

The Secret: practical doubts

The Whorl list — 1 messages, 1 voices, 23 Apr 2001

<https://urth.darkrealm.vip/thread/whorl/1393>

Exported from an unofficial mirror of a public mailing list. Copyright in each message remains with the person who wrote it. Email addresses are obscured as `user at host`, the form the original archive published. This file was rebuilt from parsed fields rather than retained headers, so it is faithful in content but not byte-exact.

Nicholas Gevers — 23 Apr 2001, 05:55

William Ansley: I agree with a good deal of your logic below. I've been arguing the strongest possible case for the Secret as an offensive weapon, striving to explain why the Secret would be so "great and terrible" that the inhumis supposedly would kill any human who knew it. I think that, given GW's enormous interest in military matters, the specific aspects of my theory about the Secret are probably what he had in mind in writing TBSS; but he is GW, of course. Ambiguity attends everything he writes. So yes: there are doubts about the Secret's applicability, just as you say. Necessarily so. Still, humans acting upon knowledge of the Secret could do a good deal of damage to the inhumis; the crucial difference between inhumis and mosquitoes is that the former (some at least) are intelligent, and would be very worried at any systematic threat to their offspring.

--Nick Gevers.

--- William Ansley <wansley at warwick.net> wrote: > I really don't see how using astral travel to wipe

out the inhumis at
their breeding pools can work.

1) Can we be absolutely sure that the astral
journeys are to real
places and not just "places on the astral plane"
that resemble real
places where one of the travellers has been before?
Certainly some of
the places resemble real places the we have seen
before (the Red Sun
Whorl) but the nature of "reality" during these
astral visits seems
awfully malleable.

2) Assuming astral travel can have physical effects
in the "real
world," I still don't believe that the inhumis could
be wiped out. We
haven't been able to wipe out mosquitos on earth
even though the same
means of attack should theoretically be effective

and we have just
about the same level of motivation to do so as the
human
inhabitants of Blue have to finish off the inhum. I
think my
mosquito analogy is a good one, since the inhum
seem to produce
large numbers of (at least at first) not very
intelligent offspring
which are left to fend for themselves.

3) Since astral travel requires the presence of an
inhumi to work,
this method cannot be used to wipe out their
breeding pools without
inhumi cooperation, at least to some degree. Perhaps
the inhum
cannot prevent at least a few of their number from
being taken
captive, but they could make it difficult. And
surely inhum are
capable of suicide upon capture. Of course, since
Jahlee was willing
to betray her kind, the argument could be made the
others like her
could be found. On the other hand, one can argue
that Jahlee is a
unique case.

4) Regarding the argument that only the intelligent
inhumi offspring
need to be killed: as long as there are humans on
Green, intelligent
inhumi can arise again very easily, unless all
humans on green are
completely protected from inhum predation. The only
way to
absolutely assure that no more intelligent inhum
will arise is to
kill all of them.

Of course you can say, as you have been, that
Silk|Horn didn't
really think the secret could be used effectively,
but you talk as
if your version of the secret can be so used above.