

IROSF

The Urth list — 18 messages, 8 voices, 03 Apr 2009

<https://urth.darkrealm.vip/thread/urth/5395>

Exported from an unofficial mirror of a public mailing list. Copyright in each message remains with the person who wrote it. Email addresses are obscured as `user at host`, the form the original archive published. This file was rebuilt from parsed fields rather than retained headers, so it is faithful in content but not byte-exact.

O'Donnell, Tim BOSI — 03 Apr 2009, 09:48

With that in mind, anyone seen Michael Andre-Drussi's article on the IROSF today?

<http://www.irosf.com/q/zine/article/10536>

I quite enjoyed it. Although I do like his style of writing in general.

This passage made me laugh out loud:

"So Wolfe's mysteries are still open to further analysis and interpretation-just because I declare a mystery resolved in a certain way doesn't mean that it doesn't still have some life to it within the larger critical community. Far from it! We're all one big, happy family-which is to say, our numbers aren't very big, we aren't particularly happy, and we're not at all related.)"

James Wynn — 03 Apr 2009, 13:41 · in reply to O'Donnell, Tim BOSI

IROSFMichael also says something here that drives me bonkers:

"With the mysteries laid bare, it becomes apparent that enough clues were provided for such major mysteries to be solved in the original tetralogy. That Severian would travel through time to become both the Conciliator and Apu Punchau, rather than being a reincarnation, avatar, or descendant. And that the world would drown with the coming of the New Sun."

Well, yes, there are enough clues to have jumped to those conclusions. All the reader had to do was to accurately identify the jumping off points as such --while excluding the the non-jumping off points--- AND jump to the *correct* conclusion to the exclusion of the other potential conclusions.

When Wolfe says all the answers are "in the text" it is like saying that "Osama Bin Laden is 'right there' in Central Asia so why don't you go out and get him?"

Still, something that Wolfe's argument with Hartwell does make clear is that Wolfe had a very clear understanding of what was going on in his story, even the elements kept quite obscure. That's comforting, at least.

I agree with Michael that The Urth of the New Sun *was* necessary. I also think a Simarillion of the New Sun would greatly increase the general enjoyment and popularity of the books. But I don't think that will happen. Wolfe has said "the answers never last, but the mysteries never die".

J.

Matthew Groves — 03 Apr 2009, 17:46 · in reply to James Wynn

On Fri, Apr 3, 2009 at 8:41 AM, James Wynn <crushtv at gmail.com> wrote:

I agree with Michael that The Urth of the New Sun *was* necessary. I also think a Simarillion of the New Sun would greatly increase the general enjoyment and popularity of the books.

I call this hypothetical and much-desired-by-me book The Clawmarillion.

John Watkins — 03 Apr 2009, 18:02 · in reply to Matthew Groves

Are we talking about a hypothetical backstory to the Red Sun Whorl (a Clawmarillion), or a hypothetical collection of Gene Wolfe's ideas, thoughts, unused notions, etc. (a History of Briah) ?

Regarding hypothetical books by Wolfe, I crave a fourth and concluding Latro book above all else. Gene has two other projects scheduled, but I'm hopeful that he'll do a fourth Latro after that. I think we're done with the Sun, so to speak.

On Fri, Apr 3, 2009 at 1:46 PM, Matthew Groves

<matthewalangroves at gmail.com> wrote:

On Fri, Apr 3, 2009 at 8:41 AM, James Wynn <crushtv at gmail.com> wrote:

I agree with Michael that The Urth of the New Sun **was** necessary. I also think a Simarillion of the New Sun would greatly increase the general enjoyment and popularity of the books.

I call this hypothetical and much-desired-by-me book The Clawmarillion.

brunians at brunians.org — 03 Apr 2009, 18:11 · in reply to John Watkins

But how would the Latro series conclude?

He's already been home and forgotten all about it.

Now he's short his sword and (I misremember) does he actually remember his sword or has he forgotten it?

I was hoping that Latro would get to India, where there are ancient stories about really advanced technology (like machine guns and rocket launchers, cloning, artificial wombs, several kinds of aircraft, nuclear weapons ...).

I'll certainly read whatever Wolfe comes up with, of course.

.

Are we talking about a hypothetical backstory to the Red Sun Whorl (a Clawmarillion), or a hypothetical collection of Gene Wolfe's ideas, thoughts, unused notions, etc. (a History of Briah) ?

Regarding hypothetical books by Wolfe, I crave a fourth and concluding Latro book above all else. Gene has two other projects scheduled, but I'm hopeful that he'll do a fourth Latro after that. I think we're done with the Sun, so to speak.

On Fri, Apr 3, 2009 at 1:46 PM, Matthew Groves

<matthewalangroves at gmail.com> wrote:

On Fri, Apr 3, 2009 at 8:41 AM, James Wynn <crushtv at gmail.com> wrote:

I agree with Michael that The Urth of the New Sun **was** necessary. I also think a Simarillion of the New Sun would greatly increase the general enjoyment and popularity of the books.

I call this hypothetical and much-desired-by-me book The Clawmarillion.

John Watkins — 03 Apr 2009, 18:14 · in reply to brunians at brunians.org

On Fri, Apr 3, 2009 at 2:11 PM, <brunians at brunians.org> wrote:
But how would the Latro series conclude?

He's already been home and forgotten all about it.

Beats me. I got lost during Sidon. I think he needs miraculous intervention of some sort, but he's had countless opportunities for it and instead been the pawn of basically every diety he encounters to one degree or another.

Now he's short his sword and (I misremember) does he actually remember his sword or has he forgotten it?

I was hoping that Latro would get to India, where there are ancient stories about really advanced technology (like machine guns and rocket launchers, cloning, artificial wombs, several kinds of aircraft, nuclear weapons ...).

I'll certainly read whatever Wolfe comes up with, of course.

.

Are we talking about a hypothetical backstory to the Red Sun Whorl (a Clawmarillion), or a hypothetical collection of Gene Wolfe's ideas, thoughts, unused notions, etc. (a History of Briah) ?

Regarding hypothetical books by Wolfe, I crave a fourth and concluding Latro book above all else. Gene has two other projects scheduled, but I'm hopeful that he'll do a fourth Latro after that. I think we're done with the Sun, so to speak.

On Fri, Apr 3, 2009 at 1:46 PM, Matthew Groves
<matthewalangroves at gmail.com> wrote:

On Fri, Apr 3, 2009 at 8:41 AM, James Wynn <crushtv at gmail.com> wrote:

I agree with Michael that The Urth of the New Sun **was** necessary. I also think a Simarillion of the New Sun would greatly increase the general enjoyment and popularity of the books.

I call this hypothetical and much-desired-by-me book The Clawmarillion.

brunians at brunians.org — 03 Apr 2009, 18:26 · in reply to John Watkins

Palestine is not far from Egypt (and it is real, real close to Sidon). Palestine under Persian rule is more peaceful than it has been before or since. The second Temple is an operating reality. Do you think he might find a more benevolent God in Jerusalem?

.

On Fri, Apr 3, 2009 at 2:11 PM, <brunians at brunians.org> wrote:

But how would the Latro series conclude?

He's already been home and forgotten all about it.

Beats me. I got lost during Sidon. I think he needs miraculous intervention of some sort, but he's had countless opportunities for it and instead been the pawn of basically every diety he encounters to one degree or another.

Now he's short his sword and (I misremember) does he actually remember his sword or has he forgotten it?

I was hoping that Latro would get to India, where there are ancient stories about really advanced technology (like machine guns and rocket launchers, cloning, artificial wombs, several kinds of aircraft, nuclear weapons ...).

I'll certainly read whatever Wolfe comes up with, of course.

.

Are we talking about a hypothetical backstory to the Red Sun Whorl (a Clawmarillion), or a hypothetical collection of Gene Wolfe's ideas, thoughts, unused notions, etc. (a History of Briah) ?

Regarding hypothetical books by Wolfe, I crave a fourth and concluding Latro book above all else. Gene has two other projects scheduled, but I'm hopeful that he'll do a fourth Latro after that. I think we're done with the Sun, so to speak.

On Fri, Apr 3, 2009 at 1:46 PM, Matthew Groves <matthewalangroves at gmail.com> wrote:

On Fri, Apr 3, 2009 at 8:41 AM, James Wynn <crushtv at gmail.com> wrote:

I agree with Michael that The Urth of the New Sun **was** necessary.

I also think a Simarillion of the New Sun would greatly increase the general enjoyment and popularity of the books.

I call this hypothetical and much-desired-by-me book The Clawmarillion.

Gene seems to me to be too coy to do that outright. I imagine the One True God would act through an intermediary of some sort. The members of this list could probably come up with six or seven plausible answers for the time period without much trouble.

On Fri, Apr 3, 2009 at 2:26 PM, <brunians at brunians.org> wrote:
Palestine is not far from Egypt (and it is real, real close to Sidon).
Palestine under Persian rule is more peaceful than it has been before or since. The second Temple is an operating reality. Do you think he might find a more benevolent God in Jerusalem?

.

On Fri, Apr 3, 2009 at 2:11 PM, <brunians at brunians.org> wrote:

But how would the Latro series conclude?

He's already been home and forgotten all about it.

Beats me. I got lost during Sidon. I think he needs miraculous intervention of some sort, but he's had countless opportunities for it and instead been the pawn of basically every diety he encounters to one degree or another.

Now he's short his sword and (I misremember) does he actually remember his sword or has he forgotten it?

I was hoping that Latro would get to India, where there are ancient stories about really advanced technology (like machine guns and rocket launchers, cloning, artificial wombs, several kinds of aircraft, nuclear weapons ...).

I'll certainly read whatever Wolfe comes up with, of course.

.

Are we talking about a hypothetical backstory to the Red Sun Whorl (a Clawmarillion), or a hypothetical collection of Gene Wolfe's ideas, thoughts, unused notions, etc. (a History of Briah) ?

Regarding hypothetical books by Wolfe, I crave a fourth and concluding Latro book above all else. Gene has two other projects scheduled, but I'm hopeful that he'll do a fourth Latro after that. I think we're done with the Sun, so to speak.

On Fri, Apr 3, 2009 at 1:46 PM, Matthew Groves <matthewalangroves at gmail.com> wrote:

On Fri, Apr 3, 2009 at 8:41 AM, James Wynn <crushtv at gmail.com> wrote:

I agree with Michael that The Urth of the New Sun **was** necessary.

I
also
think a Simarillion of the New Sun would greatly increase the
general
enjoyment and popularity of the books.

I call this hypothetical and much-desired-by-me book The
Clawmarillion.

brunians at brunians.org — 03 Apr 2009, 19:17 · in reply to John Watkins

It's an interesting period in Jewish history: when people talked about the Messiah, at that time, they usually meant Cyrus the Great.

.
Gene seems to me to be too coy to do that outright. I imagine the One True God would act through an intermediary of some sort. The members of this list could probably come up with six or seven plausible answers for the time period without much trouble.

On Fri, Apr 3, 2009 at 2:26 PM, <brunians at brunians.org> wrote:

Palestine is not far from Egypt (and it is real, real close to Sidon). Palestine under Persian rule is more peaceful than it has been before or since. The second Temple is an operating reality. Do you think he might find a more benevolent God in Jerusalem?

.
On Fri, Apr 3, 2009 at 2:11 PM, <brunians at brunians.org> wrote:

But how would the Latro series conclude?

He's already been home and forgotten all about it.

Beats me. I got lost during Sidon. I think he needs miraculous intervention of some sort, but he's had countless opportunities for it and instead been the pawn of basically every diety he encounters to one degree or another.

Now he's short his sword and (I misremember) does he actually remember his sword or has he forgotten it?

I was hoping that Latro would get to India, where there are ancient stories about really advanced technology (like machine guns and rocket launchers, cloning, artificial wombs, several kinds of aircraft, nuclear weapons ...).

I'll certainly read whatever Wolfe comes up with, of course.

.

Are we talking about a hypothetical backstory to the Red Sun Whorl (a Clawmarillion), or a hypothetical collection of Gene Wolfe's ideas, thoughts, unused notions, etc. (a History of Briah) ?

Regarding hypothetical books by Wolfe, I crave a fourth and concluding Latro book above all else. Gene has two other projects scheduled, but I'm hopeful that he'll do a fourth Latro after that. I think we're done with the Sun, so to speak.

On Fri, Apr 3, 2009 at 1:46 PM, Matthew Groves <matthewalangroves at gmail.com> wrote:

On Fri, Apr 3, 2009 at 8:41 AM, James Wynn <crushtv at gmail.com> wrote:

I agree with Michael that The Urth of the New Sun *was* necessary.

I also think a Simarillion of the New Sun would greatly increase the general enjoyment and popularity of the books.

I call this hypothetical and much-desired-by-me book The Clawmarillion.

b sharp — 03 Apr 2009, 20:08 · follows brunians at brunians.org

If there is ever to be a "Clawmarillion" wouldn't it have to follow the path of The Silmarillion? Meaning it would be published posthumously and completed by Gene Wolfe's son, Roy (C. Lackey, ;-))

-bsharp

JBarach at aol.com — 03 Apr 2009, 20:14 · follows b sharp

In a message dated 4/3/2009 11:11:33 A.M. Pacific Daylight Time, brunians at brunians.org writes:

But how would the Latro series conclude?

[_http://members.bellatlantic.net/~vze2tmhh/wolfebj.html#sold_](http://members.bellatlantic.net/~vze2tmhh/wolfebj.html#sold_)
(<http://members.bellatlantic.net/~vze2tmhh/wolfebj.html#sold>)

Wolfe's original idea was to get Latro to the Semitic world (and I assume that's been satisfied in Soldier of Sidon) and ultimately to the New World.

John

*****Worried about job security? Check out the 5 safest jobs in a recession.
(<http://jobs.aol.com/gallery/growing-job-industries?ncid=emlcntuscare00000003>)

brunians at brunians.org — 03 Apr 2009, 21:02 · in reply to JBarach at aol.com

That would be how you'd get to the New World, back then, for sure.

.

In a message dated 4/3/2009 11:11:33 A.M. Pacific Daylight Time,
brunians at brunians.org writes:

But how would the Latro series conclude?

http://members.bellatlantic.net/~vze2tmhh/wolfejbj.html#sold
(<http://members.bellatlantic.net/~vze2tmhh/wolfejbj.html#sold>)

Wolfe's original idea was to get Latro to the Semitic world (and I assume that's been satisfied in Soldier of Sidon) and ultimately to the New World.

John

*****Worried about job security? Check out the 5 safest jobs in a recession.
(<http://jobs.aol.com/gallery/growing-job-industries?ncid=emlcntuscare00000003>)

Mo Holkar / UKG — 03 Apr 2009, 21:23 · in reply to brunians at brunians.org

At 20:17 03/04/2009, you wrote:

It's an interesting period in Jewish history: when people talked about the Messiah, at that time, they usually meant Cyrus the Great.

I think that had to some extent worn off by the time of the setting of the Soldier books, upwards of 50 years after Cyrus's death.

Mo

~ # ~

WolfeWiki now at:

<http://www.wolfewiki.com/pmwiki/>

brunians at brunians.org — 03 Apr 2009, 21:40 · in reply to Mo Holkar / UKG

At 20:17 03/04/2009, you wrote:

It's an interesting period in Jewish history: when people talked about the Messiah, at that time, they usually meant Cyrus the Great.

I think that had to some extent worn off by the time of the setting of the Soldier books, upwards of 50 years after Cyrus's death.

Why do you say that? The books of Ezra and Nehemiah were recently published and widely read.

What did people mean, then, when they said 'moshiach', anyway?

.

Mo Holkar / UKG — 04 Apr 2009, 10:41 · in reply to brunians at brunians.org

At 22:40 03/04/2009, brunians wrote:

At 20:17 03/04/2009, you wrote:

It's an interesting period in Jewish history: when people talked about the Messiah, at that time, they usually meant Cyrus the Great.

I think that had to some extent worn off by the time of the setting of the Soldier books, upwards of 50 years after Cyrus's death.

Why do you say that? The books of Ezra and Nehemiah were recently published and widely read.

Sure, and those books talk about Darius and Artaxerxes in the same enthusiastic terms as they do about Cyrus. Clearly Cyrus was still regarded as an anointed arm of the Lord, but not as "The" Messiah in the Book of Isaiah sense. Which is what I thought you were referring to -- apologies if not.

What did people mean, then, when they said 'moshiach', anyway?

An interesting question, which we can only explore by rather imperfect means. Presumably, though, it's safe to say that different people may have meant different things by it.

best,

Mo

~ # ~

WolfeWiki now at:

<http://www.wolfewiki.com/pmwiki/>

brunians at brunians.org — 04 Apr 2009, 11:05 · in reply to Mo Holkar / UKG

At 22:40 03/04/2009, brunians wrote:

At 20:17 03/04/2009, you wrote:

It's an interesting period in Jewish history: when people talked about the Messiah, at that time, they usually meant Cyrus the Great.

I think that had to some extent worn off by the time of the setting of the Soldier books, upwards of 50 years after Cyrus's death.

Why do you say that? The books of Ezra and Nehemiah were recently published and widely read.

Sure, and those books talk about Darius and Artaxerxes in the same enthusiastic terms as they do about Cyrus.

I believe but am not sure that Messiah became one of the regular titles of the Persian Great King, and was read out in the familiar litany, "King, Great King, King of Kings, King of Persia, King of Media, King of the Two Lands, King of Babylon, Messiah"

Clearly Cyrus was still regarded as an anointed arm of the Lord, but not as "The" Messiah in the Book of Isaiah sense.

Are we talking a Christian or a Jewish interpretation of the Book of Isaiah? They are significantly different, you know.

Which is what I thought you were referring to -- apologies if not.

See directly above....

What did people mean, then, when they said 'moshiach', anyway?

An interesting question, which we can only explore by rather imperfect means. Presumably, though, it's safe to say that different people may have meant different things by it.

Significantly, there is the Christian idea of the Messiah being God Incarnate, which idea is anathema to the Jews, and the Jewish conception, which is much more that of a national redeemer, someone who restores the nation - sort of like Cyrus did.

This is an oversimplification, but since this is one of the main differences between the two faiths it cannot, I think, be overemphasized.

.

Mo Holkar / UKG — 04 Apr 2009, 15:10 · in reply to brunians at brunians.org

At 12:05 04/04/2009, brunians wrote:

Clearly Cyrus was still regarded as an anointed arm of the Lord, but not as "The" Messiah in the Book of Isaiah sense.

Are we talking a Christian or a Jewish interpretation of the Book of Isaiah? They are significantly different, you know.

I've been ignoring the Christian interpretation, as irrelevant to the historical period under consideration. Although of course it may be relevant to the books, as this is Wolfe we're talking about. Perhaps someone who knows more than me about it can comment.

What did people mean, then, when they said 'moshiach', anyway?

An interesting question, which we can only explore by rather imperfect means. Presumably, though, it's safe to say that different people may have meant different things by it.

Significantly, there is the Christian idea of the Messiah being God Incarnate, which idea is anathema to the Jews, and the Jewish conception, which is much more that of a national redeemer, someone who restores the nation - sort of like Cyrus did.

Absolutely. But within Judaism itself there seem to have been variant Messiah understandings -- for example, the stipulation in Isaiah 11 that the awaited Messiah would be Jewish and of the line of David, irreconcilable with the acclamation of Cyrus as Messiah in Isaiah 45. It is a complex issue, particularly when we don't know exactly when the relevant texts were written, or (as in the case of Isaiah) suspect they were cobbled together from several authors over a lengthy period.

My point really was, though, that while many Jews of the Soldier setting would have been looking back to Cyrus as the good old Messiah that was, we can expect that plenty of others would have been looking forward to the next one.

best wishes,

Mo

~ # ~

WolfeWiki now at:

<http://www.wolfewiki.com/pmwiki/>

brunians at brunians.org — 04 Apr 2009, 16:33 · in reply to Mo Holkar / UKG

Significantly, there is the Christian idea of the Messiah being God Incarnate, which idea is anathema to the Jews, and the Jewish conception, which is much more that of a national redeemer, someone who restores the nation - sort of like Cyrus did.

Absolutely. But within Judaism itself there seem to have been variant Messiah understandings -- for example, the stipulation in Isaiah 11 that the awaited Messiah would be Jewish and of the line of David, irreconcilable with the acclamation of Cyrus as Messiah in Isaiah 45. It is a complex issue, particularly when we don't know exactly when the relevant texts were written, or (as in the case of Isaiah) suspect they were cobbled together from several authors over a lengthy period.

My point really was, though, that while many Jews of the Soldier setting would have been looking back to Cyrus as the good old Messiah that was, we can expect that plenty of others would have been looking forward to the next one.

That's pretty reasonable on the face of it and I am unaware of any evidence against it.

.