Registered office: Bank of Scotland House, 124-127 St. Stephens Green, Dublin 2

David Stockhoff — 21 Jan 2009, 16:33 · follows O'Donnell, Tim BOSI

Witz:

I read LS/SS but once, so long ago. Who is the eel to which you refer?

Quetzal is an obvious reference, so I assume you are simply translating a name.

Funny, I don't remember the catachrest. Catachresis is a figure of speech: a word used against its meaning, which can mean a metaphor, an oxymoron, or something resembling a failed metaphor or failed speech. "The king is pregnant!"

Message: 3

Date: Wed, 21 Jan 2009 07:16:31 -0800

From: Son of Witz <sonofwitz at butcherbaker.org>

Subject: Re: (urth) Long Sun Laughs

To: The Urth Mailing List <urth at lists.urth.net>

Message-ID: <BF0AA026-6968-45CC-BEFE-CF06B8DB68F3 at butcherbaker.org>

Content-Type: text/plain; charset=US-ASCII; format=flowed; delsp=yes

I finished Long Sun the other day.

An excellent book. serious page turner for me, burned through it really fast.

too fast, I'm sure, to catch all the hints, but the basic gist doesn't seem that obscure.

the basic gnostic setup is easy enough to read. the Five Steps towards Briah article is very on-point, if you ask me. It hadn't dawned on me until reading that article that each book is a system to be explored (and ultimately discarded). That of the inverted matriarchy of Trivigaunte was easy enough to see. I loved all the genre bending that this creates.

The comic relief is pretty damn funny. They're having these serious discussions and Oreb and the Catachrest keep popping up to color the talks.

Always worth a laugh, though I'm not sure I'd agree if it were a movie. The catachrest's speech was often impenetrable to me, as is appropriate to it's name, I guess.

My biggest question throughout the whole book was the nature of Quetzal. I find it interesting that the heads of this church are a feathered serpent and an eel. I can't help but relate this to my feelings (which I've expressed here before, and apologize in advance to the faithful) that the Catholic Church has long been usurped by vampires of sorts. I'm sure I'm not alone in that feeling, and I find it extremely provocative that a devout Catholic would set things up

that way. more testament to Wolfe's gutsiness. I can't help but feel that Quetzal was shepherding his flock to Green as food. talk about a blood sacrifice. I assume it was him who got Teasel early on.

I found the narrative device of Horn a bit implausible, but I suppose it's more plausible than something like Mary Shelley's Frankenstein's books within books. Hey, Books within books is a theme of Wolfe's, same as Masks within Masks I guess. That conceit is so much more interesting than the implausibility of a sideline party being able to write an insider's account, so I'll swallow it.

Hopefully Short Sun will shed some light on all this. Horn's detached writing for the first long chapter is sort of maddening so far. already a much different book than either New or Long.

~witz

David Stockhoff — 21 Jan 2009, 16:39 · follows David Stockhoff

Ah, never mind. Remora, of course.

Regarding magical mental powers---I think you have to assume these have been either manufactured or bred in every human case. Which, may not matter.

Message: 5
Date: Wed, 21 Jan 2009 11:33:01 -0500
From: David Stockhoff <dstockhoff at verizon.net>
Subject: Re: (urth) Long Sun Laughs
To: urth at lists.urth.net
Message-ID: <49774E3D.9050902 at verizon.net>
Content-Type: text/plain; charset=ISO-8859-1; format=flowed

Witz:

I read LS/SS but once, so long ago. Who is the eel to which you refer?

Quetzal is an obvious reference, so I assume you are simply translating a name.

Funny, I don't remember the catachrest. Catachresis is a figure of speech: a word used against its meaning, which can mean a metaphor, an oxymoron, or something resembling a failed metaphor or failed speech. "The king is pregnant!"

O'Donnell, Tim BOSI — 21 Jan 2009, 16:42 · follows David Stockhoff

Well, I had read the books a number of times and the magical mental powers I had taken as part of the given elements of this universe.

It was only on reflection on the similarity between Mucor's power (mind projection) and Typhon's power (mind projection + mental nets to ensnare others + ?) that I wondered at a connection.

There is probably nothing in it though...or nothing I can prove anyway...

David Stockhoff dstockhoff at verizon.net <mailto:urth%40lists.urth.net?Subject=Re%3A%20%28urt
h%29%20Long%20Sun%20Laughs&In-Reply-To=%3C49774FA9.8000106%40verizon.net%3E>
Wed Jan 21 08:39:05 PST 2009

* Previous message: (urth) Long Sun Laughs <011820.html>

* Messages sorted by: [date] <date.html> [thread] <thread.html> [subject] <subject.html> [author] <author.html>

Ah, never mind. Remora, of course.

Regarding magical mental powers---I think you have to assume these have been either manufactured or bred in every human case. Which, may not matter.

Find out more about us at www.bankofscotland.ie <<http://www.bankofscotland.ie>>

The information contained in this message is confidential and is intended for the addressee only. If you have received this message in error or there are any problems please notify the originator immediately. The unauthorised use, disclosure, copying or alteration of this message is strictly forbidden. This mail and any attachments have been scanned for viruses prior to leaving Bank of Scotland Ireland's network.

Bank of Scotland Ireland will not be liable for direct, special, indirect or consequential damages arising from alteration of the contents of this message by a third party or as a result of any virus being passed on. Bank of Scotland (Ireland) reserves the right to monitor and record e-mail messages sent to and from this address for the purposes of investigating or detecting any unauthorised use of its system and ensuring its effective operation.

Bank of Scotland (Ireland) Limited is part of HBOS plc and is regulated by the Financial Regulator. Registered in Ireland Number: 8545. Registered office: Bank of Scotland House, 124-127 St. Stephens Green, Dublin 2

Dan'l Danehy-Oakes — 21 Jan 2009, 16:52 · in reply to O'Donnell, Tim BOSI

It seems obvious to-me that Mucor's body was intended for one of Typhon's children to inhabit when the Whorl reached its intended destination.

On Wed, Jan 21, 2009 at 8:42 AM, O'Donnell, Tim (BOSI)
<Tim.O'Donnell at bankofscotland.ie> wrote:

Well, I had read the books a number of times and the magical mental powers I had taken as part of the given elements of this universe.

It was only on reflection on the similarity between Mucor's power (mind projection) and Typhon's power (mind projection + mental nets to ensnare others + ?) that I wondered at a connection.

There is probably nothing in it though...or nothing I can prove anyway...

David Stockhoff dstockhoff at verizon.net

<mailto:urth%40lists.urth.net?Subject=Re%3A%20%28urth%29%20Long%20Sun%20Laughs&In-Reply-To=%3C49774FA9.8000106%40verizon.net%3E>

Wed Jan 21 08:39:05 PST 2009

Previous message: (urth) Long Sun Laughs <011820.html>

Messages sorted by: [date] <date.html> [thread] <thread.html> [subject] <subject.html> [author] <author.html>

Ah, never mind. Remora, of course.

Regarding magical mental powers---I think you have to assume these have been either manufactured or bred in every human case. Which, may not matter.

Find out more about us at www.bankofscotland.ie

<<http://www.bankofscotland.ie>>

The information contained in this message is confidential and is intended for the addressee only. If you have received this message in error or there are any problems please notify the originator immediately. The unauthorised use, disclosure, copying or alteration of this message is strictly forbidden. This mail and any attachments have been scanned for viruses prior to leaving Bank of Scotland Ireland's network.

Bank of Scotland Ireland will not be liable for direct, special, indirect or consequential damages arising from alteration of the contents of this message by a third party or as a result of any virus being passed on. Bank of Scotland (Ireland) reserves the right to monitor and record e-mail messages sent to and from this address for the purposes of investigating or detecting any unauthorised use of its system and ensuring its effective operation.

Bank of Scotland (Ireland) Limited is part of HBOS plc and is regulated by the Financial Regulator. Registered in Ireland Number: 8545. Registered office: Bank of Scotland House, 124-127 St. Stephens Green, Dublin 2

O'Donnell, Tim BOSI — 21 Jan 2009, 17:05 · follows Dan'I Danehy-Oakes

Agreed, my question is this:

Is Mucor a daughter of Typhon (and Krypiss perhaps? as indicated by her having similar powers to Typhon)?

Or is she an unconnected individual who one of Typhon's children will inhabit (such as Typhon and Piaton)?

Dan'I Danehy-Oakes danldo at gmail.com <mailto:urth%40lists.urth.net?Subject=Re%3A%20%28urth%29%20FW%3A%20Long%20Sun%20Laughs&In-Reply-To=%3C1f7617370901210852u7350a1c7ic1ed47bbaff49d12%40mail.gmail.com%3E>

Wed Jan 21 08:52:07 PST 2009

* Previous message: (urth) FW: Long Sun Laughs <011822.html>

* Messages sorted by: [date] <date.html> [thread] <thread.html> [subject] <subject.html>
[author] <author.html>

It seems obvious to-me that Mucor's body was intended for one of Typhon's children to inhabit when the Whorl reached its intended destination.

Find out more about us at www.bankofscotland.ie <<http://www.bankofscotland.ie>>

The information contained in this message is confidential and is intended for the addressee only. If you have received this message in error or there are any problems please notify the originator immediately. The unauthorised use, disclosure, copying or alteration of this message is strictly forbidden. This mail and any attachments have been scanned for viruses prior to leaving Bank of Scotland Ireland's network.

Bank of Scotland Ireland will not be liable for direct, special, indirect or consequential damages arising from alteration of the contents of this message by a third party or as a result of any virus being passed on. Bank of Scotland (Ireland) reserves the right to monitor and record e-mail messages sent to and from this address for the purposes of investigating or detecting any unauthorised use of its system and ensuring its effective operation.

Bank of Scotland (Ireland) Limited is part of HBOS plc and is regulated by the Financial Regulator. Registered in Ireland Number: 8545. Registered office: Bank of Scotland House, 124-127 St. Stephens Green, Dublin 2

Son of Witz — 21 Jan 2009, 17:07 · follows O'Donnell, Tim BOSI

That's an interesting idea, a body for the gods to inhabit.

I can't help but feel that Mucor and the Possessions by Gods are flipsides of the same thing. How does mainframe beam the "Gods" consciousness into the humans? It strikes me that if humans have the potential for this sort of consciousness override, and a machine has the ability to possess them, then that ability could have evolved, or been engineered into someone like Mucor.

and Yeah, Quetzal could have decided to betray the inhumu, fair enough. ~witz

-----Original Message-----

From: Dan'I Danehy-Oakes [<mailto:danldo@gmail.com>]

Sent: Wednesday, January 21, 2009 08:52 AM

To: 'The Urth Mailing List'

Subject: Re: (urth) FW: Long Sun Laughs

It seems obvious to-me that Mucor's body was intended for one of Typhon's children to inhabit when the Whorl reached its intended destination.

On Wed, Jan 21, 2009 at 8:42 AM, O'Donnell, Tim (BOSI)
<Tim.O'Donnell@bankofscotland.ie> wrote:

Well, I had read the books a number of times and the magical mental powers I had taken as part of the given elements of this universe.

It was only on reflection on the similarity between Mucor's power (mind

projection) and Typhon's power (mind projection + mental nets to ensnare others + ?) that I wondered at a connection.

There is probably nothing in it though...or nothing I can prove anyway...

David Stockhoff dstockhoff at verizon.net
<mailto:urth%40lists.urth.net?Subject=Re%3A%20%28urth%29%20Long%20Sun%20Laughs&In-Reply-To=%3C49774FA9.8000106%40verizon.net%3E>
Wed Jan 21 08:39:05 PST 2009

Previous message: (urth) Long Sun Laughs <011820.html>
Messages sorted by: [date] <date.html> [thread] <thread.html> [subject] <subject.html> [author] <author.html>

Ah, never mind. Remora, of course.

Regarding magical mental powers---I think you have to assume these have been either manufactured or bred in every human case. Which, may not matter.

Find out more about us at www.bankofscotland.ie
<<http://www.bankofscotland.ie>>

The information contained in this message is confidential and is intended for the addressee only. If you have received this message in error or there are any problems please notify the originator immediately. The unauthorised use, disclosure, copying or alteration of this message is strictly forbidden. This mail and any attachments have been scanned for viruses prior to leaving Bank of Scotland Ireland's network.

Bank of Scotland Ireland will not be liable for direct, special, indirect or consequential damages arising from alteration of the contents of this message by a third party or as a result of any virus being passed on. Bank of Scotland (Ireland) reserves the right to monitor and record e-mail messages sent to and from this address for the purposes of investigating or detecting any unauthorised use of its system and ensuring its effective operation.

Bank of Scotland (Ireland) Limited is part of HBOS plc and is regulated by the Financial Regulator. Registered in Ireland Number: 8545. Registered office: Bank of Scotland House, 124-127 St. Stephens Green, Dublin 2

Dave Tallman — 21 Jan 2009, 18:36 · follows Son of Witz

Gene Wolfe answered several questions related to Quetzal's motivations in a Q&A session recorded here: <http://www.ansible.co.uk/cc/cc77.html/quetzal>

Check out answers 7, 23, and 24. He said that Quetzal wanted a "thriving human colony on Green" (which almost seems like a contradiction in terms to me).

Son of Witz — 21 Jan 2009, 18:51 · follows Dave Tallman

haven't read yet.

but that link was 404.

here is a new link:

<http://www.ansible.co.uk/cc/cc77.html>

~witz

-----Original Message-----

From: Dave Tallman [mailto:davetallman at msn.com]

Sent: Wednesday, January 21, 2009 10:36 AM

To: urth at lists.urth.net

Subject: Re: (urth) Long Sun Laughs

Gene Wolfe answered several questions related to Quetzal's motivations in a Q&A session recorded here: <http://www.ansible.co.uk/cc/cc77.html/quetzal>

Check out answers 7, 23, and 24. He said that Quetzal wanted a "thriving human colony on Green" (which almost seems like a contradiction in terms to me).

Son of Witz — 21 Jan 2009, 19:15 · follows Son of Witz

thanks again for that Dave.

this one strikes me as odd:

12. Who was Blood's father? -- Patera Pike. [DRL: This was a complete surprise all round, by the way.]

I thought that was pretty clear in the book, much more clear than Silk being an engineered embryo.

but I'd like to point out #15 to all the people here who contest the idea that Severian is an instantiation of Christ.

15. Is the Outsider a form of Severian? -- No. Severian is a form of the Outsider.

~witz

-----Original Message-----

From: Dave Tallman [mailto:davetallman at msn.com]

Sent: Wednesday, January 21, 2009 10:36 AM

To: urth at lists.urth.net

Subject: Re: (urth) Long Sun Laughs

Gene Wolfe answered several questions related to Quetzal's motivations in a Q&A session recorded here: <http://www.ansible.co.uk/cc/cc77.html/quetzal>

Check out answers 7, 23, and 24. He said that Quetzal wanted a "thriving human colony on Green" (which almost seems like a contradiction in terms to me).

Craig Brewer — 21 Jan 2009, 19:20 · in reply to Son of Witz

but I'd like to point out #15 to all the people here who contest the idea that Severian is an instantiation of Christ.

15. Is the Outsider a form of Severian? -- No. Severian is a form of the Outsider.

Define form.

Heh, just kidding. (maybe...?)

John Watkins — 21 Jan 2009, 19:20 · in reply to Son of Witz

On Wed, Jan 21, 2009 at 2:15 PM, Son of Witz <sonofwitz at butcherbaker.org> wrote:
thanks again for that Dave.

this one strikes me as odd:

12. Who was Blood's father? -- Patera Pike. [DRL: This was a complete surprise all round, by the way.]

I thought that was pretty clear in the book, much more clear than Silk being an engineered embryo.

but I'd like to point out #15 to all the people here who contest the idea that Severian is an instantiation of Christ.

15. Is the Outsider a form of Severian? -- No. Severian is a form of the Outsider.

As, by a certain logic, is everyone.

~witz

-----Original Message-----

From: Dave Tallman [mailto:davetallman at msn.com]

Sent: Wednesday, January 21, 2009 10:36 AM

To: urth at lists.urth.net

Subject: Re: (urth) Long Sun Laughs

Gene Wolfe answered several questions related to Quetzal's motivations in a

Q&A session recorded here: <http://www.ansible.co.uk/cc/cc77.html/quetzal>

Check out answers 7, 23, and 24. He said that Quetzal wanted a "thriving human colony on Green" (which almost seems like a contradiction in terms to me).

Son of Witz — 21 Jan 2009, 19:23 · follows John Watkins

I knew both Watkins and Brewer couldn't leave that one. :D

we all are.

and we all must overcome our Typhons.

~witz

-----Original Message-----

From: John Watkins [mailto:john.watkins04 at gmail.com]

Sent: Wednesday, January 21, 2009 11:20 AM

To: 'The Urth Mailing List'

Subject: Re: (urth) Long Sun Laughs

On Wed, Jan 21, 2009 at 2:15 PM, Son of Witz <sonofwitz at butcherbaker.org> wrote:
thanks again for that Dave.

this one strikes me as odd:

12. Who was Blood's father? -- Patera Pike. [DRL: This was a complete surprise all round, by the way.]

I thought that was pretty clear in the book, much more clear than Silk being an engineered embryo.

but I'd like to point out #15 to all the people here who contest the idea that Severian is an instantiation of Christ.

15. Is the Outsider a form of Severian? -- No. Severian is a form of the Outsider.

As, by a certain logic, is everyone.

~witz

-----Original Message-----

From: Dave Tallman [mailto:davetallman at msn.com]

Sent: Wednesday, January 21, 2009 10:36 AM

To: urth at lists.urth.net

Subject: Re: (urth) Long Sun Laughs

Gene Wolfe answered several questions related to Quetzal's motivations in a

Q&A session recorded here: <http://www.ansible.co.uk/cc/cc77.html/quetzal>

Check out answers 7, 23, and 24. He said that Quetzal wanted a "thriving human colony on Green" (which almost seems like a contradiction in terms to me).

John Watkins — 21 Jan 2009, 19:31 · in reply to Son of Witz

Why is the Jordan interview not the last word on this? The emphasis is my own.

"*J*: The holy slaves [Heirodules], Famulimus or one of them tells Severian that he is the center of his race, the savior of his race. That is such Christlike language you can see why interpreters would say, Well Severian is a Christ figure. But is there a Christ figure in the book, or is he simply for this universe?

GW: In so far as there is a Christ figure it is Severian. That doesn't mean he has to be identified with Christ. He is in a position similar to that of Christ. *But really it is a different position because Christ really is both God and man. Severian is not*. Severian is a Christian rather than a Christ. But he has been taken as the representative of humanity by whom humanity is to be judged. This I think is what has happened perhaps with the actual human Jesus. He is or was as fully human as you or I and we are saved by Him. By the fact that he passed. That the corruption did not destroy Him. I think that St. Paul is absolutely correct when he says that Jesus was tempted in all the ways that we are tempted. I think that Jesus was tempted to commit murder or any other sin that you want to name just as the rest of us are. And the difference is that He did not sin."

On Wed, Jan 21, 2009 at 2:23 PM, Son of Witz <sonofwitz at butcherbaker.org> wrote:
I knew both Watkins and Brewer couldn't leave that one. :D

we all are.
and we all must overcome our Typhons.
~witz

-----Original Message-----

From: John Watkins [mailto:john.watkins04 at gmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, January 21, 2009 11:20 AM
To: 'The Urth Mailing List'

>Subject: Re: (urth) Long Sun Laughs

On Wed, Jan 21, 2009 at 2:15 PM, Son of Witz <sonofwitz at butcherbaker.org> wrote:

thanks again for that Dave.

this one strikes me as odd:

12. Who was Blood's father? -- Patera Pike. [DRL: This was a complete surprise all round, by the way.]

I thought that was pretty clear in the book, much more clear than Silk being an engineered embryo.

but I'd like to point out #15 to all the people here who contest the idea
that Severian is an instantiation of Christ.

15. Is the Outsider a form of Severian? -- No. Severian is a form of the Outsider.

As, by a certain logic, is everyone.

~witz

-----Original Message-----

From: Dave Tallman [mailto:davetallman at msn.com]
Sent: Wednesday, January 21, 2009 10:36 AM
To: urth at lists.urth.net
Subject: Re: (urth) Long Sun Laughs

Gene Wolfe answered several questions related to Quetzal's motivations in

a

Q&A session recorded here:

<http://www.ansible.co.uk/cc/cc77.html/quetxal>

Check out answers 7, 23, and 24. He said that Quetzal wanted a "thriving human colony on Green" (which almost seems like a contradiction in terms to me).

Son of Witz — 21 Jan 2009, 19:48 · follows John Watkins

I hadn't read that.

but my point stands from his first line.

"In so far as there is a Christ figure, it is Severian"

I'm talking about symbolic metaphor, or loose analogy, not mundane plot. the same could be

said for the Long Sun. In so far as there is a Christ figure, it is Silk.

-----Original Message-----

From: John Watkins [mailto:john.watkins04 at gmail.com]

Sent: Wednesday, January 21, 2009 11:31 AM

To: 'The Urth Mailing List'

Subject: Re: (urth) Long Sun Laughs

Why is the Jordan interview not the last word on this? The emphasis is my own.

"*JJ:* The holy slaves [Heirodules], Famulimus or one of them tells Severian that he is the center of his race, the savior of his race. That is such Christlike language you can see why interpreters would say, Well Severian is a Christ figure. But is there a Christ figure in the book, or is he simply for this universe?

GW: In so far as there is a Christ figure it is Severian. That doesn't mean he has to be identified with Christ. He is in a position similar to that of Christ. *But really it is a different position because Christ really is both God and man. Severian is not*. Severian is a Christian rather than a Christ. But he has been taken as the representative of humanity by whom humanity is to be judged. This I think is what has happened perhaps with the actual human Jesus. He is or was as fully human as you or I and we are saved by Him. By the fact that he passed. That the corruption did not destroy Him. I think that St. Paul is absolutely correct when he says that Jesus was tempted in all the ways that we are tempted. I think that Jesus was tempted to commit murder or any other sin that you want to name just as the rest of us are. And the difference is that He did not sin."

On Wed, Jan 21, 2009 at 2:23 PM, Son of Witz <sonofwitz at butcherbaker.org> wrote:

I knew both Watkins and Brewer couldn't leave that one. :D

we all are.

and we all must overcome our Typhons.

~witz

-----Original Message-----

From: John Watkins [mailto:john.watkins04 at gmail.com]

Sent: Wednesday, January 21, 2009 11:20 AM

To: 'The Urth Mailing List'

>Subject: Re: (urth) Long Sun Laughs

On Wed, Jan 21, 2009 at 2:15 PM, Son of Witz <sonofwitz at butcherbaker.org> wrote:

thanks again for that Dave.

this one strikes me as odd:

12. Who was Blood's father? -- Patera Pike. [DRL: This was a complete surprise all round, by the way.]

I thought that was pretty clear in the book, much more clear than Silk being an engineered embryo.

but I'd like to point out #15 to all the people here who contest the idea

that Severian is an instantiation of Christ.

15. Is the Outsider a form of Severian? -- No. Severian is a form of the

Outsider.

As, by a certain logic, is everyone.

~witz

-----Original Message-----

From: Dave Tallman [mailto:davetallman at msn.com]

Sent: Wednesday, January 21, 2009 10:36 AM

To: urth at lists.urth.net

Subject: Re: (urth) Long Sun Laughs

Gene Wolfe answered several questions related to Quetzal's motivations in

a

Q&A session recorded here:

<http://www.ansible.co.uk/cc/cc77.html/quetxal>

Check out answers 7, 23, and 24. He said that Quetzal wanted a "thriving human colony on Green" (which almost seems like a contradiction in terms to me).

John Watkins — 21 Jan 2009, 20:05 · in reply to Son of Witz

Somewhat OT, but you'll enjoy it.

In Battlestar Galactica, insofar as there is a Christ-figure, it's Starbuck.

Also, Starbuck and Severian have the same number of letters and same initial letter.

On Wed, Jan 21, 2009 at 2:48 PM, Son of Witz <sonofwitz at butcherbaker.org> wrote:
I hadn't read that.

but my point stands from his first line.

"In so far as there is a Christ figure, it is Severian"

I'm talking about symbolic metaphor, or loose analogy, not mundane plot.
the same could be said for the Long Sun.

In so far as there is a Christ figure, it is Silk.

-----Original Message-----

From: John Watkins [mailto:john.watkins04 at gmail.com]

>Sent: Wednesday, January 21, 2009 11:31 AM

To: 'The Urth Mailing List'

Subject: Re: (urth) Long Sun Laughs

Why is the Jordan interview not the last word on this? The emphasis is my own.

"*JJ:* The holy slaves [Heirodules], Famulimus or one of them tells
Severian

that he is the center of his race, the savior of his race. That is such
Christlike language you can see why interpreters would say, Well Severian
is

a Christ figure. But is there a Christ figure in the book, or is he simply
for this universe?

GW: In so far as there is a Christ figure it is Severian. That doesn't mean he has to be identified with Christ. He is in a position similar to that of Christ. *But really it is a different position because Christ really is both God and man. Severian is not*. Severian is a Christian rather than a Christ. But he has been taken as the representative of humanity by whom humanity is to be judged. This I think is what has happened perhaps with the actual human Jesus. He is or was as fully human as you or I and we are saved by Him. By the fact that he passed. That the corruption did not destroy Him. I think that St. Paul is absolutely correct when he says that Jesus was tempted in all the ways that we are tempted. I think that Jesus was tempted to commit murder or any other sin that you want to name just as the rest of us are. And the difference is that He did not sin."

On Wed, Jan 21, 2009 at 2:23 PM, Son of Witz <sonofwitz at butcherbaker.org> wrote:

I knew both Watkins and Brewer couldn't leave that one. :D

we all are.
and we all must overcome our Typhons.
~witz

-----Original Message-----

From: John Watkins [mailto:john.watkins04 at gmail.com]

Sent: Wednesday, January 21, 2009 11:20 AM

To: 'The Urth Mailing List'

>Subject: Re: (urth) Long Sun Laughs

On Wed, Jan 21, 2009 at 2:15 PM, Son of Witz <sonofwitz at butcherbaker.org> wrote:

thanks again for that Dave.

this one strikes me as odd:

12. Who was Blood's father? -- Patera Pike. [DRL: This was a complete surprise all round, by the way.]

I thought that was pretty clear in the book, much more clear than Silk being an engineered embryo.

but I'd like to point out #15 to all the people here who contest the idea that Severian is an instantiation of Christ.

15. Is the Outsider a form of Severian? -- No. Severian is a form of the Outsider.

As, by a certain logic, is everyone.

~witz

-----Original Message-----

From: Dave Tallman [mailto:davetallman at msn.com]

Sent: Wednesday, January 21, 2009 10:36 AM

To: urth at lists.urth.net

Subject: Re: (urth) Long Sun Laughs

Gene Wolfe answered several questions related to Quetzal's motivations

in

a

Q&A session recorded here:

<http://www.ansible.co.uk/cc/cc77.html/quetxal>

Check out answers 7, 23, and 24. He said that Quetzal wanted a "thriving human colony on Green" (which almost seems like a contradiction in terms to me).

David Stockhoff — 21 Jan 2009, 20:22 · follows John Watkins

Was that from before or after TUotNS?

Because certain passages during a healing scene make it pretty clear that Severian (or a part of Severian's consciousness) observes himself as something huge squeezing itself through tiny human senses. That's a god talking.

It may leave room for temporary goddish intervention, but Severian himself observes this as though it is he who is the god, not as though someone else is the god.

Perhaps Wolfe rethought it.

Message: 8

Date: Wed, 21 Jan 2009 14:31:07 -0500

From: John Watkins <john.watkins04 at gmail.com>

Subject: Re: (urth) Long Sun Laughs

To: The Urth Mailing List <urth at lists.urth.net>

Message-ID:

<93d4039f0901211131p2e4b1902r9cf85672b20e4932 at mail.gmail.com>

Content-Type: text/plain; charset="iso-8859-1"

Why is the Jordan interview not the last word on this? The emphasis is my own.

"*JJ:* The holy slaves [Heirodules], Famulimus or one of them tells Severian that he is the center of his race, the savior of his race. That is such Christlike language you can see why interpreters would say, Well Severian is a Christ figure. But is there a Christ figure in the book, or is he simply for this universe?

GW: In so far as there is a Christ figure it is Severian. That doesn't mean he has to be identified with Christ. He is in a position similar to that of Christ. *But really it is a different position because Christ really

is both God and man. Severian is not*. Severian is a Christian rather than a Christ. But he has been taken as the representative of humanity by whom humanity is to be judged. This I think is what has happened perhaps with the actual human Jesus. He is or was as fully human as you or I and we are saved by Him. By the fact that he passed. That the corruption did not destroy Him. I think that St. Paul is absolutely correct when he says that Jesus was tempted in all the ways that we are tempted. I think that Jesus was tempted to commit murder or any other sin that you want to name just as the rest of us are. And the difference is that He did not sin."

John Watkins — 21 Jan 2009, 20:25 · in reply to David Stockhoff

It's from after Long Sun.

Severian is pretty clearly more than human in a demi-god sense while linked up with the New Sun in Urth. That does not make him an incarnation of the Increate.

On Wed, Jan 21, 2009 at 3:22 PM, David Stockhoff <dstockhoff at verizon.net> wrote:
Was that from before or after TUotNS?

Because certain passages during a healing scene make it pretty clear that Severian (or a part of Severian's consciousness) observes himself as something huge squeezing itself through tiny human senses. That's a god talking.

It may leave room for temporary goddish intervention, but Severian himself observes this as though it is he who is the god, not as though someone else is the god.

Perhaps Wolfe rethought it.

Message: 8

Date: Wed, 21 Jan 2009 14:31:07 -0500

From: John Watkins <john.watkins04 at gmail.com>

Subject: Re: (urth) Long Sun Laughs

To: The Urth Mailing List <urth at lists.urth.net>

Message-ID:

<93d4039f0901211131p2e4b1902r9cf85672b20e4932 at mail.gmail.com>

Content-Type: text/plain; charset="iso-8859-1"

Why is the Jordan interview not the last word on this? The emphasis is my own.

"*JJ:* The holy slaves [Heirodules], Famulimus or one of them tells Severian that he is the center of his race, the savior of his race. That is such Christlike language you can see why interpreters would say, Well Severian is a Christ figure. But is there a Christ figure in the book, or is he simply for this universe?

GW: In so far as there is a Christ figure it is Severian. That doesn't mean he has to be identified with Christ. He is in a position similar to that of Christ. *But really it is a different position because Christ really is both God and man. Severian is not*. Severian is a Christian rather than

a

Christ. But he has been taken as the representative of humanity by whom humanity is to be judged. This I think is what has happened perhaps with the actual human Jesus. He is or was as fully human as you or I and we are saved by Him. By the fact that he passed. That the corruption did not destroy Him.

I think that St. Paul is absolutely correct when he says that Jesus was tempted in all the ways that we are tempted. I think that Jesus was tempted to commit murder or any other sin that you want to name just as the rest of us are. And the difference is that He did not sin."

avast! Antivirus: Outbound message clean.
Virus Database (VPS): 090121-0, 01/21/2009
Tested on: 1/21/2009 3:22:58 PM

avast! - copyright (c) 1988-2009 ALWIL Software.
<http://www.avast.com>

David Stockhoff — 21 Jan 2009, 20:34 · follows John Watkins

Yet he briefly shares the Increate's perspective.

Message: 4
Date: Wed, 21 Jan 2009 15:25:55 -0500
From: John Watkins <john.watkins04@gmail.com>
Subject: Re: (urth) Long Sun Laughs
To: The Urth Mailing List <urth@lists.urth.net>
Message-ID:
<93d4039f0901211225t629b6465v7e5cd64f22fb1bec@mail.gmail.com>
Content-Type: text/plain; charset="iso-8859-1"

It's from after Long Sun.

Severian is pretty clearly more than human in a demi-god sense while linked up with the New Sun in Urth. That does not make him an incarnation of the Increate.

Adam Thornton — 21 Jan 2009, 20:42 · in reply to Dave Tallman

On Jan 21, 2009, at 12:36 PM, Dave Tallman wrote:
He said that Quetzal wanted a "thriving human colony on Green" (which almost seems like a contradiction in terms to me).

A stockyard could be considered a thriving colony of cattle.

Adam

Son of Witz — 21 Jan 2009, 20:45 · follows Adam Thornton

That's how I read that passage too.

but guys, I wasn't really trying to spark the debate.

I suppose it can't be helped from such a provocative comment though. sorry.

RE: BSG,

I've been wondering about that. I've been wondering if Gaius isn't being set up as some dubious sort of Christlike messiah. I've only watched 4 eps of season 4 though. And I hope that suspicion is wrong. But he prayed, and that kid was healed, and he's got some sort of "chosen one" charm about him.

damn, I gotta catch up before friday. hope netflix comes in time.

PLEASE NO BSG SPOILERS IN THIS THREAD.

~witz

-----Original Message-----

From: David Stockhoff [mailto:dstockhoff at verizon.net]

Sent: Wednesday, January 21, 2009 12:22 PM

To: urth at lists.urth.net

Subject: Re: (urth) Long Sun Laughs

Was that from before or after TUotNS?

Because certain passages during a healing scene make it pretty clear that Severian (or a part of Severian's consciousness) observes himself as something huge squeezing itself through tiny human senses. That's a god talking.

It may leave room for temporary goddish intervention, but Severian himself observes this as though it is he who is the god, not as though someone else is the god.

Perhaps Wolfe rethought it.

Message: 8

Date: Wed, 21 Jan 2009 14:31:07 -0500

From: John Watkins <john.watkins04 at gmail.com>

Subject: Re: (urth) Long Sun Laughs

To: The Urth Mailing List <urth at lists.urth.net>

Message-ID:

<93d4039f0901211131p2e4b1902r9cf85672b20e4932 at mail.gmail.com>

Content-Type: text/plain; charset="iso-8859-1"

Why is the Jordan interview not the last word on this? The emphasis is my own.

"*JJ:* The holy slaves [Heirodules], Famulimus or one of them tells Severian that he is the center of his race, the savior of his race. That is such Christlike language you can see why interpreters would say, Well Severian is a Christ figure. But is there a Christ figure in the book, or is he simply for this universe?

GW: In so far as there is a Christ figure it is Severian. That doesn't mean he has to be identified with Christ. He is in a position similar to that of Christ. *But really it is a different position because Christ really is both God and man. Severian is not*. Severian is a Christian rather than a

Christ. But he has been taken as the representative of humanity by whom humanity is to be judged. This I think is what has happened perhaps with the actual human Jesus. He is or was as fully human as you or I and we are saved by Him. By the fact that he passed. That the corruption did not destroy Him. I think that St. Paul is absolutely correct when he says that Jesus was tempted in all the ways that we are tempted. I think that Jesus was tempted to commit murder or any other sin that you want to name just as the rest of us are. And the difference is that He did not sin."

avast! Antivirus: Outbound message clean.
Virus Database (VPS): 090121-0, 01/21/2009
Tested on: 1/21/2009 3:22:58 PM
avast! - copyright (c) 1988-2009 ALWIL Software.
<http://www.avast.com>

Son of Witz — 21 Jan 2009, 20:47 · follows Son of Witz

-----Original Message-----

From: Adam Thornton [mailto:adam@io.com]
Sent: Wednesday, January 21, 2009 12:42 PM
To: 'The Urth Mailing List'
Subject: Re: (urth) Long Sun Laughs

On Jan 21, 2009, at 12:36 PM, Dave Tallman wrote:

He said that Quetzal wanted a "thriving human colony on Green" (which almost seems like a contradiction in terms to me).

A stockyard could be considered a thriving colony of cattle.

Adam

Exactly. When I read that I felt it did not invalidate the idea that he was providing a food source. Not having read much of short sun, it already has been suggested that there WAS a previous population on Blue.

I hope the leftover fish I'm about to lunch on isn't a thriving colony.

~witz

John Watkins — 21 Jan 2009, 20:50 · in reply to Son of Witz

Note that Baltar + Anders = Baldanders.

Brilliant.

On Wed, Jan 21, 2009 at 3:45 PM, Son of Witz <sonofwitz@butcherbaker.org> wrote:
That's how I read that passage too.

but guys, I wasn't really trying to spark the debate.

I suppose it can't be helped from such a provocative comment though. sorry.

RE: BSG,

I've been wondering about that. I've been wondering if Gaius isn't being set up as some dubious sort of Christlike messiah. I've only watched 4 eps of season 4 though. And I hope that suspicion is wrong. But he prayed, and that kid was healed, and he's got some sort of "chosen one" charm about him. damn, I gotta catch up before friday. hope netflix comes in time.
PLEASE NO BSG SPOILERS IN THIS THREAD.

~witz

-----Original Message-----

From: David Stockhoff [mailto:dstockhoff at verizon.net]

Sent: Wednesday, January 21, 2009 12:22 PM

To: urth at lists.urth.net

Subject: Re: (urth) Long Sun Laughs

Was that from before or after TUotNS?

Because certain passages during a healing scene make it pretty clear that Severian (or a part of Severian's consciousness) observes himself as something huge squeezing itself through tiny human senses. That's a god talking.

It may leave room for temporary goddish intervention, but Severian himself observes this as though it is he who is the god, not as though someone else is the god.

Perhaps Wolfe rethought it.

Message: 8

Date: Wed, 21 Jan 2009 14:31:07 -0500

From: John Watkins <john.watkins04 at gmail.com>

Subject: Re: (urth) Long Sun Laughs

To: The Urth Mailing List <urth at lists.urth.net>

Message-ID:

<93d4039f0901211131p2e4b1902r9cf85672b20e4932 at mail.gmail.com>

Content-Type: text/plain; charset="iso-8859-1"

Why is the Jordan interview not the last word on this? The emphasis is my own.

"*JJ:* The holy slaves [Heirodules], Famulimus or one of them tells Severian that he is the center of his race, the savior of his race. That is such Christlike language you can see why interpreters would say, Well Severian is a Christ figure. But is there a Christ figure in the book, or is he simply for this universe?

GW: In so far as there is a Christ figure it is Severian. That doesn't mean he has to be identified with Christ. He is in a position similar to that of Christ. *But really it is a different position because Christ really is both God and man. Severian is not*. Severian is a Christian rather than

a

Christ. But he has been taken as the representative of humanity by whom humanity is to be judged. This I think is what has happened perhaps with the

actual human Jesus. He is or was as fully human as you or I and we are saved

by Him. By the fact that he passed. That the corruption did not destroy Him.

I think that St. Paul is absolutely correct when he says that Jesus was tempted in all the ways that we are tempted. I think that Jesus was tempted

to commit murder or any other sin that you want to name just as the rest of

us are. And the difference is that He did not sin."

avast! Antivirus: Outbound message clean.

Virus Database (VPS): 090121-0, 01/21/2009

Tested on: 1/21/2009 3:22:58 PM

avast! - copyright (c) 1988-2009 ALWIL Software.

<http://www.avast.com>

>

Jordon Flato — 21 Jan 2009, 20:58 · in reply to Son of Witz

OMG Witz, didn't you love how Boxy from the original series turns out to be the final fifth cylon?

What, oh, you said you DIDN'T want spoilers! Sorry!

Jordon Flato — 21 Jan 2009, 20:58 · in reply to John Watkins

Never ever noticed that. Brilliant.

On Wed, Jan 21, 2009 at 12:50 PM, John Watkins <john.watkins04@gmail.com> wrote:
Note that Baltar + Anders = Baldanders.

Brilliant.

On Wed, Jan 21, 2009 at 3:45 PM, Son of Witz <sonofwitz@butcherbaker.org> wrote:

That's how I read that passage too.

but guys, I wasn't really trying to spark the debate.

I suppose it can't be helped from such a provocative comment though.
sorry.

RE: BSG,

I've been wondering about that. I've been wondering if Gaius isn't being set up as some dubious sort of Christlike messiah. I've only watched 4 eps of season 4 though. And I hope that suspicion is wrong. But he prayed, and that kid was healed, and he's got some sort of "chosen one" charm about him. damn, I gotta catch up before friday. hope netflix comes in time.

PLEASE NO BSG SPOILERS IN THIS THREAD.

~witz

-----Original Message-----

From: David Stockhoff [mailto:dstockhoff at verizon.net]

Sent: Wednesday, January 21, 2009 12:22 PM

To: urth at lists.urth.net

Subject: Re: (urth) Long Sun Laughs

Was that from before or after TUotNS?

Because certain passages during a healing scene make it pretty clear that Severian (or a part of Severian's consciousness) observes himself as something huge squeezing itself through tiny human senses. That's a god talking.

It may leave room for temporary goddish intervention, but Severian himself observes this as though it is he who is the god, not as though someone else is the god.

Perhaps Wolfe rethought it.

Message: 8

Date: Wed, 21 Jan 2009 14:31:07 -0500

From: John Watkins <john.watkins04 at gmail.com>

Subject: Re: (urth) Long Sun Laughs

To: The Urth Mailing List <urth at lists.urth.net>

Message-ID:

<93d4039f0901211131p2e4b1902r9cf85672b20e4932 at mail.gmail.com>

Content-Type: text/plain; charset="iso-8859-1"

Why is the Jordan interview not the last word on this? The emphasis is my own.

"*JJ:* The holy slaves [Heirodules], Famulimus or one of them tells Severian that he is the center of his race, the savior of his race. That is such Christlike language you can see why interpreters would say, Well Severian is a Christ figure. But is there a Christ figure in the book, or is he simply for this universe?

GW: In so far as there is a Christ figure it is Severian. That doesn't mean he has to be identified with Christ. He is in a position similar to that of Christ. *But really it is a different position because Christ really is both God and man. Severian is not*. Severian is a Christian rather than a Christ. But he has been taken as the representative of humanity by whom humanity is to be judged. This I think is what has happened perhaps with the actual human Jesus. He is or was as fully human as you or I and we are saved by Him. By the fact that he passed. That the corruption did not destroy

Him.

I think that St. Paul is absolutely correct when he says that Jesus was tempted in all the ways that we are tempted. I think that Jesus was tempted to commit murder or any other sin that you want to name just as the rest of us are. And the difference is that He did not sin."

avast! Antivirus: Outbound message clean.
Virus Database (VPS): 090121-0, 01/21/2009
Tested on: 1/21/2009 3:22:58 PM
avast! - copyright (c) 1988-2009 ALWIL Software.
<http://www.avast.com>
>

Craig Brewer — 21 Jan 2009, 21:00 · in reply to Son of Witz

Potential Short Sun spoilers, but...

A thriving colony or real, happy humans could make sense if the inhumi really did want to live and experience and feel like humans do. Some may just want to feed. Others (Jahlee) actually want to be loved. Someone like Quetzal who had lived with humans for so long might well have wanted to try to become as human as possible. That goes along with the "partially good inhumi" theories that got bandied about a lot earlier in the threads.

Just speculation, though. I don't recall anywhere in the text that actually makes that case.

----- Original Message -----

From: Son of Witz <sonofwitz at butcherbaker.org>
To: The Urth Mailing List <urth at lists.urth.net>
Sent: Wednesday, January 21, 2009 2:47:51 PM
Subject: Re: (urth) Long Sun Laughs
-----Original Message-----

From: Adam Thornton [mailto:adam at io.com]
Sent: Wednesday, January 21, 2009 12:42 PM
To: 'The Urth Mailing List'
Subject: Re: (urth) Long Sun Laughs

On Jan 21, 2009, at 12:36 PM, Dave Tallman wrote:

He said that Quetzal wanted a "thriving human colony on Green" (which almost seems like a contradiction in terms to me).

A stockyard could be considered a thriving colony of cattle.

Adam

Exactly. When I read that I felt it did not invalidate the idea that he was providing a food source. Not having read much of short sun, it already has been suggested that there WAS a previous population on Blue.

I hope the leftover fish I'm about to lunch on isn't a thriving colony.

~witz

Jeffrey Brent McBeth — 21 Jan 2009, 21:20 · in reply to Son of Witz

On Wed, Jan 21, 2009 at 08:45:47PM +0000, Son of Witz wrote:
PLEASE NO BSG SPOILERS IN THIS THREAD.

The last Cylon is a sled

"The man who does not read good books has no advantage over
the man who cannot read them."

-- Mark Twain

John Watkins — 21 Jan 2009, 21:37 · in reply to Jeffrey Brent McBeth

On Wed, Jan 21, 2009 at 4:20 PM, Jeffrey Brent McBeth <mcbeth at broggs.org> wrote:
On Wed, Jan 21, 2009 at 08:45:47PM +0000, Son of Witz wrote:

PLEASE NO BSG SPOILERS IN THIS THREAD.

The last Cylon is a sled

Now that's just silly.

The last cylon is Bruce Willis. He was dead all along.

--

"The man who does not read good books has no advantage over
the man who cannot read them."

-- Mark Twain

-----BEGIN PGP SIGNATURE-----

Version: GnuPG v1.4.9 (GNU/Linux)

iD8DBQFjd5GYXazNjlaibJERAgkeAJ0T/GzU96wBKQEnNQJGdp14NDNjrwCfUQZG
0v3wIVDnxVn2bLpNgRBCgNY=
=a87p

-----END PGP SIGNATURE-----

Stuart Hamm — 21 Jan 2009, 21:41 · in reply to Jeffrey Brent McBeth

Don't tell witz about the Lorne Greene cameo..

???? Mobile — (415) 786-3624

???? Skype? stuart.hamm

myspace.com/stuhamm

? ??? stuarthamm.net

--- On Wed, 1/21/09, Jeffrey Brent McBeth <mcbeth at broggs.org> wrote: From: Jeffrey Brent McBeth <mcbeth at broggs.org> Subject: Re: (urth) Long Sun Laughs To: "The Urth Mailing List" <urth at lists.urth.net> Date: Wednesday, January 21, 2009, 1:20 PM

On Wed, Jan 21, 2009 at 08:45:47PM +0000, Son of Witz wrote:
PLEASE NO BSG SPOILERS IN THIS THREAD.

The last Cylon is a sled

"The man who does not read good books has no advantage over
the man who cannot read them."
-- Mark Twain

Son of Witz — 21 Jan 2009, 21:44 · follows Stuart Hamm

On Wed, Jan 21, 2009 at 08:45:47PM +0000, Son of Witz wrote:
PLEASE NO BSG SPOILERS IN THIS THREAD.

The last Cylon is a sled

Now that's just silly.

The last cylon is Bruce Willis. He was dead all along.

I KNEW IT!!!

Adam Thornton — 21 Jan 2009, 22:02 · in reply to John Watkins

On Jan 21, 2009, at 3:37 PM, John Watkins wrote:

On Wed, Jan 21, 2009 at 4:20 PM, Jeffrey Brent McBeth <mcbeth at broggs.org> wrote:

On Wed, Jan 21, 2009 at 08:45:47PM +0000, Son of Witz wrote:

PLEASE NO BSG SPOILERS IN THIS THREAD.

The last Cylon is a sled

Now that's just silly.

The last cylon is Bruce Willis. He was dead all along.

No.

Obviously it's Rosebud. Which is a euphemism for "anus." Because the whole thing is just ONE BIG POOP JOKE.

QED.

Adam

Son of Witz — 21 Jan 2009, 22:25 · follows Adam Thornton

-----Original Message-----

From: Adam Thornton [mailto:adam at io.com]

Sent: Wednesday, January 21, 2009 02:02 PM

To: 'The Urth Mailing List'

Subject: Re: (urth) Long Sun Laughs

On Jan 21, 2009, at 3:37 PM, John Watkins wrote:

On Wed, Jan 21, 2009 at 4:20 PM, Jeffrey Brent McBeth <mcbeth at broggs.org> wrote:

On Wed, Jan 21, 2009 at 08:45:47PM +0000, Son of Witz wrote:

PLEASE NO BSG SPOILERS IN THIS THREAD.

The last Cylon is a sled

Now that's just silly.

The last cylon is Bruce Willis. He was dead all along.

No.

Obviously it's Rosebud. Which is a euphemism for "anus." Because the whole thing is just ONE BIG POOP JOKE.

QED.

Adam

ha ha.

duh. how did I miss the Rosebud joke in "The last Cylon is a sled" — genius.

Craig Brewer — 21 Jan 2009, 23:09 · in reply to Adam Thornton

No.

Obviously it's Rosebud. Which is a euphemism for "anus." Because the whole thing is just ONE BIG POOP JOKE.

QED.

Adam

No, no. Certainly you have BSG's mysteries confused with LOST's where the poop joke is more plausible than anything else the writers have (or never had) in mind.

Craig

J Jankiewicz — 23 Jan 2009, 01:07 · in reply to Craig Brewer

What really never makes sense to me is how in the heck did the inhumans breach the Whorl and get inside? Doesn't anybody think that just wrong is so many ways? You would have security alarms, airlocks to open somehow, lack of technology by the inhumans to break in, etc etc. Seems like a Deus ex Machina on Wolfe's part.

Plus so the inhumans get inside, how they can rise to power in an alien society is another huge?hurdle. Please enlighten or just tell me this is the part of the movie where you suspend belief. Thanks.

Jeffrey Brent McBeth — 23 Jan 2009, 01:08 · in reply to J Jankiewicz

On Thu, Jan 22, 2009 at 05:07:18PM -0800, J Jankiewicz wrote:
What really never makes sense to me is how in the heck did the inhumans breach the Whorl and get inside? Doesn't anybody think that just wrong is so many ways? You would have security alarms, airlocks to open somehow, lack of technology by the inhumans to break in, etc etc. Seems like a Deus ex Machina on Wolfe's part.

I'm guessing you haven't read Book of the Short Sun yet.

Spoiler warning for BotSS

I seem to remember that it was stated fairly explicitly by the Neighbors that they got the inhumans into the Whorl.

As far as them rising in power in an alien society, I would claim their empathetic abilities are fairly well dealt with in BotSS

Jeff

"The man who does not read good books has no advantage over the man who cannot read them."
-- Mark Twain

J Jankiewicz — 23 Jan 2009, 01:29 · in reply to Jeffrey Brent McBeth

Well gawsh I did read BotSS but apparently missed that key fact. Sigh, time to read them again!? Well, continue please. WHY would the neighbors do this or even know of the Whorl? It wasn't that obvious in BotSS was it?

Jeffrey Brent McBeth — 23 Jan 2009, 01:46 · in reply to J Jankiewicz

On Thu, Jan 22, 2009 at 05:29:04PM -0800, J Jankiewicz wrote:
Well gawsh I did read BotSS but apparently missed that key fact.
Sigh, time to read them again!? Well, continue please. WHY would the neighbors do this or even know of the Whorl? It wasn't that obvious in BotSS was it?

Well, see I'm running off of memory, as I don't have the nice searchable texts that some of you have. Experiment, help humans grow by showing themselves through a mirror darkly, gain a friend and ally

Jeff

"The man who does not read good books has no advantage over the man who cannot read them."
-- Mark Twain

John Watkins — 23 Jan 2009, 03:50 · in reply to J Jankiewicz

RRrRRrrrRrRRRRrRrrrRRR

On 1/22/09, J Jankiewicz <jjankie at yahoo.com> wrote:
What really never makes sense to me is how in the heck did the inhumans breach the Whorl and get inside? Doesn't anybody think that just wrong is so many ways? You would have security alarms, airlocks to open somehow, lack of technology by the inhumans to break in, etc etc. Seems like a Deus ex Machina

on Wolfe's part.

Plus so the inhumans get inside, how they can rise to power in an alien society is another huge hurdle. Please enlighten or just tell me this is the part of the movie where you suspend belief. Thanks.

Sent from Gmail for mobile | mobile.google.com

Dave Tallman — 23 Jan 2009, 13:41 · in reply to J Jankiewicz

J Jankiewicz

Well gawsh I did read BotSS but apparently missed that key fact. Sigh, time to read them again! Well, continue please. WHY would the neighbors do this or even know of the Whorl? It wasn't that obvious in BotSS was it?

The Neighbors knew of the Whorl because it arrived at its destination (the Short Sun system, containing the planets Blue and Green) over 33 years before the start of BotLS. Due to a revolution among the Whorl "gods" there was no unloading as ordained in the Plan of Pas. The Neighbors moved around freely in the Short Sun system and elsewhere using astral projection, so they had the opportunity to visit and check out the Whorl. They inserted some inhumans to see how inhumans who fed on humans differed from the ones who fed on Neighbors.

John Smith — 23 Jan 2009, 20:19 · in reply to John Watkins

<<<<<<

I don't see how they get inside either. Perhaps a lander went to Green and came back with stowaways. Quetzal has been there for 30 years or so.

Best wishes,

Jack

--- On Thu, 1/22/09, John Watkins <john.watkins04 at gmail.com> wrote:

From: John Watkins <john.watkins04 at gmail.com>

Subject: Re: (urth) The Inhumans Inigma

To: "The Urth Mailing List" <urth at lists.urth.net>

Date: Thursday, January 22, 2009, 10:50 PM

RRrRRrrrRrRRRRrRrrRRR

On 1/22/09, J Jankiewicz <jjankie at yahoo.com> wrote:
What really never makes sense to me is how in the heck did the inhumans breach the Whorl and get inside? Doesn't anybody think that just wrong is so many ways? You would have security alarms, airlocks to open somehow, lack of technology by the inhumans to break in, etc etc. Seems like a Deus ex Machina on Wolfe's part.

Plus so the inhumans get inside, how they can rise to power in an alien

society is another huge hurdle. Please enlighten or just tell me this is the part of the movie where you suspend belief. Thanks.

Sent from Gmail for mobile | mobile.google.com

Dave Tallman — 23 Jan 2009, 21:21 · in reply to John Smith

John Smith wrote:

I don't see how they get inside either. Perhaps a lander went to Green and came back with stowaways. Quetzal has been there for 30 years or so.

A variation on the Horn/Silk trick would do it. Find some dying inhumi, allow them to possess people on the Whorl (whose own souls are dying, if that matters). Let them get access to landers, make trips to Green for some real inhumi, and shuttle some back who have fed on humans, etc.

J Jankiewicz — 24 Jan 2009, 22:07 · in reply to Dave Tallman

Sorry, I am still not buying it; to far-fetched if you will. Anyone else have issues with how the inhumi got?INSIDE the Whorl? Seems to hurt the tale a bit for me; too contrived.

[John Smith wrote: > I don't see how they get inside either. Perhaps a lander went to Green and came back with stowaways. Quetzal has been there for 30 years or so.<?

A variation on the Horn/Silk trick would do it. Find some dying inhumi, allow them to possess people on the Whorl (whose own souls are dying, if that matters). Let them get access to landers, make trips to Green for some real inhumi, and shuttle some back who have fed on humans, etc.

James Wynn — 25 Jan 2009, 00:01 · in reply to J Jankiewicz

Anyone else have issues with how the inhumi got INSIDE the Whorl?
Seems to hurt the tale a bit for me; too contrived.

The Neighbors said they let them in. Getting inside the Whorl was easy for them. Once you have help from the inside, it's easy.

J