

Wizard-Knight sucks, or, is there any scholarly research on it?

The Urth list — 6 messages, 5 voices, 09 Nov 2009

<https://urth.darkrealm.vip/thread/urth/5507>

Exported from an unofficial mirror of a public mailing list. Copyright in each message remains with the person who wrote it. Email addresses are obscured as `user at host`, the form the original archive published. This file was rebuilt from parsed fields rather than retained headers, so it is faithful in content but not byte-exact.

Gwern Branwen — 09 Nov 2009, 23:59

<http://answers.yahoo.com/question/index?qid=20091108215604AAFWQWS>

I don't know whether to be more chagrined or amused at him. (I thought of resurrecting my Yahoo account and telling him he'd've to pay for the only scholarly work or spend several days reading through urth.net.) I didn't think The Knight was that bad, although I didn't enjoy it nearly as much as New Sun or Cerberus.

gwern

Lane Haygood — 10 Nov 2009, 00:26 · in reply to Gwern Branwen

Link him here! Fresh meat!

I found TWK heavy handed in it's symbolism and an attempt to recapture the heavily stylized prose of BOTNS without the organic nature of Severian's voice. Maybe Abel really is dumb and illiterate, but it was sometimes difficult to follow the narrative because Abel is a bad storyteller. I think the story would've been better told in the Whorl style

Sent from my iPhone

On Nov 9, 2009, at 5:59 PM, Gwern Branwen <gwern0 at gmail.com> wrote:
<http://answers.yahoo.com/question/index?qid=20091108215604AAFWQWS>

I don't know whether to be more chagrined or amused at him. (I thought of resurrecting my Yahoo account and telling him he'd've to pay for the only scholarly work or spend several days reading through urth.net.) I didn't think The Knight was that bad, although I didn't enjoy it nearly as much as New Sun or Cerberus.

--

gwern

James Wynn — 10 Nov 2009, 02:18 · in reply to Lane Haygood

Maybe Abel really is dumb and illiterate, but it was sometimes difficult to follow the narrative because Abel is a bad storyteller.

Well, honestly, the part about being a bad story-teller is true of Severian, as well (to the extent that it IS true). The Book of the New Sun was the first Wolfe story I'd read. I told the guy who recommended it that I thought Wolfe was a great creator of worlds but only a so-so writer. Then I read The Fifth Head of Cerberus and decided that --based on the two novels-- he was the best science fiction writer I'd ever read. But the "weaknesses" in the story-telling in TWK (if they are weaknesses) are the same as those in TBotNS.

J.

brunians at brunians.org — 10 Nov 2009, 02:43 · in reply to Gwern Branwen

I thought Wizard-Knight was excellent.

<http://answers.yahoo.com/question/index?qid=20091108215604AAFWQWS>

I don't know whether to be more chagrined or amused at him. (I thought of resurrecting my Yahoo account and telling him he'd've to pay for the only scholarly work or spend several days reading through urth.net.) I didn't think _The Knight_ was that bad, although I didn't enjoy it nearly as much as _New Sun_ or _Cerberus_.

--

gwern

David Duffy — 10 Nov 2009, 03:40 · in reply to James Wynn

On Mon, 9 Nov 2009, James Wynn wrote:

Maybe Abel really is dumb and illiterate, but it was sometimes difficult to follow the narrative because Abel is a bad storyteller.

Well, honestly, the part about being a bad story-teller is true of Severian, as well (to the extent that it IS true).

And what about guy in _Peace_ -- he's all over the place ;)

David Duffy

Lane Haygood — 10 Nov 2009, 05:33 · in reply to David Duffy

See, I found Severian's voice and prose engaging. He's a liar (maybe), and certainly not above shading the story to paint him in a better light than the facts might justify, but I thoroughly enjoyed reading what he wrote. I got the sense that underneath, he's not really a terrible guy.

Unlike Abel. Abel is a brute and a bully. Didn't identify with him at all. I still liked the book, even if the "subvert heathen beliefs to Christianity!" theme was a little heavy-handed versus some of Wolfe's other books. Like I said, it's not Wolfe's most subtle work, but it's a damn sight better than most books out there.

-LH

On Mon, Nov 9, 2009 at 9:40 PM, David Duffy <David.Duffy at qimr.edu.au> wrote:

On Mon, 9 Nov 2009, James Wynn wrote:

Maybe Abel really is dumb and illiterate, but it was ?sometimes difficult to follow the narrative because Abel is a bad ?storyteller.

Well, honestly, the part about being a bad story-teller is true of Severian, as well (to the extent that it IS true).

And what about guy in _Peace_ -- he's all over the place ;)

David Duffy

