

Digest whorl.v012.n100

The Whorl list — 4 messages, 3 voices, 12 Apr 2001

<https://urth.darkrealm.vip/thread/whorl/1345>

Exported from an unofficial mirror of a public mailing list. Copyright in each message remains with the person who wrote it. Email addresses are obscured as `user at host`, the form the original archive published. This file was rebuilt from parsed fields rather than retained headers, so it is faithful in content but not byte-exact.

Timothy Reilly — 12 Apr 2001, 06:30

My two cents worth:

I also found RTTW unsatisfying, but then I'd found IGJ a big let down from OBW too. Without repeating the problems, I refer to Alan Lloyd's excellent post in whorl.v012.n049 and alga's subsequent commentary. IGJ iirc introduced all the astral travel nonsense, and also seemed to involve something of a failure of the imagination concerning Green (where precious little time ultimately ended up being spent by the book). RTTW lacked the lyricism of both OBW and (to a lesser extent) IGJ and for me was too full of the juvenilia of the LS series.

One issue Mr Lloyd raised (I think) which I do want to specifically second is ALL THE TYPOS. These were bad in earlier volumes, but RTTW was ridiculous ("Hounded nodded" etc). What sort of editing is this? It certainly doesn't indicate respect for the readers - or the author. It's not as if Tor couldn't ask one of the members of this list to cast an eagle eye over a draft.

On this point perhaps, one question (to add to the litany). At p 360, "Father" is quoted as saying of Typhon's daughter Scylla: "the daughter who had pledged herself in secret to one of the sea gods of the Short Sun Whorl that would in time become our Red Sun Whorl". What is he talking about? She pledged herself as I understand to a god of the Red Sun Whorl, but it can't be just a simple typo as how does the Short Sun Whorl become in time the (indeed "our") Red Sun Whorl? They are two different places after all (I think!).

Anyway I don't know if this is a typo or what. Next page (p 361) we have "In Oreb she searched this whorl for nearly half a year, finding nothing better ["than" presumably is missing - another typo] one or two landers with their glasses half intact". A bit later same page "He was a little ["man" missing?] and old again".

The only explanation for all three other than them being oversights is that it's Hoof writing.

Finally, I reiterate an earlier request for a reference to or email of Clute's review.

Tim

*This is WHORL, for discussion of Gene Wolfe's Book of the Long Sun.

Kieran Cleary — 12 Apr 2001, 10:49 · follows Timothy Reilly

Tim,

the daughter who had pledged herself in secret to one of the sea gods of the Short Sun Whorl that would in time become our Red Sun Whorl". What is he talking about?

'Short Sun Whorl' is a generic term. The particular SS Whorl mentioned here is the one 'that would in time become our RS Whorl', i.e. Urth. Nothing more than that, I think.

You'll find Clute's review at

<http://www.scifi.com/sfw/issue197/excess.html>

Kieran C.

*This is WHORL, for discussion of Gene Wolfe's Book of the Long Sun.

Kieran Cleary — 12 Apr 2001, 10:49 · follows Kieran Cleary

Tim,

the daughter who had pledged herself in secret to one of the sea gods of the Short Sun Whorl that would in time become our Red Sun Whorl". What is he talking about?

'Short Sun Whorl' is a generic term. The particular SS Whorl mentioned here is the one 'that would in time become our RS Whorl', i.e. Urth. Nothing more than that, I think.

You'll find Clute's review at

<http://www.scifi.com/sfw/issue197/excess.html>

Kieran C.

*This is WHORL, for discussion of Gene Wolfe's Book of the Long Sun.

Dan'l Danehy-Oakes — 12 Apr 2001, 09:21 · follows Kieran Cleary

Timothy R wrote:

IGJ iirc introduced all the astral travel nonsense,

Modulo the idea that it was "nonsense," yes. Mr. Wolfe, who writes "science-fantasy" (more accurately: he writes science fiction that makes some different assumptions about the nature of physical reality than do most SF writers), is entitled to posit astral travel if he chooses; dislike it if you choose, but to call it nonsense wrt Wolfe's universe-of-discourse seems rather petty.

and also seemed to involve something of a failure of the imagination concerning Green (where precious little time ultimately ended up being spent by the book).

I think "precious little" is an exaggeration; between the (relatively few) flashbacks and the astral travel scenes, I'd estimate (after two readings but without counting pages) that between a quarter and a third of the book is spent on Green. As for a "failure of the imagination," well, *disgustibus non deputandum*; I found the scenes on Green some of Wolfe's most vivid ever, and sufficiently horrifying (I'd go as far as "gut wrenching") that I can easily sympathize with the Narr's disinclination to reminisce over the place.

RTTW lacked the lyricism of both OBW and (to a lesser extent)

IGJ and for me was too full of the juvenilia of the LS series.

Juvenilia of the LS series? What on earth are you talking about? LONG is quite possibly the most mature sf series I have ever read.

One issue Mr Lloyd raised (I think) which I do want to specifically second is ALL THE TYPOS.

While I agree that this is offensive I wish to point out that this is nothing particular to RttW; I've noticed that the proofreading of books in general -- with the exception of the academic presses -- has been deteriorating for the last decade or so. I suspect this of being an artifact of overdependency on spelling checkers that won't catch things like "hounded" because they're legitimate words even if they make no sense in context.

"Father" is quoted as saying of Typhon's daughter Scylla: "the daughter who had pledged herself in secret to one of the sea gods of the Short Sun Whorl that would in time become our Red Sun Whorl". What is he talking about? She pledged herself as I understand to a god of the Red Sun Whorl, but it can't be just a simple typo as how does the Short Sun Whorl become in time the (indeed "our") Red Sun Whorl? They are two different places after all (I think!).

Okay...

Scylla is the daughter of Typhon, you've got that. The "sea god" is Great Scylla. GS is a sea god (or goddess) of Urth, which is the _old_ Short Sun Whorl that sent out the Long Sun Whorl (I'm sure you got that much, too).

Now, the new Short Sun Whorls, Green and Blue do not have a red sun. So when the Narr and the twins and all travel astrally to Urth, they refer to it as "the Red Sun Whorl;" thus, though they do not know what its inhabitants call it, it is "their" Red Sun Whorl.

--Dan'l

*This is WHORL, for discussion of Gene Wolfe's Book of the Long Sun.