

(No subject)

The Urth list — 3 messages, 3 voices, 17 Dec 2010

<https://urth.darkrealm.vip/thread/urth/5839>

Exported from an unofficial mirror of a public mailing list. Copyright in each message remains with the person who wrote it. Email addresses are obscured as `user at host`, the form the original archive published. This file was rebuilt from parsed fields rather than retained headers, so it is faithful in content but not byte-exact.

Andrew Mason — 17 Dec 2010, 12:30

Lee Berman wrote:

. Since I am not a Christian or religious, it didn't

bother me to think that Severian and the story I treasure was not in a Judeo-Christian universe.

It depends, I think, what we mean by saying that it's not a Judaeo-Christian universe. A universe without a saviour? It may be; I'm not committed on that. But if we (as Christians) believe in universes without a saviour in them, that is because the saving power of the Christ in this world extends to them. A universe not made - or caused, at least indirectly - by the Judaeo-Christian God? I find it very hard to believe that Wolfe would conceive of that. (I mean, he might well think 'Suppose God as we know him did not exist, but a completely different kind of first principle did'. But I don't think he would imagine that within a cycle of universes some of which are made by the Judaeo-Christian God, others are not. God, if he exists at all, is all-embracing.)

It seems to be a running theme of the _Sun_ cycle that while there are many beings that can be called gods, there is one true God; and that God is often imagined in Christian terms (though I agree he is imagined in pagan terms as well).

The presence of other gods (in some sense) does not count against this, I think, because Wolfe believes in the existence of pagan gods within this universe, which is made by the Judaeo-Christian God.

I'm not too political but I am rabidly anti-torture and generally averse to

parasitic exploitation of humans by other humans in the manner of chatelaines-khaibits. So, distancing myself from Urth isn't so difficult at all, for me.

But can we distance ourselves from Urth? Torture exists in our world. If kahibits don't, it's just because we don't have the technology; exploitation of women, in various forms, does. The Commonwealth is a pretty nasty place in many ways, but is it worse than Nazi Germany or Stalinist Russia? I think this is just the inherent corruption of humanity, not a sign of a godless world.

David Stockhoff — 17 Dec 2010, 12:55 · in reply to Andrew Mason

Andrew, I think the theology and the text converge on these points. Thanks for putting it so well.

On 12/17/2010 7:30 AM, Andrew Mason wrote:

Lee Berman wrote:

. Since I am not a Christian or religious, it didn't

bother me to think that Severian and the story I treasure was not in a Judeo-Christian universe.

It depends, I think, what we mean by saying that it's not a

Judaean-Christian universe. A universe without a saviour? It may be; I'm not committed on that. But if we (as Christians) believe in universes without a saviour in them, that is because the saving power of the Christ in this world extends to them. A universe not made - or caused, at least indirectly - by the Judaean-Christian God? I find it very hard to believe that Wolfe would conceive of that. (I mean, he might well think 'Suppose God as we know him did not exist, but a completely different kind of first principle did'. But I don't think he would imagine that within a cycle of universes some of which are made by the Judaean-Christian God, others are not. God, if he exists at all, is all-embracing.)

It seems to be a running theme of the Sun cycle that while there are many beings that can be called gods, there is one true God; and that God is often imagined in Christian terms (though I agree he is imagined in pagan terms as well).

The presence of other gods (in some sense) does not count against this, I think, because Wolfe believes in the existence of pagan gods within this universe, which is made by the Judaean-Christian God.

Son of Witz — 17 Dec 2010, 17:15 · in reply to Andrew Mason

On Dec 17, 2010, at 4:30 AM, Andrew Mason <andrew.mason53 at gmail.com> wrote:
Lee Berman wrote:

. Since I am not a Christian or religious, it didn't bother me to think that Severian and the story I treasure was not in a Judeo-Christian universe.

It depends, I think, what we mean by saying that it's not a Judaean-Christian universe. A universe without a saviour? It may be; I'm not committed on that. But if we (as Christians) believe in universes without a saviour in them, that is because the saving power of the Christ in this world extends to them. A universe not made - or caused, at least indirectly - by the Judaean-Christian God? I find it very hard to believe that Wolfe would conceive of that. (I mean, he might well think 'Suppose God as we know him did not exist, but a completely different kind of first principle did'. But I don't think he would imagine that within a cycle of universes some of which are made by the Judaean-Christian God, others are not. God, if he exists at all, is all-embracing.)

It seems to be a running theme of the Sun cycle that while there are many beings that can be called gods, there is one true God; and that God is often imagined in Christian terms (though I agree he is imagined in pagan terms as well).

The presence of other gods (in some sense) does not count against this, I think, because Wolfe believes in the existence of pagan gods within this universe, which is made by the Judaean-Christian God.

I'm not too political but I am rabidly anti-torture and generally averse to parasitic exploitation of humans by other humans in the manner of chatelaines-khaibits. So, distancing myself from Urth isn't so difficult at all, for me.

But can we distance ourselves from Urth? Torture exists in our world.

If kahibits don't, it's just because we don't have the technology; exploitation of women, in various forms, does. The Commonwealth is a pretty nasty place in many ways, but is it worse than Nazi Germany or Stalinist Russia? I think this is just the inherent corruption of humanity, not a sign of a godless world.

Excellent!