

Clute

The Whorl list — 3 messages, 3 voices, 05 Nov 1999

<https://urth.darkrealm.vip/thread/whorl/712>

Exported from an unofficial mirror of a public mailing list. Copyright in each message remains with the person who wrote it. Email addresses are obscured as `user at host`, the form the original archive published. This file was rebuilt from parsed fields rather than retained headers, so it is faithful in content but not byte-exact.

Nicholas Gevers — 05 Nov 1999, 23:19

I think that criticisms of John Clute's style ignore the fact that he is (unlike most critics) an original prose stylist. His innovative, if sometimes contorted, writing has vastly enriched SF criticism, not only because of his cogent insights, but because he has unlocked a critical vocabulary equal to the complete expression of those insights. He has his clumsy and inattentive moments, but I'd rather have him review OBW than leave the task to pedestrian hacks like the authors of certain other published reviews cited on amazon.

=====

Kevin J. Maroney — 06 Nov 1999, 13:01 · follows Nicholas Gevers

At 11:19 PM 11/5/99 -0800, Nick Gevers wrote:
His innovative, if sometimes contorted,
writing has vastly enriched SF criticism, not only
because of his cogent insights, but because he has
unlocked a critical vocabulary equal to the complete
expression of those insights.

He has, but I think that alga was correct in pointing out that his convolutions sometimes serve the work poorly. The diction and content which are appropriate when one is writing a review for a general audience who might or might not have read the work are not the same as those appropriate for an informed audience, and I think that alga properly pegged Clute as having used the latter in a work targetted at the former, to his detriment.

Wombat, a.k.a. Kevin Maroney kmaroney at crossover.com Kitchen Staff Supervisor, New York Review of Science Fiction <http://ebbs.english.vt.edu/olp/nyrsf/nyrsf.html>

*This is WHORL, for discussion of Gene Wolfe's Book of the Long Sun.

Kieran Cleary — 07 Nov 1999, 12:03 · follows Kevin J. Maroney

William Ansley wrote:
Interesting is hardly the word for Clute's speculation, quoted above. It don't make no sense! I think it is pretty clear that Horn has visited and returned from The Whorl already by the time he has written OBW from the hints contained within. If that is so, then shouldn't the title of the final book be _Re-return to the Whorl_?<<

What Clute says in his review is

because the last volume seems destined to take place after the text of On
Blue's Waters has been fully inscribed<<

He's basically pointing out that Horn is writing "on the run", as it were, and so we will continue
to find out what happens to Horn as he makes his way back to New Viron from Gaon.

Kieran C.

North West Labs
Stephen St. Court
Sligo
Republic of Ireland

Tel. +353 71 69441
Fax. +353 71 69451
email: kieranwn at tinet.ie

*This is WHORL, for discussion of Gene Wolfe's Book of the Long Sun.