

Return to the Whorl

The Urth list — 8 messages, 6 voices, 11 Oct 2011

<https://urth.darkrealm.vip/thread/urth/6063>

Exported from an unofficial mirror of a public mailing list. Copyright in each message remains with the person who wrote it. Email addresses are obscured as `user at host`, the form the original archive published. This file was rebuilt from parsed fields rather than retained headers, so it is faithful in content but not byte-exact.

larry miller — 11 Oct 2011, 11:43

Almost done with my reread of RttW. Haven't read it since I bought the omnibus from the scifi bookclub years ago. I forgot how irritating Pigs dialogue is. Can anyone explain the secret of the Inhum to me? Either I am overthinking it or missed the point completely. Guess I was wrong about Scylla of the Whorl and Scylla of Urth being the same entity. Forgot all about Scylla making the deal with the undine after traveling to Nessus with Horn. After Im done I think its time to revisit Book of the Long Sun.

Tim O'Donnell — 11 Oct 2011, 13:50 · follows larry miller

As far as I am aware the secret of the Inhum is essentially the Golden Rule. If we were nicer to each other they could not be feed on us. As they absorb their traits from their hosts they absorb their deceptiveness and cruelty from humans.

If we were nicer to us sure they would still be a danger, but the same level of danger as a snake or some other deadly animal.

Date: Tue, 11 Oct 2011 07:43:05 -0400

From: larry miller <biglar1984 at gmail.com>

To: urth at lists.urth.net

Subject: (urth) Return to the Whorl

Message-ID:

<CAMBsQ=KK=sypxEr6VJDWz4AZvfeEEUXu+r+Nz_5175FjpZTMEQ at mail.gmail.com>

Content-Type: text/plain; charset=ISO-8859-1

Almost done with my reread of RttW. Haven't read it since I bought the omnibus from the scifi bookclub years ago. I forgot how irritating Pigs dialogue is. Can anyone explain the secret of the Inhum to me? Either I am overthinking it or missed the point completely. Guess I was wrong about Scylla of the Whorl and Scylla of Urth being the same entity. Forgot all about Scylla making the deal with the undine after traveling to Nessus with Horn. After Im done I think its time to revisit Book of the Long Sun.

James Wynn — 11 Oct 2011, 14:22 · in reply to Tim O'Donnell

They feed on us because we feed on each other. The animal inhum would feed on us but their offspring would not.

On 10/11/2011 8:50 AM, Tim O'Donnell wrote:

As far as I am aware the secret of the Inhum is essentially the Golden Rule.

If we were nicer to each other they could not be feed on us. As they absorb their traits from their hosts they absorb their deceptiveness and cruelty

from humans.

If we were nicer to us sure they would still be a danger, but the same level of danger as a snake or some other deadly animal.

Jerry Friedman — 11 Oct 2011, 22:57 · in reply to James Wynn

From: James Wynn crushtv at gmail.com

On 10/11/2011 8:50 AM, Tim O'Donnell wrote:

As far as I am aware the secret of the Inhumans is essentially the Golden Rule.

If we were nicer to each other they could not be feed on us. As they absorb their traits from their hosts they absorb their deceptiveness and cruelty from humans.

If we were nicer to us sure they would still be a danger, but the same level of danger as a snake or some other deadly animal.

For me, this resonates with the trilogy's theme of parent-child relations. Children absorb traits to some extent from their parents and other adults, so if we were nicer to children--indeed to people in general--they'd be nicer to us.

They feed on us because we feed on each other. The animal inhumans would feed on us but their offspring would not.

Which would put those offspring in a world of hurt, incidentally. Though /their/ offspring, if any, might go back to feeding on us. The parallel to children may break down here.

Jerry Friedman

larry miller — 12 Oct 2011, 11:44 · follows Jerry Friedman

finished up RttW and I am still confused about a number of things.

1) Why exactly does Scylla want to return to her body buried in Nessus? 2) What was the deal she and Horn made with the Megatherian Scylla? 3) Why does Severian say the bird (that has to be Oreb) belong to Master Malrubius? 4) Where does the Whorl going when its relaunched?

António Pedro Marques — 12 Oct 2011, 12:37 · in reply to larry miller

larry miller wrote (12-10-2011 12:44):

finished up RttW and I am still confused about a number of things.

1) Why exactly does Scylla want to return to her body buried in Nessus? 2) What was the deal she and Horn made with the Megatherian Scylla? 3) Why does Severian say the bird (that has to be Oreb) belong to Master Malrubius? 4) Where does the Whorl going when its relaunched?

Could be.

Sergei SOLOVIEV — 12 Oct 2011, 13:36 · in reply to larry miller

My personal opinion is that 1) It is related to the idea

that for the final resurrection and Last Judgement the soul must be reunited with the body. For this purpose, by the way, the body must be buried and not burned, for example. I cannot remember, what is explicitly told on this in the Bible, but it is a very strong tradition in Catholic Church and Orthodox Christianity. GW gives it a sort of a twist - meaning that Scylla-Cilinia on the Long Sun Whorl, and even its "weak copy" in Oreb can be seen as having a "chunk of its main soul" and it must be reunited with its body. 2) The deal is that the Scylla on the red Sun Whorl teaches Horn how to find/call Seawrack using its language and in exchange he brings a

piece of soul of Cilinia who was connected with Scylla. 3) Because he thinks that Silk-Horn visiting the Red Sun Whorl as a sort of a ghost (in the Book of the Short Sun) is Malrubius. 4) I think that it has to return to the Urth (Ushas) to repopulate it after the flood.

Best

Sergei Soloviev

larry miller wrote:

finished up RttW and I am still confused about a number of things.

1) Why exactly does Scylla want to return to her body buried in Nessus? 2) What was the deal she and Horn made with the Megatherian Scylla? 3) Why does Severian say the bird (that has to be Oreb) belong to Master Malrubius? 4) Where does the Whorl going when its relaunched?

larry miller — 12 Oct 2011, 23:20 · in reply to Sergei SOLOVIEV

Is the deal explicitly stated in the text? I totally missed that. Earlier in the book Severian talks about Malrubius to Horn. Severian has to know this is the same man visiting him later because Horn asks him about his book. Why would he think Horn is Malrubius now? Did you read the interview where Wolfe says that Horn takes a part in the Hierodules plans but not a "Leading" part? That makes sense if Horn leads the returning Human stock who will one day become the Hierogrammates.

On 10/12/11, Sergei SOLOVIEV <soloviev at irit.fr> wrote:

My personal opinion is that 1) It is related to the idea that for the final resurrection and Last Judgement the soul must be reunited with the body. For this purpose, by the way, the body must be buried and not burned, for example. I cannot remember, what is explicitly told on this in the Bible, but it is a very strong tradition in Catholic Church and Ortodox Christianity.

GW gives it a sort of a twist - meaning that Scylla-Cilinia on the Long Sun Whorl, and even its "weak copy" in Oreb can be seen as having a "chunk of its

main soul" and it must be reunited with its body. 2) The deal is that the Scylla on the red Sun Whorl teaches Horn how to find/call Seawrack using its language and in exchange he brings a piece of soul of Cilinia who was connected with Scylla. 3) Because he thinks that Silk-Horn visiting the Red Sun Whorl as a sort of a ghost (in the Book of the Short Sun) is Malrubius. 4) I think that it has to return to the Urth (Ushas) to repopulate it after the flood.

Best

Sergei Soloviev

larry miller wrote:

finished up RttW and I am still confused about a number of things.

1) Why exactly does Scylla want to return to her body buried in Nessus? 2) What was the deal she and Horn made with the Megatherian Scylla? 3) Why does Severian say the bird (that has to be Oreb) belong to Master Malrubius? 4) Where does the Whorl going when its relaunched?
