

Alien Monsters

The Urth list — 3 messages, 3 voices, 06 Aug 2010

<https://urth.darkrealm.vip/thread/urth/5693>

Exported from an unofficial mirror of a public mailing list. Copyright in each message remains with the person who wrote it. Email addresses are obscured as `user at host`, the form the original archive published. This file was rebuilt from parsed fields rather than retained headers, so it is faithful in content but not byte-exact.

Nicholas — 06 Aug 2010, 16:18

I call bull crap. Severian lives most of his adult life following rules and only breaks them under the severest of duress. The first example is his first girlfriend being tortured to death. The second is what the community views as his aunt is ordered executed by strangulation for not loving her psycopathic husband and after Sevs had a blow out with his second girlfriend/mother. Both can be seen as Sevs development of higher loyalties. Despite that he feels bad about both. Can we have Brunians back now? His sort of crazy was at least humorous.

David Stockhoff — 06 Aug 2010, 16:28 · in reply to Nicholas

I agree. Severian obeys when he can. He's neither a rebel nor an automaton; the fact that Vodalus had his sympathies merely means that he thinks about morality. What thinking young man wouldn't want to overthrow the existing order in that world?

Nor does he follow Vodalus' orders blindly, but only because the alzado made him.

He also lies and rapes, but in situations where he may perhaps be forgiven.

Nicholas wrote:

I call bull crap. Severian lives most of his adult life following rules and only breaks them under the severest of duress. The first example is his first girlfriend being tortured to death. The second is what the community views as his aunt is ordered executed by strangulation for not loving her psycopathic husband and after Sevs had a blow out with his second girlfriend/mother. Both can be seen as Sevs development of higher loyalties. Despite that he feels bad about both. Can we have Brunians back now? His sort of crazy was at least humorous.

Urth Mailing List

Jeff Wilson — 06 Aug 2010, 20:00 · in reply to David Stockhoff

On 8/6/2010 11:28 AM, David Stockhoff wrote:

I agree. Severian obeys when he can.

That's not much of a restriction given Severian's gift of rationalization.

Of course Severian is mostly obedient to the written and unwritten rules of his society, but is also keenly aware that the occasions that he hasn't obeyed have been rather on the extreme side. Upon his return to the throne in URTH he admits that he is a doer of great evil like Baldanders as well as a doer of great good, and that most people are likewise creatures given to both.

It is probably Severian's adherence to moral if not legal rules that enable him to be such a

successful rule-breaker, since his acquaintances and collaborators have good reason to believe he can be trusted to do what evil crime is necessary and then stop. Just make sure he isn't required to torture a woman he's had sex with.

Jeff Wilson - jwilson at io.com
IEEE Student Chapter Blog at
< <http://ieeetamut.org> >