

Clute review - spoilers?

The Whorl list — 3 messages, 3 voices, 30 Jan 2001

<https://urth.darkrealm.vip/thread/whorl/1079>

Exported from an unofficial mirror of a public mailing list. Copyright in each message remains with the person who wrote it. Email addresses are obscured as `user at host`, the form the original archive published. This file was rebuilt from parsed fields rather than retained headers, so it is faithful in content but not byte-exact.

Sheila Herndon — 30 Jan 2001, 13:00

Hi, on SciFi Weekly there is a Review of RttW.
Will someone please read it and let me know if there are any spoilers in it? I've barely started RttW and don't want to be spoiled.

thanks!

sh

Kevin J. Maroney — 30 Jan 2001, 17:20 · follows Sheila Herndon

At 01:00 PM 1/30/01 -0800, sh wrote:

Hi, on SciFi Weekly there is a Review of RttW.
Will someone please read it and let me know if there are any spoilers in it? I've barely started RttW and don't want to be spoiled.

My judgment is that Clute casually reveals the resolution of the primary mystery of the novel, but it is not instantly clear that he is doing so. More correctly, I think that if I had read this review before reading the novel, I would have felt that he had spoiled the ending, but actually all of the pieces are there long before the ending.

If you're planning on reading RTW anyway (and the fact that you are posting to this list, or reading it, or, for the greater outside audience, reading its archives leads me to believe that you do so intend), I would recommend reading the review, but only after the novel; Clute's description of the novel is quite haunting.

Wombat, a.k.a. Kevin Maroney kmaroney at ungames.com
Kitchen Staff Supervisor, New York Review of Science Fiction
<http://www.nyrsf.com>

*This is WHORL, for discussion of Gene Wolfe's Book of the Long Sun.

Alex David Groce — 31 Jan 2001, 00:44 · follows Kevin J. Maroney

Wombat said:

If you're planning on reading RTW anyway (and the fact that you are posting to this list, or reading it, or, for the greater outside audience, reading its archives leads me to believe that you do so intend), I would recommend reading the review, but only after the novel; Clute's description of the novel is quite haunting.

Yes. I didn't like Clute's review of OBW, but this is a fine review (although it might say too much to someone who hasn't finished RttW), with some nice insights. I finished RttW Saturday, and am so pleased with it that, although I'm looking forwards to our discussion here, I am also very happy to give the book a decent period of impressed silence until a quorum have read it.

"And ye shall know the truth, and the truth shall make you free." John 8:32

--

Alex David Groce (agroce+ at cs.cmu.edu)

Ph.D. Student, Carnegie Mellon University - Computer Science Department

8112 Wean Hall (412)-268-3066

<http://www.cs.cmu.edu/~agroce>

*This is WHORL, for discussion of Gene Wolfe's Book of the Long Sun.