

Digest whorl.v010.n035

The Whorl list — 3 messages, 3 voices, 16 Oct 1999

<https://urth.darkrealm.vip/thread/whorl/695>

Exported from an unofficial mirror of a public mailing list. Copyright in each message remains with the person who wrote it. Email addresses are obscured as `user at host`, the form the original archive published. This file was rebuilt from parsed fields rather than retained headers, so it is faithful in content but not byte-exact.

Alice Turner — 16 Oct 1999, 12:35

Ah, but as someone actually going through the conversion process right now,
I think formal Catholic position is "sure the gospels were written later, under
difficult circumstances, etc." but that, of course, they overcame this by aid
of the Holy Spirit.

Yes, you and I and Wolfe agree, and Alga (almost certainly) doesn't. My only point was that we have to consider what Wolfe had in mind. [snip]

Well, Ratty, you're wrong, I do agree. My very point was that Horn, exactly like Mathew (the most egregious of the gospeleers, IMO--and I will happily cite how), when he wasn't present at an event, made free to invent, but with the sincerity of love and the drive of evangelism, which is, I suppose, what Alex means by the Holy Spirit. That, however, doesn't quite make it fact.

Alex, I am interested in what "going through the conversion process" means. If you think that is off-topic, would you please email me about it? TIA. (The fact that I am a heathen doesn't make me theologically rude, except to the Rat, who likes it.)

-alga

*This is WHORL, for discussion of Gene Wolfe's Book of the Long Sun.

Alex David Groce — 17 Oct 1999, 10:51 · follows Alice Turner

Well, Ratty, you're wrong, I do agree. My very point was that Horn, exactly like Mathew (the most egregious of the gospeleers, IMO--and I will happily cite how), when he wasn't present at an event, made free to invent, but with the sincerity of love and the drive of evangelism, which is, I suppose, what Alex means by the Holy Spirit. That, however, doesn't quite make it fact.

Ah, but Rat & I would attribute to the Holy Spirit the result that Matthew never actually _gets it wrong_--contradictions are only apparent, resulting from reading things in the wrong sense. How exactly this applies to things like "who WAS the high priest at time X?" and such I forget at the moment and is probably out of the list's scope, anyway.

Which is highly relevant to OBW/The Book of Silk if we (as I would assume we all do) think Horn & Nettle writing are meant to be analogous to writing a Gospel. In other words, sure Horn wanted to get it right out of "love and the drive of evangelism"--but if you take the model Wolfe's probably using, he really DID get it right. Which, as far as I know, just the desire doesn't guarantee. That's where we seem to differ. Given Wolfe's penchant for having "secular" things act suspiciously as if at the behest of the Outsider, this strongly suggests Horn had help (from Mainframe or something) to guarantee he got it right. On the other hand, since in Long Sun the Outsider does directly Enlighten Silk it can't be ruled out that Horn really does have direct

supernatural aid in writing the Book of Silk.

"And ye shall know the truth, and the truth shall make you free." John 8:32

Alex David Groce (agroce+ at cs.cmu.edu)

Ph.D. Student, Carnegie Mellon University - Computer Science Department

8112 Wean Hall (412)-268-3066

<http://www.cs.cmu.edu/~agroce>

*This is WHORL, for discussion of Gene Wolfe's Book of the Long Sun.

Michael Straight — 18 Oct 1999, 08:23 · follows Alex David Groce

On Sun, 17 Oct 1999, Alex David Groce wrote:

Which is highly relevant to OBW/The Book of Silk if we (as I would assume we all do) think Horn & Nettle writing are meant to be analogous to writing a Gospel. In other words, sure Horn wanted to get it right out of "love and the drive of evangelism"--but if you take the model Wolfe's probably using, he really DID get it right. Which, as far as I know, just the desire doesn't guarantee. That's where we seem to differ. Given Wolfe's penchant for having "secular" things act suspiciously as if at the behest of the Outsider, this strongly suggests Horn had help (from Mainframe or something) to guarantee he got it right. On the other hand, since in Long Sun the Outsider does directly Enlighten Silk it can't be ruled out that Horn really does have direct supernatural aid in writing the Book of Silk.

On the other hand, I think it's still possible for a skeptic to read the Long Sun books and side with Dr. Crane on the question of Silk's enlightenment. For that reason, I think it strengthens the books to leave open the question of whether Horn is embellishing or not. It makes for a stronger parallel with the Gospels. As this list illustrates it's possible for smart people to disagree about whether Matthew fudged any of the details or not.

I would prefer to assess the Book of Silk based on what we learn of the character of Horn and Nettle than to learn that Mainframe was the de facto omniscient narrator. How much fun is a Wolfe story where you know you can trust the narrator?

-Rostrum

*This is WHORL, for discussion of Gene Wolfe's Book of the Long Sun.