

Polish translation of Long Sun.

The Urth list — 8 messages, 5 voices, 27 Aug 2014

<https://urth.darkrealm.vip/thread/urth/6649>

Exported from an unofficial mirror of a public mailing list. Copyright in each message remains with the person who wrote it. Email addresses are obscured as `user at host`, the form the original archive published. This file was rebuilt from parsed fields rather than retained headers, so it is faithful in content but not byte-exact.

Piotr Szczęsny — 27 Aug 2014, 14:59

Hello people of Urth,

Some time ago I tried to read the Long Sun in polish, but on first pages I saw that the translator, translated name :Patera Silk to Patera Jedwab (Jedwab is Silk in polish) I was outraged! I hate so much when this happens, fortunately it's not that common. But I was surprised that this crime was committed by a guy who did an excellent job translating new sun. My question: what do you think? Can translating Silk's name can be somehow justified (I'm not yet familiar with long sun) ?

Gerry Quinn — 27 Aug 2014, 15:03 · in reply to Piotr Szczęsny

On 27/08/2014 15:59, Piotr Szczęsny wrote:

Hello people of Urth,

Some time ago I tried to read the Long Sun in polish, but on first pages I saw that the translator, translated name :Patera Silk to Patera Jedwab (Jedwab is Silk in polish) I was outraged! I hate so much when this happens, fortunately it's not that common. But I was surprised that this crime was committed by a guy who did an excellent job translating new sun.

My question: what do you think? Can translating Silk's name can be somehow justified (I'm not yet familiar with long sun) ?

I think it can, because in Silk's city, men are named after animal products, women after vegetable products, and androids after minerals. So to preserve that in the translation, he must translate the names. At least it is a very legitimate reason for doing it this way.

- Gerry Quinn

Piotr Szczęsny — 27 Aug 2014, 15:13 · in reply to Gerry Quinn

Thanks Gerry, it makes sense now!

27 sie 2014 17:03 "Gerry Quinn" <gerry at bindweed.com> napisa?(a):

On 27/08/2014 15:59, Piotr Szczęsny wrote:

Hello people of Urth,

Some time ago I tried to read the Long Sun in polish, but on first pages I saw that the translator, translated name :Patera Silk to Patera Jedwab (Jedwab is Silk in polish) I was outraged! I hate so much when this happens, fortunately it's not that common. But I was surprised that this crime was committed by a guy who did an excellent job translating new sun.

My question: what do you think? Can translating Silk's name can be somehow justified (I'm not yet familiar with long sun) ?

I think it can, because in Silk's city, men are named after animal

products, women after vegetable products, and androids after minerals. So to preserve that in the translation, he must translate the names. At least it is a very legitimate reason for doing it this way.

- Gerry Quinn

Greg Kurzawa — 27 Aug 2014, 15:24 · in reply to Piotr Szczęsny

On 8/27/2014 9:59 AM, Piotr Szczęsny wrote:

Hello people of Urth,
Some time ago I tried to read the Long Sun in polish, but on first pages I saw that the translator, translated name :Patera Silk to Patera Jedwab (Jedwab is Silk in polish) I was outraged! I hate so much when this happens, fortunately it's not that common. But I was surprised that this crime was committed by a guy who did an excellent job translating new sun.
My question: what do you think? Can translating Silk's name can be somehow justified (I'm not yet familiar with long sun) ?

It's also possible that the translator communicated directly with Mr. Wolfe, and they decided together to do it that way. I've been contacted once by a translator (also Polish) seeking clarification on intended tone and minor details, and that was just for a short story. With work like Wolfe's, I would imagine (hope) that the translator received input, direction, and clarification from the author himself.

... which might mean that Wolfe's translators possess insight (straight from Wolfe) to which the rest of us don't have access.

Marc Aramini — 27 Aug 2014, 16:18 · in reply to Greg Kurzawa

I don't know what Wolfe's policy is on answering translator's and editor's questions, but he sure won't answer any of mine about his work anymore, and hasn't since like 2003. He doesn't mind hearing what I have to say but he kind of ignores the questions. He used to play little narrative games with me like write his letters on the back of a page from his original draft. The only thing he will do now is say very indirect things like gee I always loved 'lil abner after I told him my "changeling" ideas, for example.

On Wednesday, August 27, 2014, Greg Kurzawa <greg at kurzawa.us> wrote:

On 8/27/2014 9:59 AM, Piotr Szczęsny wrote:

Hello people of Urth,
Some time ago I tried to read the Long Sun in polish, but on first pages I saw that the translator, translated name :Patera Silk to Patera Jedwab (Jedwab is Silk in polish) I was outraged! I hate so much when this happens, fortunately it's not that common. But I was surprised that this crime was committed by a guy who did an excellent job translating new sun.
My question: what do you think? Can translating Silk's name can be somehow justified (I'm not yet familiar with long sun) ?

It's also possible that the translator communicated directly with Mr. Wolfe, and they decided together to do it that way. I've been contacted once by a translator (also Polish) seeking clarification on intended tone and minor details, and that was just for a short story. With work like Wolfe's, I would imagine (hope) that the translator received input, direction, and clarification from the author himself.

... which might mean that Wolfe's translators possess insight (straight from Wolfe) to which the rest of us don't have access.

antonio at gmail.com — 27 Aug 2014, 18:31 · in reply to Gerry Quinn

But notice that the ambiguity of some such names (and Silk is one of them) is part of the story (why have such a naming scheme anyway if not to abuse it), and such things can hardly expect always to be translatable.

A writer like Wolfe is very difficult to translate well.

No dia 27/08/2014, às 16:03, Gerry Quinn <gerry at bindweed.com> escreveu:

On 27/08/2014 15:59, Piotr Szczęsny wrote:

Hello people of Urth,

Some time ago I tried to read the Long Sun in polish, but on first pages I saw that the translator, translated name :Patera Silk to Patera Jedwab (Jedwab is Silk in polish) I was outraged! I hate so much when this happens, fortunately it's not that common. But I was surprised that this crime was committed by a guy who did an excellent job translating new sun.

My question: what do you think? Can translating Silk's name can be somehow justified (I'm not yet familiar with long sun) ?

I think it can, because in Silk's city, men are named after animal products, women after vegetable products, and androids after minerals. So to preserve that in the translation, he must translate the names. At least it is a very legitimate reason for doing it this way.

- Gerry Quinn

Piotr Szczęsny — 27 Aug 2014, 18:46 · in reply to antonio at gmail.com

I've read only Book of the New Sun in Polish, then I started reading in English (In fact Peace was my first novel that I've read in English). But then I re-read some parts in English and boy, the translator added some to the puzzles. Remember the part at the end of the Citadel, when Severian discovers the room with dials? The translator used polish word for dial - "zegar", which is also used in polish for clock, in fact the first thing that pops in your head when you read this word in polish is a clock not a some kind of dial. So for me this place was a room full of clocks...

2014-08-27 20:31 GMT+02:00 <antonio at gmail.com>:

But notice that the ambiguity of some such names (and Silk is one of them) is part of the story (why have such a naming scheme anyway if not to abuse it), and such things can hardly expect always to be translatable.

A writer like Wolfe is very difficult to translate well.

No dia 27/08/2014, às 16:03, Gerry Quinn <gerry at bindweed.com> escreveu:

On 27/08/2014 15:59, Piotr Szczęsny wrote:

Hello people of Urth,

Some time ago I tried to read the Long Sun in polish, but on first pages I saw that the translator, translated name :Patera Silk to Patera Jedwab (Jedwab is Silk in polish) I was outraged! I hate so much when this happens, fortunately it's not that common. But I was surprised that this crime was committed by a guy who did an excellent job translating new sun.

My question: what do you think? Can translating Silk's name can be

somehow justified (I'm not yet familiar with long sun) ?

I think it can, because in Silk's city, men are named after animal products, women after vegetable products, and androids after minerals. So to preserve that in the translation, he must translate the names. At least it is a very legitimate reason for doing it this way.

- Gerry Quinn

Marc Aramini — 27 Aug 2014, 19:41 · in reply to Piotr Szczęsny

The Italian version translates the entire "like glass/grass grow to any eye not of me" doggerel to hide Vodalus' coin completely differently in the first and last books. I haven't looked at that in more than 15 years, though. I think the Spanish translation was pretty good, but I only read through parts of New Sun, and I picked up my Spanish conversationally rather than through any kind of education.

On Wed, Aug 27, 2014 at 11:46 AM, Piotr Szczęsny <neternalz at gmail.com> wrote:

I've read only Book of the New Sun in Polish, then I started reading in English (In fact Peace was my first novel that I've read in English). But then I re-read some parts in English and boy, the translator added some to the puzzles. Remember the part at the end of the Citadel, when Severian discovers the room with dials? The translator used polish word for dial - "zegar", which is also used in polish for clock, in fact the first thing that pops in your head when you read this word in polish is a clock not a some kind of dial. So for me this place was a room full of clocks...