

So Where DID the Guard Go?

The Urth list — 16 messages, 10 voices, 01 May 2014

<https://urth.darkrealm.vip/thread/urth/6542>

Exported from an unofficial mirror of a public mailing list. Copyright in each message remains with the person who wrote it. Email addresses are obscured as `user at host`, the form the original archive published. This file was rebuilt from parsed fields rather than retained headers, so it is faithful in content but not byte-exact.

William Graham — 01 May 2014, 21:48

Hello folks, I've been reading the lists for ages- thanks for the help.
I'm now one my second 'hard read' through BOTNS after half a dozen or so 'casual reads' since its publication.

I get tripped up on the fourth sentence.

Roche indicates, "The guard has gone".

The popular discussion on this page has historically been "Who asks, 'But why would the guard leave?' ?" in the next paragraph. While that discussion is very useful for introducing us to Wolfe's love of removing the net from underneath his readers' high wire, I cannot seem to find any place where those who have gone before have asked the more basic question:

"Yeah, where DID the guard go?"

The obvious answer is that he's patrolling, a possibility supported by the fact that Vodalus fires his weapon, but never indicates at whom. The issue however is that our apprentices are surprised to see the guard gone. If leaving his post to patrol were common, why the confusion over his absence?

V doesn't seemingly fire at the volunteers, the dialog between he and Badger and Thea support this, and only three of the volunteers (those pursuing Eata) could have possibly arrived at the site before Sev anyway.

So where's the guard, and why did V fire his weapon?

-WHG3

Dan'l Danehy-Oakes — 01 May 2014, 23:34 · in reply to William Graham

William -

I believe that this question is answered in the "Short Sun" trilogy. At least tentatively.

On Thu, May 1, 2014 at 2:48 PM, William Graham <cyfyguy at gmail.com> wrote:
Hello folks, I've been reading the lists for ages- thanks for the help.
I'm now one my second 'hard read' through BOTNS after half a dozen or so
'casual reads' since its publication.

I get tripped up on the fourth sentence.

Roche indicates, "The guard has gone".

The popular discussion on this page has historically been "Who asks, 'But

why would the guard leave?' ?" in the next paragraph. While that discussion is very useful for introducing us to Wolfe's love of removing the net from underneath his readers' high wire, I cannot seem to find any place where those who have gone before have asked the more basic question:

"Yeah, where DID the guard go?"

The obvious answer is that he's patrolling, a possibility supported by the fact that Vodalus fires his weapon, but never indicates at whom. The issue however is that our apprentices are surprised to see the guard gone. If leaving his post to patrol were common, why the confusion over his absence?

V doesn't seemingly fire at the volunteers, the dialog between he and Badger and Thea support this, and only three of the volunteers (those pursuing Eata) could have possibly arrived at the site before Sev anyway.

So where's the guard, and why did V fire his weapon?

-WHG3

William Graham — 02 May 2014, 01:34 · in reply to Dan'I Danehy-Oakes

LOL! It figures- four sentences in and I have to commit to reading another thousand pages to get half an answer! That's Wolfe for ya!

-WHG3

On Thu, May 1, 2014 at 7:34 PM, Dan'I Danehy-Oakes <danldo at gmail.com> wrote:
William -

I believe that this question is answered in the "Short Sun" trilogy. At least tentatively.

On Thu, May 1, 2014 at 2:48 PM, William Graham <cyfyguy at gmail.com> wrote:

Hello folks, I've been reading the lists for ages- thanks for the help. I'm now on my second 'hard read' through BOTNS after half a dozen or so 'casual reads' since its publication.

I get tripped up on the fourth sentence.

Roche indicates, "The guard has gone".

The popular discussion on this page has historically been "Who asks, 'But why would the guard leave?' ?" in the next paragraph. While that discussion is very useful for introducing us to Wolfe's love of removing the net from underneath his readers' high wire, I cannot seem to find any place where those who have gone before have asked the more basic question:

"Yeah, where DID the guard go?"

The obvious answer is that he's patrolling, a possibility supported by the fact that Vodalus fires his weapon, but never indicates at whom. The

issue however is that our apprentices are surprised to see the guard gone. If leaving his post to patrol were common, why the confusion over his absence?

V doesn't seemingly fire at the volunteers, the dialog between he and Badger and Thea support this, and only three of the volunteers (those pursuing Eata) could have possibly arrived at the site before Sev anyway.

So where's the guard, and why did V fire his weapon?

-WHG3

Antonin Scriabin — 02 May 2014, 20:22 · in reply to William Graham

Would you want it any other way?

On May 1, 2014 9:34 PM, "William Graham" <cyfyguy at gmail.com> wrote:
LOL! It figures- four sentences in and I have to commit to reading another thousand pages to get half an answer! That's Wolfe for ya!

-WHG3

On Thu, May 1, 2014 at 7:34 PM, Dan'l Danehy-Oakes <danldo at gmail.com> wrote:
William -

I believe that this question is answered in the "Short Sun" trilogy. At least tentatively.

On Thu, May 1, 2014 at 2:48 PM, William Graham <cyfyguy at gmail.com> wrote:
Hello folks, I've been reading the lists for ages- thanks for the help. I'm now on my second 'hard read' through BOTNS after half a dozen or so 'casual reads' since its publication.

I get tripped up on the fourth sentence.

Roche indicates, "The guard has gone".

The popular discussion on this page has historically been "Who asks, 'But why would the guard leave?' ?" in the next paragraph. While that discussion is very useful for introducing us to Wolfe's love of removing the net from underneath his readers' high wire, I cannot seem to find any place where those who have gone before have asked the more basic question:

"Yeah, where DID the guard go?"

The obvious answer is that he's patrolling, a possibility supported by the fact that Vodalus fires his weapon, but never indicates at whom. The issue however is that our apprentices are surprised to see the guard gone. If leaving his post to patrol were common, why the confusion over his absence?

V doesn't seemingly fire at the volunteers, the dialog between he and Badger and Thea support this, and only three of the volunteers (those pursuing Eata) could have possibly arrived at the site before Sev anyway.

So where's the guard, and why did V fire his weapon?

-WHG3

Gerry Quinn — 03 May 2014, 10:35 · in reply to William Graham

From: William Graham

Roche indicates, "The guard has gone".

The popular discussion on this page has historically been "Who asks, 'But why would the guard leave?' ?" in the next paragraph. While that discussion is very useful for introducing us to Wolfe's love of removing the net from underneath his readers' high wire, I cannot seem to find any place where those who have gone before have asked the more basic question:

I always just assumed that either he heard something (Vodalus) and went to investigate, or else Hildegande (most likely) quietly disposed of him and moved the corpse (or at least, the inert body).

He was expected to be at the gate, and wasn't there. But intruders were inside. That's as much of a Checkov's Gunshot as I need, even from Wolfe.

- Gerry Quinn

Andrew Mason — 04 May 2014, 20:34 · follows Gerry Quinn

I'm sure that Short Sun (specifically In Green's Jungles) does indeed tell us where the guard went; but I'm equally sure that this was not the answer Wolfe had in mind when he wrote New Sun; he wasn't planning that far ahead. So we can still ask what his original intention was. (The presence of the citizen volunteers suggests that either the guard is quite often absent, or his presence is ineffective.)

David Stockhoff — 04 May 2014, 22:13 · in reply to Andrew Mason

After looking at the chapter again . . . my assumption has always been that the guard was paid off.

On 5/4/2014 4:34 PM, Andrew Mason wrote:

I'm sure that Short Sun (specifically In Green's Jungles) does indeed tell us where the guard went; but I'm equally sure that this was not the answer Wolfe had in mind when he wrote New Sun; he wasn't planning that far ahead. So we can still ask what his

original intention was. (The presence of the citizen volunteers suggests that either the guard is quite often absent, or his presence is ineffective.)

Jeffery Wilson clueland.com — 04 May 2014, 23:51 · in reply to Andrew Mason

On 5/4/2014 3:34 PM, Andrew Mason wrote:

I'm sure that _Short Sun_ (specifically _In Green's Jungles_) does indeed tell us where the guard went; but I'm equally sure that this was not the answer Wolfe had in mind when he wrote _New Sun_; he wasn't planning _that_ far ahead. So we can still ask what his original intention was. (The presence of the citizen volunteers suggests that either the guard is quite often absent, or his presence is ineffective.)

Remember the saying about 5 buildings per living inhabitant of Nessus; how many of those 5 building's former inhabitants are now interred somewhere at the necropolis? That's a lot of graveyard per guard.

Jeff Wilson - < jwilson at clueland.com >
A&M Texarkana Computational Intelligence Lab
< <http://www.tamut.edu/cil> >

António Pedro Marques — 05 May 2014, 01:16 · in reply to Andrew Mason

No dia 04/05/2014, às 21:34, Andrew Mason <andrew.mason53 at gmail.com> escreveu:

I'm sure that _Short Sun_ (specifically _In Green's Jungles_) does indeed tell us where the guard went; but I'm equally sure that this was not the answer Wolfe had in mind when he wrote _New Sun_; he wasn't planning _that_ far ahead. So we can still ask what his original intention was.

But why would the author not insert his original intention into the latter book?

David Stockhoff — 05 May 2014, 03:06 · in reply to Jeffery Wilson clueland.com

On 5/4/2014 7:51 PM, Jeffery Wilson clueland.com wrote:

On 5/4/2014 3:34 PM, Andrew Mason wrote:

I'm sure that _Short Sun_ (specifically _In Green's Jungles_) does indeed tell us where the guard went; but I'm equally sure that this was not the answer Wolfe had in mind when he wrote _New Sun_; he wasn't planning _that_ far ahead. So we can still ask what his original intention was. (The presence of the citizen volunteers suggests that either the guard is quite often absent, or his presence is ineffective.)

Remember the saying about 5 buildings per living inhabitant of Nessus; how many of those 5 building's former inhabitants are now interred somewhere at the necropolis? That's a lot of graveyard per guard.

That too.

Marc Aramini — 05 May 2014, 05:53 · in reply to Andrew Mason

Or Wolfe re-read New Sun in preparation for writing Short Sun and thought shoot ... where the heck did that guard go?

On Sun, May 4, 2014 at 1:34 PM, Andrew Mason
<andrew.mason53 at gmail.com> wrote:

I'm sure that _Short Sun_ (specifically _In Green's Jungles_) does indeed tell us where the guard went; but I'm equally sure that this was not the answer Wolfe had in mind when he wrote _New Sun_; he wasn't planning _that_ far ahead. So we can still ask what his original intention was. (The presence of the citizen volunteers suggests that either the guard is quite often absent, or his presence is ineffective.)

Gerry Quinn — 05 May 2014, 14:54 · in reply to Andrew Mason

From: Andrew Mason

I'm sure that _Short Sun_ (specifically _In Green's Jungles_) does indeed tell us where the guard went; but I'm equally sure that this was not the answer Wolfe had in mind when he wrote _New Sun_; he wasn't planning _that_ far ahead. So we can still ask what his original intention was. (The presence of the citizen volunteers suggests that either the guard is quite often absent, or his presence is ineffective.)

Okay, I'll bite - when and where does it tell us? I can't think of anything in _In Green's Jungles_ that references current events on Urth.

There are references in _Return to the Whorl_, and even a visit to the Necropolis. But that must have been later, as Severian already had Triskele.

- Gerry Quinn

antonio at gmail.com — 06 May 2014, 09:33 · in reply to Gerry Quinn

No dia 05/05/2014, às 15:54, "Gerry Quinn" <gerry at bindweed.com> escreveu:

From: Andrew Mason

I'm sure that _Short Sun_ (specifically _In Green's Jungles_) does indeed tell us where the guard went; but I'm equally sure that this was not the answer Wolfe had in mind when he wrote _New Sun_; he wasn't planning _that_ far ahead. So we can still ask what his original intention was. (The presence of the citizen volunteers suggests that either the guard is quite often absent, or his presence is ineffective.)

Okay, I'll bite - when and where does it tell us? I can't think of anything in _In Green's Jungles_ that references current events on Urth.

There are references in _Return to the Whorl_, and even a visit to the Necropolis. But that must have been later, as Severian already had Triskele.

I'm one of those eagerly waiting for a reply.

Andrew Mason — 06 May 2014, 15:06 · follows antonio at gmail.com

David Stockhoff wrote:

After looking at the chapter again . . . my assumption has always been that the guard was paid off.

I suppose that's actually compatible with the _Short Sun_ explanation; if Vodalus had paid the guard to leave his post, he might have treated the arrival of the Rajan and party as a good excuse to do so. (So no actual change of mind needs to be posited, even though Wolfe wasn't actually planning _Short Sun_ when he wrote the original scene.)

Gerry Quinn wrote:

Okay, I'll bite - when and where does it tell us? I can't think of anything in _In Green's Jungles_ that references current events on Urth.

There are references in _Return to the Whorl_, and even a visit to the Necropolis. But that must have been later, as Severian already had Triskele.

IGJ Chapter 21, 'The Red Sun': the Rajan, Fava, Mora, Hide, Rigoglio and some extras travel to Urth, initially to Rigoglio's old house - from there they go to the river, and finally end up at the Bear Tower (escorted by a guard who has left his post), thus setting things up for the Rajan's later trips to the river and to the Citadel in RTTW. Severian does not appear in this episode; we have to wait for RTTW to meet him. Some people, though, when the book first came out, noted the relation of the episode with the first scene of _New Sun_, and hypothesised that the Rajan has just missed Severian, a theory confirmed in the next book when they do meet.

Gerry Quinn — 07 May 2014, 12:34 · in reply to Andrew Mason

From: Andrew Mason

Gerry Quinn wrote:

Okay, I'll bite - when and where does it tell us? I can't think of anything in _In Green's Jungles_ that references current events on Urth.

IGJ Chapter 21, 'The Red Sun'

Ah right, that figures.

- Gerry Quinn

Fred Kiesche — 07 May 2014, 13:40 · in reply to Gerry Quinn

I am struck by a silly music video. Recall the 80's. Soft Cell. Their wonderful duo of "Tainted Love" backed into "Where Did Our Love Go?".

Baby, baby
Where did the Guard go?

...

On Wed, May 7, 2014 at 8:34 AM, Gerry Quinn <gerry at bindweed.com> wrote:

From: Andrew Mason

Gerry Quinn wrote:

> Okay, I'll bite - when and where does it tell us? I can't think of >
anything
in In Green's Jungles that references current events on Urth.

IGJ Chapter 21, 'The Red Sun'

Ah right, that figures.

- Gerry Quinn
